



From: Broadcasting Board of Governors  
Date: January 13, 2012  
Subject: **Minutes of the BBG Meeting of January 13, 2012**

The Broadcasting Board of Governors (BBG) met today in Washington, D.C. The meeting was open and streamed on the BBG website.

The meeting was attended by the following Board members:

Chairman Walter Isaacson  
Governor Victor Ashe  
Governor Susan McCue  
Governor Michael Meehan (by telephone)  
Governor Dennis Mulhaupt  
Governor Dana Perino (by telephone)  
Governor S. Enders Wimbush  
Acting Under Secretary for Public Diplomacy & Public Affairs Ann Stock

Governor Michael Lynton was not in attendance at the meeting.

Other persons in attendance are listed at the end of these minutes.

The agenda of the meeting is set forth in Attachment 1.

Chairman Isaacson called the meeting to order and noted that the meeting was being held in compliance with the Government in the Sunshine Act and streamed live over the Internet at the BBG website. He also noted that Governors Meehan and Perino were participating by telephone.

The Board voted to approve the minutes of the November 18, 2011 meeting.

Chairman Isaacson stated that the Board had adopted the proposed 2012 BBG meeting schedule by notation vote in December 2011. Governor Ashe moved to ratify the meeting schedule. Governor McCue seconded. The meeting schedule was ratified by the Board.

The Board voted to approve the appointment of Governor McCue as member of the Governance Committee.

The Chairman noted that the Board met the previous day for an off-site Governors' Briefing to further discuss the implementation of BBG Strategic Plan 2012-2016 after an intensive year-long strategic review. He said that the Board was prepared to make a proposal to strengthen United States international broadcasting by freeing up resources that were locked up in inefficient and

## Minutes of January 13, 2012 Meeting

duplicative administrative structures and to reinvest those resources in its programming. He stated that, coincidentally, the President recently has announced a proposal to reform, reorganize, and consolidate federal government agencies involved in trade and commerce.

The Chairman described the Board's proposal in two parts – one directed toward the grantees and one directed toward the Agency.

With respect to the BBG-sponsored grantees, the Board announced its intention to issue the three grants which BBG currently makes separately to Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty (RFE/RL), Radio Free Asia (RFA) and Middle East Broadcasting Networks (MBN) to a single, consolidated Grantee. The Board instructed the International Broadcasting Bureau (IBB) Director, working with Governor Mulhaupt, to develop a plan for structuring, documenting, and implementing a grantee consolidation transaction, and that such a plan and a proposed budget for implementation would be presented to the Board for consideration at its March Board meeting or report back to the Board on any delays. In preparing the requested plan, the Board authorized the IBB Director to work with MBN President Brian Conniff, who will act as project leader for the consolidation.

Concurrently, the Board proposed an initiative to develop and pursue legislation for restructuring U.S. international broadcasting to be called, the International Broadcasting Innovation Act of 2012 (IBIA). The Board directed the IBB Director to work with IBB staff and outside experts, and with Governor McCue, in order to develop a draft IBIA for the Board's further consideration. The draft legislation should have the following attributes: An organization reflecting the optimal mix of federal and non-federal assets; a creation of a Chief Executive Officer of United States International Broadcasting (the "CEO"), reporting to the Board of Governors, empowered to provide day-to-day executive leadership for United States international broadcasting and should have management authority over the federal and non-federal elements of United States international broadcasting, subject to Board oversight. The IBB Director will consult with Governors Ashe and Lynton in developing a model to defining the appropriate roles for the Board and CEO. In addition, the legislation should eliminate the position of the IBB Director as a Presidentially-appointed and Senate-confirmed appointment and replace it with an appropriate official who would be selected by, and report to, the CEO, and repeal the domestic dissemination ban in the Smith-Mundt Act. In addition, the legislation would rename the BBG to reflect the planned unified structure for United States international broadcasting.

At the Chairman's invitation, Governor Mulhaupt commented that the attribute suggesting an elimination of the IBB Director position should not be misconstrued as a reflection of IBB Director Dick Lobo's performance. He said that, in his view and the view of the Board, Mr. Lobo and his staff have done a tremendous job. The Chairman agreed and commended Mr. Lobo, Jeffrey Trimble, Bruce Sherman, Maryjean Buhler, Paul Kollmer-Dorsey, and others for their service and loyalty in following a very clear, strategic direction of the Board and in helping the Board to develop the proposal. Governor McCue remarked that this proposal presents an exciting, historical time for U.S. international broadcasting, and that the drafting of legislation will be done in a partnership and team effort going forward. Governor Ashe expressed his support for the proposal and noted that, in his view, efforts should be made to achieve savings,

## Minutes of January 13, 2012 Meeting

regardless of the amount, and that it makes sense to consolidate in an effort to improve the quality of service and delivery of service to places where the governments censor or deny access to accurate and objective information. Governor Ashe said consolidation, if done properly, is a good step forward for the Agency in light of the new era, especially in communications and technology. Governor Ashe also said if the consolidation is not done properly, it would cause him to change his position and strongly oppose it. The devil is in the details. Governor Ashe said he reserved the right to change his views if the implementation is not well executed. Acting Under Secretary Ann Stock commented that the Board had a very constructive, long, thoughtful, deliberative process and that the off-site briefing helped the Board come up with a plan to move forward.

The Board then voted to restructure of United States international broadcasting, including consolidating the three BBG-sponsored grantees and seeking legislation that would include establishing a Chief Executive Officer to manage the enterprise.

Chairman Isaacson then read a resolution condemning purposeful interference with broadcast transmissions to Iran and calling on delegates to the upcoming World Radio-communications Conference in Geneva and the satellite industry to repudiate such illegal behavior. Upon the Board's adoption of the resolution, the Chairman thanked Acting Under Secretary Stock and others at the U.S. Department of State who consulted with the BBG in the matter.

The Board voted to adopt the resolution honoring the Voice of America's (VOA) 70<sup>th</sup> anniversary. Governor Ashe asked that VOA Director David Ensor outline plans to observe and celebrate VOA's 70<sup>th</sup> anniversary in 2012 as soon as such information is available.

There followed a discussion by telephone with Governor Meehan who initially wanted to vote "no" on the Board's proposal to restructure U.S. international broadcasting because he did not know whether all five networks were included in the restructuring. After an explanation by the Chairman that the proposal actually includes seeking legislation to restructure all U.S. international broadcasting, which would include all networks, and that certain Board members have been designated to assist in the implementation of the strategy, Governor Meehan expressed his support for the proposal and affirmed his view that all networks should be streamlined.

The Board voted to adopt the resolution observing the 70<sup>th</sup> anniversary of Mandarin and Cantonese services of the Voice of America.

Governor Ashe summarized his visits to VOA language services in December 2011 to recognize the anniversaries of Chinese Branch, Armenian, Bosnian, Macedonian, Georgian, Portuguese to Africa, Central Africa, Afaan Oromo, and Tigrigna Services.

Governor Meehan updated the Board on the Internet censorship circumvention activities. The Board then voted to reprogram \$3 million in FY 2011/2012 funds to RFA. Chairman Isaacson noted that the Board requests that the IBB Director be consulted on these efforts.

## Minutes of January 13, 2012 Meeting

Governor Ashe briefly reported on his visit to the Greenville transmitting station on December 7 and emphasized the significance of this shortwave facility.

Chief Financial Officer (CFO) Maryjean Buhler gave a fiscal report. She said that the BBG received \$744 million for FY 2012, and that a program plan, which includes the Board's decision to reprogram Internet censorship circumvention funds, will be sent to the Congress by January 23, 2012. Meanwhile, the CFO office had been working rigorously on the FY 2013 budget request.

At IBB Director Lobo's invitation, Andre Mendes, IBB Director of the Office of Technology, Services, and Innovation (TSI), provided updates on the FM installations in Tripoli, Libya and Lashkar Gah, Afghanistan. He noted two types of interference with broadcast transmissions to Iran on Arabsat and Eutelsat satellites and cited new evidence that jamming signals are now emanating from Syria. The Content Management System was scheduled to be completed by the end of September. The renaming of the Greenville transmitting station to Edward R. Murrow was in progress. In conclusion, Mr. Mendes distributed copies of TSI's 2011 annual performance report that highlights its progress over the past year.

IBB Director Lobo reported that a study was under way to review independent contractor issues and that a full report should be available at the May Board meeting. Governor Ashe commended Mr. Lobo for his efforts. Mr. Lobo added that this was one of the many sessions planned for contractors.

VOA Director David Ensor announced the inauguration of Studio 52 with state-of-the-art capabilities and played a short video clip previewing the new studio. Deewa Radio was now also available on direct-to-home satellite television as a simulcast of the daily one-hour program to the Federally Administered Tribal Area where radio is popular and television is making strong inroads. At the Chairman's invitation, Mr. Ensor described the expansion of VOA Persian News Network (PNN) from four to six hours of programming. Governor Wimbush noted that improving PNN was the Board's priority. Governor Ashe commended VOA management for making improvements under difficult circumstances.

The Chairman noted the absence of Office of Cuba Broadcasting (OCB) Director Carlos Garcia-Perez but noted that Mr. Garcia-Perez had briefed the Board earlier in the day. In Mr. Garcia-Perez's absence, IBB Director Lobo provided OCB programming highlights. Governor Wimbush noted the impact of the Internet and social media in Cuba.

RFE/RL President Steve Korn reported on the passing of Vaclav Havel who facilitated RFE/RL's move to Prague in 1994 and worked closely with RFE/RL and its Czechoslovak Service.

RFA President Libby Liu highlighted the coverage of the death of North Korean leader Kim Jong, II. She thanked the Board for the reprogramming of Internet censorship circumvention funds to RFA and cited various Internet censorship activities. There followed a short video clip highlighting key reporting by RFA in 2011.

## Minutes of January 13, 2012 Meeting

MBN President Conniff played a short video summarizing Alhurra-Iraq's reporting in the past seven years.

There being no other business, the Chairman adjourned the meeting.

The Broadcasting Board of Governors agreed to the following decision elements (all decisions were adopted by a unanimous vote unless otherwise indicated):

1. Adoption of November 18, 2011 Minutes. Governor Wimbush made a motion for the adoption of the minutes of the November 18, 2011 meeting set forth in Attachment 2. Governor Ashe seconded. The minutes were unanimously adopted by the Board.
2. Governance Committee Membership. Governor Mulhaupt moved to appoint Governor Susan McCue as member of the Governance Committee. Governor Wimbush seconded. The Board unanimously adopted the appointment of Governor McCue on the Governance Committee.
3. Implementation of BBG Strategic Plan 2012-2016. The Board decided to take a number of steps to restructure United States international broadcasting in accordance with the Board's recently adopted strategy.

In the strategy adopted by the Board in October 2011 (entitled "Impact through Innovation and Integration: BBG Strategic Plan 2012-2016"), the Board noted that:

"BBG is a complex amalgam of broadcast entities created by Congress at different points the time over the last 70 years in response to specific foreign policy challenges. It encompasses multiple media properties, some Federal and some non-Federal, with different legal and administrative frameworks . . . all in organizational silos with little cross-cutting coordination.

The current structure complicates managing resources for highest impact as well as the integration and projection of core talents and capabilities. It obstructs efforts to transform the agency's assets into an integrated network that can take advantage of the wide-ranging, highly professional newsgathering activities done by each BBG entity...Integration must therefore accompany innovation as an operational imperative."

The Board agreed to the following elements in order to move forward the restructuring of United States international broadcasting in accordance with the Strategic Plan:

a. Grantee Consolidation

As a result of its year-long strategic review of international broadcasting, the Board agreed to explore the feasibility of consolidating the three grantee organizations into a single corporate structure sharing a unified administrative and legal framework, while retaining their journalistic missions. The Board looked at

## Minutes of January 13, 2012 Meeting

the short- and long-term financial ramifications and the other benefits and costs of consolidation.

In this connection, the Board considered the November 2011 report from its management consultant Deloitte on the feasibility of consolidating the grantees. The Deloitte report found no overlap among the Grantees' broadcasting activities and assumes that no cuts will be made in such activities. The study found, however, that consolidation would lead to substantial savings by eliminating duplicative management and administrative functions. Deloitte projected substantial savings for the BBG during the five (5) years following the consolidation of the grantees. Those funds may be used to enhance United States international broadcasting. (Deloitte estimates one-time costs for implementing consolidation – including severance payments – from \$7 - \$11 million.)

In addition, the Board considered the report of the law firm of Baker & McKenzie on the legal feasibility of merging the BBG-sponsored Grantees. The report concluded that the Board has legal authority under the International Broadcasting Act of 1994 (as amended) to make the three (3) grants that are currently provided to RFE/RL, RFA and MBN to a single consolidated grantee, subject to appropriate Congressional notification and approval.

The Board announces its intention to issue the three grants which BBG currently makes separately to Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty (RFE/RL), Radio Free Asia (RFA) and Middle East Broadcasting Networks (MBN) to a single, consolidated Grantee (when created) subject to Administration approval, Congressional consultation and guidance, and other due diligence and the implementation of a consolidation transaction plan approved by the Board.

The Board instructs the IBB Director, working with Governor Mulhaupt, to develop a plan for structuring, documenting, and implementing a grantee consolidation transaction, including the conduct of adequate due diligence and secure the services of legal and other experts who may be required to assist in the transaction. The IBB Director is requested to provide such a plan, and a proposed budget for its implementation, to the Board for its consideration at the March 2012 Board meeting.

The IBB Director is authorized and encouraged to work in close cooperation with the Grantees. The Board has authorized the IBB Director to work with Brian Conniff, President of MBN, who will act as project leader for the consolidation, in preparing the requested plan. The Board directs and encourages all elements of USIB to cooperate fully with the IBB Director in facilitating the timely and accurate completion of the requested plan and budget.

## Minutes of January 13, 2012 Meeting

The Board also directs the IBB Director, as soon as practicable, to prepare and transmit any Congressional notification that may be required to implement the Board's intentions as stated in this decision.

b. International Broadcasting Innovation Act of 2012

As a second and simultaneous effort to streamline United States international broadcasting in accordance with the broader vision set forth in the Board's strategic plan, the Board announces its intention to pursue legislation to be called the International Broadcasting Innovation Act of 2012 (the "IBIA").

The Board directs the IBB Director to work with IBB staff and outside experts, and with Governor McCue, in order to develop for the Board's further consideration a draft IBIA with the following attributes:

- i. The organization of United States international broadcasting shall reflect the optimal mix of federal and non-federal assets required to best achieve the successful and efficient implementation of the Board's Strategic Plan.
  - ii. The position of Chief Executive Officer of United States International Broadcasting (the "CEO"), reporting to the Board of Governors, shall be created. The CEO will be empowered to provide day-to-day executive leadership for United States international broadcasting and should have management authority over the federal and non-federal elements of United States international broadcasting, subject to Board oversight. The IBB Director is instructed to consult with Governors Ashe and Lynton in developing a model to define the appropriate roles for the Board and CEO.
  - iii. The Board recommends that the position of the IBB Director as a Presidentially-appointed and Senate-confirmed appointment should be eliminated and replaced by an appropriate official who would be selected by, and report to, the CEO.
  - iv. The domestic dissemination ban in the Smith-Mundt Act shall be repealed.
  - v. The organization shall be renamed to reflect the planned unified structure for United States international broadcasting.
4. Resolution on Interference with BBG Broadcasts. Chairman Isaacson made a motion for the adoption of the resolution as set forth in Attachment 3 condemning the purposeful interference of satellite communications and calling upon assembled delegates at the World Radiocommunication Conference to repudiate this illegal behavior. Governor Mulhaupt seconded. The resolution was unanimously adopted by the Board.

## Minutes of January 13, 2012 Meeting

5. Resolution Honoring VOA's 70<sup>th</sup> Anniversary. Governor Ashe moved to adopt the resolutions as set forth in Attachments 4 and 5. Chairman Isaacson seconded. Both resolutions were unanimously adopted by the Board.
  - a. A resolution honoring the Voice of America's 70<sup>th</sup> anniversary.
  - b. A resolution observing the 70<sup>th</sup> anniversary of Mandarin and Cantonese services of the Voice of America.
  
6. Repurposing Internet Censorship Circumvention Funds. Governor Meehan made a motion to reprogram \$3M in FY2011/2012 funds from Technology, Services and Innovation (TSI) to Radio Free Asia (RFA) in order to expand unrestricted access to information on the Internet for the benefit of all elements of U.S. international broadcasting. Governor Wimbush seconded, and the motion was adopted unanimously by the Board.

RFA is required to consult with the IBB Director in developing projects to be financed with the reprogrammed funds and not to spend such funds in a manner that is inconsistent with the IBB Director's guidance.

The Board directed the staff to take the necessary actions to implement this decision, including preparing and executing the appropriate Congressional notifications and modifying the RFA grant agreement to include the expanded operations and a requirement to consult with the IBB Director.

### Other Attendees:

The following persons were also present during all or part of the meeting: International Broadcasting Bureau (IBB) Director Richard Lobo, Executive Director Jeffrey Trimble, Chief of Staff Marie Lennon, Deputy General Counsel and Board Secretary Paul Kollmer-Dorsey, Chief Financial Officer Maryjean Buhler, Director of the Office of Strategic Planning & Performance Measurement Bruce Sherman, Special Projects Officer Oanh Tran, Congressional Coordinator Susan Andross, Director of Public Affairs Letitia King, Jay Tolson on IPA from RFE/RL, and Board Operations and Policy Adviser Ashley Pyle; David Ensor, Director of the Voice of America (VOA); Steven Korn, President of Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty (RFE/RL); Libby Liu, President of Radio Free Asia (RFA); Brian Conniff, President of the Middle East Broadcasting Networks (MBN); Steve Redisch, VOA Executive Editor; Barbara Brady, VOA Chief of Staff; Mark Prah, VOA Associate Director for Operations; Rebecca McMenemy, VOA Acting Associate Director for Language Programming; Diane Butts, VOA Creative Director; Andre Mendes, IBB Director of the Office of Technology, Services, and Innovation; Kelu Chao, IBB Director of the Office of Performance Review; Gary Thatcher, IBB Director of the Office of Marketing and External Liaison; Bernadette Burns, RFA General Counsel; Anne Noble, MBN General Counsel; William Clancy, MBN Chief Financial Officer; Lynne Weil, Senior Advisor to the Under Secretary for Public Diplomacy & Public Affairs; and Ann Noonan, Executive Director of Committee for U.S. International Broadcasting.

## Minutes of January 13, 2012 Meeting

Approved:

---

Michael Lynton  
Presiding Governor

Witnessed:

---

Paul Kollmer-Dorsey  
Secretary

Attachments:

1. Agenda for January 13, 2012 Meeting
2. Minutes of November 18, 2011 Meeting
3. Resolution on Interference with BBG Broadcasts
4. Resolution Honoring the Voice of America's 70<sup>th</sup> Anniversary
5. Resolution Observing the 70<sup>th</sup> Anniversary of Mandarin and Cantonese Services of the Voice of America

# Minutes of January 13, 2012 Meeting

ATTACHMENT 1

## BROADCASTING BOARD OF GOVERNORS January 2012 Meeting Agenda

**Friday, January 13**

---

**2 - 3:00 Broadcasting Board of Governors' Meeting (BBG-IBB Conference Room)**

### **I. Open Session**

Chairman's Remarks

- A. Adoption of Minutes of November 18, 2011 Meeting
- B. 2012 BBG Meeting Schedule/Committee Assignments
- C. Decisions Regarding Implementation of BBG Strategic Plan 2012-2016
- D. Resolution on Interference with BBG Broadcasts
- E. Resolution Honoring VOA's 70<sup>th</sup> Anniversary
- F. Recognition of Language Services' Anniversaries  
(Governor Ashe)
- G. Fiscal Report  
(Maryjean Buhler)
  - Repurposing Internet Censorship Circumvention Funds
- H. IBB Director's Report  
(Dick Lobo)
- I. Programming Initiatives/Program Development
  - OCB Director's Report  
(Carlos Garcia-Perez)
  - VOA Director's Report  
(David Ensor)
  - RFE/RL President's Report  
(Steve Korn)
  - RFA President's Report  
(Libby Liu)
  - MBN President's Report  
(Brian Conniff)
- J. Other Items for Consideration at Next Board Meeting

## Minutes of January 13, 2012 Meeting

ATTACHMENT 2

From: Broadcasting Board of Governors  
Date: October 13, 2011  
Subject: **Minutes of the BBG Meeting of November 18, 2011**

The Broadcasting Board of Governors (BBG) met today in Washington, D.C. The meeting was open and streamed on the BBG website.

The meeting was attended by the following Board members:

Chairman Walter Isaacson  
Governor Victor Ashe  
Governor Susan McCue  
Governor Michael Meehan  
Governor Dennis Mulhaupt  
Acting Under Secretary of State for Public Diplomacy & Public Affairs Ann Stock

Governors Michael Lynton, Dana Perino, Enders Wimbush were not in attendance at the meeting.

Other persons in attendance are listed at the end of these minutes.

The agenda of the meeting is set forth in Attachment 1.

Chairman Isaacson called the meeting to order and noted that the meeting was being held in compliance with the Government in the Sunshine Act.

The Chairman noted that the BBG's audience reach was announced this week and that BBG-sponsored international broadcasters reached an estimated 187 million people weekly in 2011, an increase of 22 million from last year's figure. At the Chairman's invitation, Bruce Sherman, Director of the Office of Strategic Planning & Performance Measurement, briefly described the BBG's significant audience increases in a number of strategically important countries such as Egypt, Afghanistan, and Indonesia. He also noted BBG's strong and sustained performance in Nigeria, Burma, and others.

Chairman Isaacson noted awards that were recently given to U.S. international broadcasters. Middle East Broadcasting Networks (MBN) President Brian Conniff noted that Alhurra won the People's Choice Award for "Best Coverage of Democracy Uprisings" at the recent Association for International Broadcasting's (AIB) global media excellence awards in London.

## Minutes of January 13, 2012 Meeting

At the Chairman's invitation, Voice of America (VOA) Director David Ensor briefly described a recent harassment of a stringer in Angola. Mr. Ensor also described the difficulties in securing visas from the Chinese government for VOA journalists to continue its coverage from China. VOA will continue to enlist the support and cooperation of the U.S. Department of State to help resolve this problem. Governor Ashe made a motion for the adoption of a resolution urging prompt resolution of the Chinese visa issue. Following the Chairman's second, the Board unanimously adopted the resolution.

Chairman Isaacson noted that the President recently nominated Tara Sonenshine to become Under Secretary of State for Public Diplomacy and that, following her confirmation, she will become a member of the Board of Governors. The Chairman thanked Ann Stock for her service on the Board representing the Secretary of State.

The Board then voted to approve the October 13, 2011 meeting minutes.

Chief Financial Officer Maryjean Buhler reported that the Agency is currently operating on a continuing resolution (CR) which will expire by midnight and that another CR is anticipated to be put in place through December 16, 2011. With respect to FY 2013, Ms. Buhler stated that the Office of Management and Budget (OMB) typically schedules passback after Thanksgiving. She plans to keep the Board apprised as much as possible about the passback given a need to respond to OMB in a very short time frame.

Bruce Sherman, Director of the Office of Strategic Planning & Performance Measurement, updated the Board on the new strategic plan roll-out including a bbgstrategy.com website. He said that he recently gave briefings on the new strategic plan to senior management of Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty (RFE/RL), employees of the Office of Cuba Broadcasting (OCB), Agency's federal unions, the Public Diplomacy Council in Washington, and others on the Capitol Hill.

Referring to a report by Deloitte on grantee merger assessment, Governor Ashe suggested that the Board might want to consider posting the Deloitte report and perhaps the legal feasibility report by Baker and McKenzie on the BBG website. Chairman Isaacson noted that the Deloitte report has been given to the Board for its consideration which the Board will discuss in detail at its January 2012 meeting, and that the Board has not taken any action based on the report. There followed a brief discussion of the Board's desire to release the Deloitte report to the general public. Executive Director Jeff Trimble cautioned the Board that the report contains FY 2013 budget information which is pre-decisional and strictly embargoed until the President's budget is released to Congress. Acting General Counsel Paul Kollmer-Dorsey noted for the Board's consideration that posting the Baker & McKenzie report on the BBG website would waive attorney-client privilege with respect to the report. Based on comments and input from other Board members and staff, the Chairman asked staff to determine whether the Deloitte and Baker & McKenzie reports should be posted and, if not, to let the Board know the reasons for the staff recommendation. He also noted that the Deloitte report would have to be edited to redact pre-decisional FY 2013 budget information before it could be posted on the BBG website.

## Minutes of January 13, 2012 Meeting

Ms. Buhler further reported on the Agency's recent submission to Congress the Performance and Accountability Report (PAR). She highlighted the BBG's achievements and performances during FY 2011 as reported in the PAR, including unqualified ("clean") opinion financial statements, significant increases in audience data, and among other things. She expressed her gratitude to the networks for their input and the CFO staff for their work on the PAR.

At IBB Director Dick Lobo's invitation, Andre Mendes, IBB Director of the Office of Technology, Services, and Innovation (TSI), provided brief updates on the FM installations in Benghazi and Tripoli, Libya, a new radio transmitter in South Korea, projects to improve and advance the technology infrastructure, and a possible FM transmitter in South Sudan within the U.S. embassy's compound. Governor Meehan thanked Mr. Lobo and TSI for their assistance with the commencement of the Global Internet Freedom Committee. He also thanked TSI and the U.S. Department of State for their coordination and cooperation in the project for a transmitter in South Sudan and emphasized the importance of this project. Ann Stock, Acting Under Secretary of State for Public Diplomacy & Public Affairs, commented that the State Department is working closely to move toward that goal for South Sudan.

For the IBB Director's report, Mr. Lobo stated that the Agency has received thus far 38 applications for the early retirement buyout, and that the application deadline had been extended. Mr. Lobo also noted that the Agency has begun a review on the use of contractors. He highlighted steps the Agency has taken to address contractor concerns, such as offering flu shots to contractors. The Agency is now conducting a survey of current contractor usage and plans to collect additional information on workplace issues. Mr. Lobo also noted that IBB plans to make training available to BBG-sponsored grantees. The Agency will also collocate MBN and VOA personnel in shared facilities in Cairo, New York and London. Governor Ashe thanked Mr. Lobo for making progress to address the issues/concerns of contractors and suggested that IBB explore a way to honor the contractors, if possible.

Governor Ashe announced that he plans to visit the IBB transmitting station in Greenville, NC, on December 7. He reported on recent personal overseas trips which he was able to meet with a VOA stringer in Cape Verde, and with RFE/RL and VOA journalists at RFE/RL's office in Kosovo.

RFE/RL President Steve Korn mentioned an award ceremony on November 8, 2011 to recognize five RFE/RL employees for their "Story of the Year" that was attended by Governor Mulhaupt, Mr. Trimble and Mr. Sherman in conjunction to their attendance of the annual Conference of International Broadcasters' Audience Research. He played short clips of three (Azerbaijani, Georgian, and Kyrgyz Services) of the five award winners and a short clip of Farshid Manafi, host of Radio Farda's popular satire show "Pasfarda," who was named "International Radio Personality of the Year" by the AIB on November 9, 2011. Governor Ashe noted that the RFE/RL Board of Directors recently voted to give RFE/RL Chair Dennis Mulhaupt assistance by electing Susan McCue as Vice-Chair and suggested that the Board hold a meeting in Prague in 2012.

## Minutes of January 13, 2012 Meeting

OCB Director Carlos Garcia-Perez reported on the progress to provide free flow of information to the people of Cuba on various platforms including email, text messaging, radio and television. He thanked IBB and TSI for their support and then played a short video clip of OCB's reporting on various platforms. In response to Governor Ashe's question regarding a possible Board meeting in Miami, Florida in April 2012, Mr. Garcia-Perez replied that it presents no problem for OCB.

VOA Director David Ensor gave a brief report on his recent trip to Pakistan and India. As a result of the trip to Pakistan, VOA will work to come up with innovative programs to reach younger audience in that country. In India, VOA delivered a letter to the Asia-Pacific Broadcasting Union (ABU) at its meeting in New Delhi, highlighting interference to satellite television signals by the government of Iran. Mr. Ensor played a short video clip of VOA Persian News Network's *Parazit* show of its exclusive interview with Secretary of State Hillary Clinton regarding Iran.

Governor Ashe suggested posting the letter to ABU on the BBG's website. Governor Ashe also reminded the Board that VOA will celebrate its 70th anniversary in February 2012.

Radio Free Asia (RFA) President Libby Liu presented a video clip of RFA's latest video project featuring a documentary on human trafficking and modern slavery. In response to Governor McCue's question, Ms. Liu explained how the documentary would be distributed once the project is completed.

Governor Ashe asked how the upcoming historic visit by Secretary of State Clinton to Myanmar, and the easing of media restrictions there will impact RFA. Ms. Liu said that they present a remarkable breakthrough and give very positive signs for RFA, including access to RFA.org website and its shortwave broadcasts. In closing, Governor Meehan congratulated RFA on its 15<sup>th</sup> anniversary.

MBN President Brian Conniff announced that Alhurra won the People's Choice Award in the AIB's 2011 Media Excellence Awards for its coverage of the Egyptian Revolution and played a video clip of the reporting by its team in Egypt. Mr. Conniff noted the upcoming elections in Morocco and Egypt as MBN continues to provide coverage of the democratic movement throughout the Middle East. Governor Ashe said that he plans to visit MBN in December and suggested holding a Board meeting there in 2012.

Chairman Isaacson stated that the next meeting is scheduled for January 12 and 13, 2012, and that the Board will hold a working session on January 12 to discuss the Deloitte report in which the network heads and key staff would be invited to participate.

In response to Governor Ashe's question about an email for comments and feedback on the grantee merger assessment report by Deloitte and/or the legal feasibility report by Baker and McKenzie, Mr. Sherman replied that comments and feedback are welcome at [www.bbgstrategy.com](http://www.bbgstrategy.com) website. On a related subject, Chairman Isaacson suggested that, in

## Minutes of January 13, 2012 Meeting

addition to the strategic plan, a copy of the Deloitte report should be given to former Board members of the BBG.

There being no other business, the Chairman adjourned the meeting.

The Broadcasting Board of Governors agreed to the following decision elements (all decisions were adopted by a unanimous vote unless otherwise indicated):

1. Adoption of October 13, 2011 Minutes. Governor Mulhaupt made a motion for the adoption of the minutes of the October 13, 2011 meeting set forth in Attachment 2. Governor McCue seconded. The minutes were unanimously adopted by the Board.
2. Adoption of Resolution Regarding China Visas for Journalists of VOA and RFA. Governor Ashe made a motion for the adoption of the resolution urging prompt resolution of the Chinese visa issue as set forth in Attachment 3. Chairman Isaacson seconded. The resolution was unanimously adopted by the Board.

Other Attendees:

The following persons were also present during all or part of the meeting: International Broadcasting Bureau (IBB) Director Richard Lobo, Executive Director Jeffrey Trimble, Deputy General Counsel and Board Secretary Paul Kollmer-Dorsey, Chief Financial Officer Maryjean Buhler, Director of the Office of Strategic Planning & Performance Measurement Bruce Sherman, Special Projects Officer Oanh Tran, Director of Public Affairs Letitia King, and Board Operations and Policy Adviser Ashley Pyle; David Ensor, Director of the Voice of America (VOA); Carlos Garcia-Perez, Director of the Office of Cuba Broadcasting (OCB); Steven Korn, President of Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty (RFE/RL); Libby Liu, President of Radio Free Asia (RFA); Brian Conniff, President of the Middle East Broadcasting Networks (MBN); Steve Redisch, VOA Executive Editor; Barbara Brady, VOA Chief of Staff; Andre Mendes, IBB Director of the Office of Technology, Services, and Innovation; Kelu Chao, IBB Director of the Office of Performance Review; Michael Marchetti, RFE/RL Senior Vice President of Finance/CFO; Anne Noble, MBN General Counsel; Kelley Sullivan, MBN Vice President for Administration/Treasurer; William Clancy, MBN CFO; and Lynne Weil, Senior Advisor to the Under Secretary for Public Diplomacy & Public Affairs.

Approved:

---

Walter Isaacson  
Chairman



Broadcasting  
Board of  
Governors

## Minutes of January 13, 2012 Meeting

Witnessed:

---

Paul Kollmer-Dorsey  
Secretary

Attachments:

1. Agenda for November 18, 2011 Meeting
2. Minutes of October 13, 2011 Meeting
3. Resolution Regarding China Visas for Journalists of VOA and RFA

## Minutes of January 13, 2012 Meeting

ATTACHMENT 3

### RESOLUTION ON INTERFERENCE WITH BBG BROADCASTS January 13, 2012

WHEREAS, the Congress declared in the U.S. International Broadcasting Act of 1994, as amended (the “Act”) – the law that established the Broadcasting Board of Governors (BBG) as an independent federal agency – that:

“It is the policy of the United States to promote the freedom of opinion and expression; including the freedom ‘to seek, receive, and impart information and ideas through any media and regardless of frontiers,’ in accordance with Article 19 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights.”

And furthermore that:

“Open communication of information and ideas among the peoples of the world contributes to international peace and stability and the promotion of such communication is in the interests of the United States;”

WHEREAS, BBG takes note of recent and substantial increases in the purposeful interference of broadcast transmissions over satellites carrying the programs of not only BBG broadcasters, but other international broadcasters as well;

WHEREAS, satellite operators have informed BBG that geo-location efforts have pinpointed the origin of recent interfering signals within the Islamic Republic of Iran;

WHEREAS, Iran has not been responsive to requests to end the practice;

WHEREAS, recent press reports have noted that Iran also leases satellite transmission time on a number of satellites, even while denying other users unimpeded access to these same satellites;

WHEREAS, a number of human rights, press freedom and non-governmental organizations have condemned such behavior;

WHEREAS, delegates from many of the world’s nations are convening at the upcoming World Radiocommunication Conference in Geneva, Switzerland, under the auspices of the International Telecommunication Union, to discuss important issues concerning international communications policy; and

WHEREAS, the BBG strongly supports the United States Government’s position that interference with free media and the free flow of information and ideas constitutes a threat to human rights and freedom and to the principles stated in Article 19 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights.

## **Minutes of January 13, 2012 Meeting**

THEREFORE, be it resolved that the Broadcasting Board of Governors condemns purposeful interference of satellite communications, and calls upon assembled delegates at the World Radiocommunication Conference, as well as those in the satellite industry – including satellite operators and brokers – to repudiate this illegal behavior.

## **Minutes of January 13, 2012 Meeting**

**ATTACHMENT 4**

### **RESOLUTION HONORING THE VOICE OF AMERICA'S 70<sup>th</sup> ANNIVERSARY January 13, 2012**

WHEREAS, Voice of America (VOA) was established in 1942 and has had 70 productive years of service;

WHEREAS, the mission of Voice of America is to provide accurate news to persons whose government restricts or impedes the broadcast of objective news;

WHEREAS, the work of VOA has changed in locations but not in purpose over 70 years including the collapse of the Iron Curtain; and

WHEREAS, many dedicated men and women have made VOA the success it has been over the years.

NOW, THEREFORE, be it resolved by the Broadcasting Board of Governors that we commend the Voice of America on its 70th anniversary and extend best wishes to VOA for future success in bringing vital news to nations which restrict the free flow of information.

## Minutes of January 13, 2012 Meeting

ATTACHMENT 5

### **RESOLUTION OBSERVING THE 70<sup>th</sup> ANNIVERSARY OF MANDARIN AND CANTONESE SERVICES OF THE VOICE OF AMERICA January 13, 2012**

WHEREAS, Voice of America (VOA) celebrates 70 years of hard work in bringing accurate news to millions of people throughout the world;

WHEREAS, the Mandarin and Cantonese language services have been key components of U.S. international broadcasting for all these 70 years and have brought news to China where the free flow of information is restricted; and

WHEREAS, a congressional reception has been held to salute the Chinese Branch in December, 2011 and BBG wishes to commemorate the wonderful work of the Chinese services.

NOW, THEREFORE, be it resolved by the Broadcasting Board of Governors that we take note of the 70th anniversary of the Chinese Branch and congratulate all the men and women who have made its mission a reality.