



From: Broadcasting Board of Governors
Date: June 7, 2012
Subject: **Minutes of the BBG Meeting of June 7, 2012**

The Broadcasting Board of Governors (BBG) met today at Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty (RFE/RL) headquarters in Prague, Czech Republic. The meeting was open and streamed on the BBG website.

The meeting was attended by the following Board members in Prague:

Alternate Presiding Governor Dennis Mulhaupt
Governor Victor Ashe
Governor Michael Meehan

The meeting was attended by the following Board members via phone or videoconference:

Governor Susan McCue
Governor Michael Lynton
Under Secretary for Public Diplomacy & Public Affairs Tara Sonenshine

Governor Dana Perino was not in attendance at the meeting.

Other persons in attendance are listed at the end of these minutes.

The agenda of the meeting is set forth in Attachment 1.

Alternate Presiding Governor Mulhaupt called the meeting to order and announced that, at the March 2012 Board meeting, the Board designated him to serve as “Alternate Presiding Governor” to preside at meetings of the Board in the event that Governor Lynton, the Presiding Governor, cannot be physically present at the meeting. He then noted the participation of Governor Lynton by phone from California, the participation by Governor McCue and Under Secretary Sonenshine via video link from RFE/RL’s Washington, DC office, and the absence of Governor Perino. He announced the departure of Enders Wimbush from the Board in May, and that the Board will later consider a resolution to honor Mr. Wimbush for his service with U.S. international broadcasting as well as on the Board.

The Alternate Presiding Governor stated that the meeting was being held in compliance with the Government in the Sunshine Act. He noted that the meeting was being held at the headquarters of RFE/RL in Prague, Czech Republic and thanked RFE/RL President Steve Korn and RFE/RL for their hospitality. He added that the Board had an opportunity to meet and talk with the staff at RFE/RL and to thank them for their important contributions to U.S. international broadcasting.

Minutes of June 7, 2012 Meeting

The Alternate Presiding Governor said that the Board is reminded of the risks that BBG journalists face when reporting on regions in conflict or transition. He then pointed out the following incidents since the last Board meeting: (1) a video by Boko Haram, Nigeria's radical Islamist sect, containing threats against the Voice of America (VOA) Hausa-language service; (2) an arrest of VOA correspondent Peter Heinlein and his translator Semegnesh Yekoye by the Ethiopian police for trying to cover a Muslim demonstration in Addis Ababa and their release thanks to intervention by the U.S. Department of State and the Committee to Protect Journalists; (3) a libel conviction in the case of RFE/RL journalist Petar Komnenic who is appealing his conviction to the Montenegro high court; (4) a detainment and interrogation of RFE/RL Belarus Service's freelancer Ina Studzinskaja by the BelaRussian authorities while she was reporting on an opposition meeting that took place in a city near Minsk; (5) threats to Hamida Usman, a Kabul-based reporter for RFE/RL, by an Afghan Interior Ministry official after publishing a report implicating the official in corruption and cases of murder and rape; and (6) growing number of incidents where family members of the staff of VOA's Persian Service and RFE/RL's Radio Farda are targeted by Iranian authorities and have been repeatedly summoned and interrogated in Tehran and at least six other Iranian towns and cities. On behalf of the Board, Alternate Presiding Governor Mulhaupt urged officials and local authorities to ensure the safety of all journalists and to punish those that misuse authority, threaten or harm reporters or their families.

There followed a Board vote to adopt the draft minutes of April 20, 2012 meeting.

Governor Ashe asked about certain redactions in the draft grantee consolidation plan that was posted on the BBG website. Director of Communications and External Affairs Lynne Weil replied that salary information contained in the draft plan was considered sensitive and needed to be redacted to protect its confidentiality. Radio Free Asia (RFA) President Libby Liu added that RFA was concerned that the release of salary information could impact RFA's contract renegotiation with its labor union. Governor Ashe stressed that the Board should be kept apprised of actions taken in the implementation of a Board decision.

In order to recognize the important work by the networks and their activities, the Alternate Presiding Governor noted a change in the usual order of business to allow reporting by network heads at the top of the agenda. Governor Ashe concurred with the order of business change and suggested that the Governance Committee might want to consider implementing this new order of business for future Board meetings.

Office of Cuba Broadcasting (OCB) Director Carlos Garcia-Perez began his report by thanking former Governor Enders Wimbush for his support and leadership. In particular, Mr. Garcia-Perez acknowledged former Governor Wimbush's guidance in the development of a strategy for OCB that is successfully in place. He thanked Under Secretary Sonenshine and her staff for their assistance with securing a license to engage the services of Cuban nationals in Cuba for the purpose of preparing news-related broadcasting materials for rebroadcast. He then played a short video highlighting the recent activities at OCB. In response to Governor McCue's question, Mr. Garcia-Perez briefly described how OCB and other networks such as RFE/RL and VOA are sharing content and cooperating to cover events of interest to the audience in Cuba.

Minutes of June 7, 2012 Meeting

Sitting in for VOA Director David Ensor who was on official travel, VOA Executive Editor Steve Redisch showed several recent photos of Mr. Ensor's trip to Burma, Cambodia and Thailand. Mr. Redisch reported that, in Burma, Mr. Ensor signed an agreement for VOA English teaching programs to air on Burmese state radio and gained support from the Burmese Minister of Information to issue multiple entry visas to VOA reporters. To provide examples of VOA coverage on Syria, Mr. Redisch stated that Elizabeth Arrott had managed to get into Syria in May to produce a series of radio, TV, and Internet reports, Henry Ridgwell had produced several TV reports from the Syria/Turkey border, Scott Bob had reported from Lebanon on when pro and anti-Syrian factions clashed in Tripoli and Beirut, and VOA Persian team also had reported from the Syria/Turkish border. In conclusion, Mr. Redisch played a short video of VOA Persian's report from a refugee camp in Turkey and showed a photo of a Syrian Kurdish child at a protest rally holding a poster thanking VOA Kurdish Service for its coverage of the uprising in Syria via radio programs on direct to home satellite TV. There followed questions from Governor McCue and Under Secretary Sonenshine regarding VOA programming in Kurdish-language and Middle East Broadcasting Networks (MBN) programming in Arabic-language in Syria, respectively. In response to Governor Ashe's question, Mr. Redisch updated on the status of VOA Persian News Network and the recruiting process for a permanent director. Mr. Redisch and other International Broadcasting Bureau (IBB) senior management then responded to Governor Ashe's questions about the annual Office of Personnel Management's Federal Employee Viewpoint Survey and the current labor negotiations between the Agency and American Federation of Government Employees, Local 1812, for a collective bargaining agreement.

Noting the BBG's opportunity to establish a credible presence in Burma and the important role the VOA and RFA can play in that market, Governor Meehan offered a resolution regarding VOA and RFA activities in Burma. Governor Meehan asked IBB Director Richard Lobo to report to the Board in July on efforts to leverage the pilot project for a satellite TV program. The Board voted and passed the resolution with an amendment to notify appropriate Congressional oversight committees should the Board determine it is necessary to establish a bureau for VOA and/or RFA.

RFE/RL President Steve Korn reported on the loss of Radio Mashaal's reporter, Haseeba Shaheed, who died tragically from injuries sustained in a car accident in Prague. In her memory, RFE/RL has begun a Haseeba Shaheed Journalism Fellowship program, which an Afghan female journalist would be selected every six months to work mostly in Kabul and briefly in Prague. Mr. Korn then played a video in tribute to Ms. Shaheed. In response to Under Secretary Sonenshine's question whether the pending Board decision on grantee consolidation has had any impact on employment decisions, Mr. Korn responded affirmatively that RFE/RL was postponing key employment decisions until a decision was made by the Board on grantee consolidation. Governors McCue and Mulhaupt commented that the Board should be prepared to make a decision on grantee consolidation at the July Board meeting. With respect to the handling of Congressional outreach and external affairs matters, Governor Meehan remarked that U.S. international broadcasting should be represented and coordinated by one person and that the Board hired Ms. Lynne Weil for that reason.

Minutes of June 7, 2012 Meeting

RFA President Libby Liu referred to her written report in the briefing book for details on programming content and activities. Ms. Liu thanked RFE/RL for facilitating the screening of RFA's human trafficking documentary on May 24. She then played brief video clips from the documentary that also was available on iTunes as an e-book. There followed questions from Governor Ashe regarding RFA's policy on recording of time and attendance in the event that an RFA official engages in outside activities unrelated to official work during normal work hours.

MBN President Brian Conniff highlighted coverage of the Egyptian presidential elections, including Alhurra's partnership with the Egyptian channel, Al Hayah TV 2, for a series of high-profile interviews with Egyptian presidential candidates. Mr. Conniff announced that a fourth episode of the five-part "Arab Spring" documentary series focusing on Syria had premiered in late May and was co-produced by the MacNeil/Lehrer Productions. He also announced the launch of new and improved websites for Alhurra and Radio Sawa, using the new content management system, Pangea. Responding to Under Secretary Sonenshine's question, Mr. Conniff explained MBN's local and pan-Arab reporting in the region. At Governor McCue's request, Mr. Conniff briefly described the audience interactions planned for the improved websites but will provide a progress report to the Board at a future meeting on those efforts. Governor Ashe then asked Mr. Conniff about MBN's policy on recording of time and attendance in the event that an MBN official engages in outside activities unrelated to official work during normal work hours. Mr. Conniff replied that the grantees may have similar policies on conflict of interest and noted that employees are required to report on any outside interests and to record time spent on such activities by docking appropriate leave for time and attendance purposes.

Governor McCue joined Under Secretary Sonenshine in asking Governor Ashe to explain his line of questioning and if the Board should be made aware of certain issues. Governor Ashe responded that comments had been made to him about a matter, and that he thought those comments worth an exploration to determine the validity of the matter. Governor Mulhaupt said that the Governance Committee will consider the issues of reporting of time and attendance with respect to external activities.

Alternate Presiding Governor Mulhaupt initiated a discussion of proposed protocol to prevent unauthorized disclosure of confidential and pre-decisional information. He noted that, at the request of several Board members, he would like to introduce a resolution to establish "ground rules" and policies among the Board members regarding the disclosure of non-public and pre-decisional information. He emphasized the importance of having "ground rules" to protect the integrity of the Board's deliberative process. He said that the current Board has opened its proceedings in a far greater manner than any previous Board, noting that the Board now regularly holds open meetings in full compliance with the Government in the Sunshine Act, and that more documents are posted on the BBG website for public review than at any time in the past. The Alternate Presiding Governor stated that, in establishing "ground rules" for the Board members, the Board does not intend to retreat to a position of public inaccessibility or to reverse the steps to be as open and transparent as law and prudent policy allow. He clarified that the Agency, the Board, and each individual Board member have legitimate institutional interests in allowing the Agency management, outside advisers and individual Board members to brief the Board and have the Board consider and discuss information without fear that someone will leak

Minutes of June 7, 2012 Meeting

that information without the Board's knowledge or authorization. Alternate Presiding Governor Mulhaupt then invited Board members for their comments.

At the request of Governor Ashe, Board Secretary Paul Kollmer-Dorsey explained the draft resolution establishing a policy regarding non-disclosure of deliberative information.

Governor Ashe stated that it was important to note that he did not receive the proposed policy until the night before the meeting, and that there had been no Committee consideration of the proposed policy. Governor Ashe expressed his concern and noted that, in his view, this would be a giant step back for the Board. He then described the open environment in which he operated during his career as a public official in Tennessee.

Governor Lynton acknowledged that certain Board members feel uncomfortable that there is an active outreach to the press about discussions that may or may not be on the public record, and thus, the proposed policy would help put a stop to this. Alternate Presiding Governor Mulhaupt noted and Under Secretary Sonenshine elaborated on a statement she made at a prior Board meeting in which she was reflecting on the U.S. Department of State's reluctance to publicly discuss specific U.S. foreign policy issues due to their sensitivity. Governor Meehan shared the Board's frustration by citing moments where his position was mischaracterized or what he said was inaccurately described by some source, and emphasized a need to strike a balance for a space that the Board can be transparent and a space that the Board can express opinions in private. Governor McCue agreed with Governor Meehan that, as an Agency, the Board needs to strive for transparency but also needs to avoid misrepresentation of information. The Alternate Presiding Governor stated that the proposed policy is in line with best practices in and consistent with what is being done in the federal government.

Governor Ashe said that he felt the proposed policy was neither fully vetted by the Governance Committee nor placed on the original agenda for the June Board meeting, lacks consideration of the first amendment and the Whistleblower Protection Act, and does not contain standards or guidance for confidential and pre-decisional information.

Because of her representation of the Secretary of State on the Board, Under Secretary Sonenshine asked whether the policy under the Board's consideration was a legal proposal or policy guidance. Mr. Kollmer-Dorsey replied that the Board would be voting to impose a policy among Board members and agreeing to abide by a set of rules.

There followed a brief discussion of the Whistleblower Protection Act and a consideration of an amendment to the resolution so that the policy does not affect the rights of any individual under the Whistleblower Protection Act.

Governor Lynton asked Governor Ashe whether he agrees that the Agency has had a problem with leaks of information intended to be shared and considered by Governors at Board meetings. Governor Ashe agreed that leaks are a problem at the Agency. Governor Meehan concurred in a suggestion by Under Secretary Sonenshine that there should be consensus among the Board

Minutes of June 7, 2012 Meeting

members for a Board-regulated policy. He then agreed to work with Governor Ashe to offer another amendment to the resolution that would address Governor Ashe's concern.

Before taking a short recess, the Board voted for the adoption of the resolution honoring former Governor S. Enders Wimbush and a resolution on attendance at government-sponsored conferences, as amended by Governor Meehan.

The Board reconvened after the recess and considered another amendment to the resolution to specify the categories of deliberative information that would be included within the scope of the policy. The Board then voted to adopt the resolution, as amended. Governor Ashe expressed his appreciation of the manner in which the Board has considered the matter and also thanked Governor Meehan for his efforts. Governor Ashe said that he was prepared to vote for the resolution and that it has been vastly improved. He further added that if issues arise by practice or implementation of the policy, then he would advocate that they be resolved and reconsidered by the Board.

There being no other business, the Alternate Presiding Governor adjourned the meeting.

The Broadcasting Board of Governors agreed to the following decision elements (all decisions were adopted by a unanimous vote unless otherwise indicated):

1. Adoption of Minutes of April 20, 2012 Meeting. Governor Meehan made a motion for the adoption of the minutes. Governor McCue seconded. The Board adopted the minutes of April 20, 2012 meeting as set forth in Attachment 2.
2. Resolution Regarding Establishing a Presence for United States International Broadcasting in Burma. Governor Meehan made a motion for the adoption of a resolution noting the BBG's opportunity to establish a credible presence in Burma and the important role the Voice of America (VOA) and Radio Free Asia (RFA) can play in that market. Governor Ashe offered an amendment to the resolution to include a notification to appropriate Congressional oversight committees should the Board determine that it is necessary to establish a bureau for VOA and/or RFA. The resolution, as set forth in Attachment 3, was adopted unanimously as amended.
3. Non-Disclosure Policy. Governor Ashe made a motion to amend the resolution establishing a policy regarding non-disclosure of deliberative information to include that the policy does not affect the rights of any individual under the Whistleblower Protection Act of 1989. Governor Meehan seconded the amendment. The Board adopted the first amendment. Governor Ashe made a motion to further amend the resolution to include categories of deliberative information to be determined by the plenary Board. Governor Meehan seconded. The Board then adopted the second amendment. A motion to adopt the amended resolution was made by Governor Meehan and seconded by Governor McCue. The Board adopted the amended resolution with five (5) Governors voting "yes". Governor Ashe voted "no". The amended resolution is set forth in Attachment 4.

Minutes of June 7, 2012 Meeting

4. Resolution Honoring S. Enders Wimbush. Governor Ashe made a motion for the adoption of a draft resolution thanking and honoring S. Enders Wimbush. Governor Meehan seconded. The Board adopted the resolution as set forth in Attachment 5.

5. Resolution Regarding Senator Coburn's Amendment to Limit Spending on Government-Sponsored Conferences and Travel. Governor Ashe made a motion for the adoption of Governor Meehan's amendment to the resolution to request that the Governance Committee consider in detail the Coburn amendment and develop a broader and more transparent agency policy on attendance at government-sponsored conferences and travel for consideration by the Board. Governor Meehan seconded. The Board adopted the amended resolution as set forth in Attachment 6.

Other Attendees:

The following persons were also present during all or part of the meeting: International Broadcasting Bureau (IBB) Director Richard Lobo, IBB Deputy Director Jeffrey Trimble, Deputy General Counsel and Board Secretary Paul Kollmer-Dorsey, Director of Communications & External Affairs Lynne Weil, Chief Financial Officer Maryjean Buhler (via video conference), Director of the Office of Strategy & Development Bruce Sherman (via video conference), Director of Board Operations Oanh Tran, Board Operations and Policy Adviser Ashley Pyle (via video conference), Congressional Coordinator Susan Andross (via video conference); and Director of Public Affairs Letitia King (via video conference); Steve Redisch, Executive Editor for the Voice of America (VOA) via video conference; Barbara Brady, VOA Chief of Staff (via video conference), Carlos Garcia-Perez, Director of the Office of Cuba Broadcasting (OCB) via video conference; Steven Korn, President of Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty (RFE/RL); RFE/RL Vice President & Chief of Staff Elizabeth Portale; RFE/RL Vice President of Content, Distribution & Marketing Julia Ragona; RFE/RL Vice President of Administration Dale Cohen; RFE/RL Vice President of Finance/CFO John Giambalvo; Libby Liu, President of Radio Free Asia (RFA) via video conference; Brian Conniff, President of the Middle East Broadcasting Networks (MBN) via video conference; Nicholas Giacobbe, Jr., Chief of Staff & Executive Assistant to the Under Secretary for Public Diplomacy & Public Affairs; Martha Goode, Office of Inspector General (OIG) Consultant; Boyd Doty, OIG Management Inspector; and Laura Shane, OIG Inspector.

Approved:

Dennis Mulhaupt
Alternate Presiding Governor

Minutes of June 7, 2012 Meeting

Witnessed:

Paul Kollmer-Dorsey
Secretary

Attachments:

1. Agenda for June 7, 2012 Meeting
2. Minutes of April 20, 2012 Meeting
3. Resolution Regarding Establishing a Presence for United States International Broadcasting in Burma
4. Resolution Adopting a Policy Regarding Non-Disclosure of Deliberative Information
5. Resolution Honoring S. Enders Wimbush
6. Resolution Regarding Senator Coburn's Amendment to Limit Spending on Government-Sponsored Conferences and Travel

Minutes of June 7, 2012 Meeting

ATTACHMENT 1

BROADCASTING BOARD OF GOVERNORS July 2012 Meeting Agenda

Thursday, June 7

10 a.m. EDT Broadcasting Board of Governors' Meeting (Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty)

I. Open Session

Alternate Presiding Governor's Remarks

- A. Adoption of Minutes of April 20, 2012 Meeting
- B. Programming Initiatives/Program Development
 - OCB Director's Report
(Carlos Garcia-Perez via audio/video link)
 - VOA Director's Report
(VOA Designee via audio/video link)
 - RFE/RL President's Report
(Steve Korn)
 - RFA President's Report
(Libby Liu via audio/video link)
 - MBN President's Report
(Brian Conniff via audio/video link)
- C. Protocol to Prevent Unauthorized Disclosure of Confidential and Pre-Decisional Information
(Governor Mulhaupt)
- D. Resolution Regarding Senator Coburn's Amendment to Limit Spending on Government-Sponsored Conferences and Travel
(Governor Ashe)
- E. Strategy and Budget Briefing
(Governor Meehan)
- F. Fiscal Report
(Maryjean Buhler via audio/video link)
- G. IBB Director's Report
(Dick Lobo)
- H. Communications & External Affairs Director's Report
(Lynne Weil)
- I. Resolution Honoring S. Enders Wimbush
(Alternate Presiding Governor Mulhaupt)
- J. Recognition of Language Services' Anniversaries/Greenville Event
(Governor Ashe)
- K. Other Items for Consideration at Next Board Meeting

Minutes of June 7, 2012 Meeting

ATTACHMENT 2

From: Broadcasting Board of Governors
Date: April 20, 2012
Subject: **Minutes of the BBG Meeting of April 20, 2012**

The Broadcasting Board of Governors (BBG) met today at Office of Cuba Broadcasting headquarters in Miami, FL. The meeting was open and streamed on the BBG website.

The meeting was attended by the following Board members:

Alternate Presiding Governor Dennis Mulhaupt
Governor Victor Ashe
Governor Susan McCue
Governor Michael Meehan
Governor S. Enders Wimbush
Under Secretary of State for Public Diplomacy & Public Affairs Tara Sonenshine

Governors Dana Perino and Michael Lynton were not in attendance at the meeting.

Other persons in attendance are listed at the end of these minutes.

The agenda of the meeting is set forth in Attachment 1.

Alternate Presiding Governor Mulhaupt called the meeting to order and announced that, at the March 2012 Board meeting, the Board designated him to serve as “Alternate Presiding Governor” to preside at meetings of the Board in the event that Governor Lynton, the Presiding Governor, is absent. He then noted the absence of Governors Lynton and Perino.

The Alternate Presiding Governor stated that the meeting was being held in compliance with the Government in the Sunshine Act. He noted that the meeting was being held at the headquarters of the Office of Cuba Broadcasting (OCB) in Miami, Florida and thanked OCB Director Carlos Garcia-Perez for hosting the meeting. He added that the Board had an opportunity to meet and talk with the staff at OCB and to thank them for their important contributions to U.S. international broadcasting.

Alternate Presiding Governor Mulhaupt welcomed Tara Sonenshine, who was sworn in office on April 5, 2012 as Under Secretary for Public Diplomacy and Public Affairs, now representing the Secretary of State on the Board.

Minutes of June 7, 2012 Meeting

The Alternate Presiding Governor said that the Board is reminded that the work of journalists is important, and that they often face risks in doing their jobs. He gave an update on the case of Khadija Ismailova, a freelance journalist for Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty (RFE/RL), who was targeted in a blackmail campaign. He noted that while the Azeri authorities had pledged to investigate, there is no evidence that a meaningful investigation was underway. On behalf of the Board, Alternate Presiding Governor Mulhaupt urged Azeri authorities to honor their pledge to investigate the attack against Ms. Ismailova and prosecute those responsible.

In recognizing many advocates for press freedom, Alternate Presiding Governor Mulhaupt noted, the Board applauds United Nations Educational Scientific and Cultural Organization for awarding the 2012 Cano World Press Freedom Prize to Eynulla Fatullayev, who had spent four years in prison in Azerbaijan based on politically motivated charges. The Alternate Presiding Governor added that Azerbaijan is one of the world's top jailers of journalists, according to the Committee to Protect Journalists. On behalf of the Board, Alternate Presiding Governor Mulhaupt urged Azeri authorities to stop jailing journalists in retaliation for their work.

Lastly, the Alternate Presiding Governor noted that the 2007 murder case of reporter Alisher Saipov had been re-opened. Mr. Saipov wrote extensively for the Voice of America (VOA) and RFE/RL about human rights abuses in Uzbekistan and the plight of Uzbek refugees in Kyrgyzstan. As the previous case was not handled professionally, Alternate Presiding Governor Mulhaupt urged Kyrgyz authorities to conduct a credible investigation of Mr. Saipov's murder in order to bring solace to Mr. Saipov's family and those responsible to justice.

There followed a Board vote to adopt the draft minutes of March 8, 2012 Meeting.

The Board then voted to adopt a resolution offered by Governor Ashe honoring Ambassador Kathleen Stephens for her service as a Governor, during her tenure as Acting Under Secretary for of State for Public Diplomacy and Public Affairs prior to Under Secretary Tara Sonenshine's appointment. The Board offered Ambassador Stephens best wishes in her continued work on behalf of the country.

The Board heard a briefing from Alternate Presiding Governor Mulhaupt regarding the status of grantee consolidation plan. The Alternate Presiding Governor noted that the Board had designated Middle East Broadcasting Networks (MBN) President Brian Conniff to serve as the project team leader. Since January 2012, Mr. Conniff assembled a team of individuals from each of the Grantees and received input from Deloitte Consulting LLP to produce a draft grantee consolidation plan. The team recently provided to the Board a draft grantee consolidation plan with proposed timeline and implementation budget. Alternate Presiding Governor Mulhaupt congratulated Mr. Conniff and the team on a job well done and International Broadcasting Bureau (IBB) Director Dick Lobo praised them for their efforts.

At the Alternate Presiding Governor's invitation, Mr. Conniff provided key highlights in the draft grantee consolidation plan, including an annual savings of approximately \$10 million beginning in Fiscal Year (FY) 2014, and an initial upfront one-time implementation cost of \$4.5 million.

Minutes of June 7, 2012 Meeting

There followed comments on the draft grantee consolidation plan by individual Board members. Echoing Governor McCue's comments, Mr. Conniff stated that the draft plan proposes the preservation of network brands and editorial controls, and that estimated savings from back office support functions through grantee consolidation would be made available for programming. Alternate Presiding Governor Mulhaupt clarified that the purpose is to focus more on the Agency's mission by reducing administrative costs and repurposing those funds for programming and content. Governor Wimbush remarked that the draft plan proposes several benefits to the Agency such as achieving savings, expending U.S. tax dollars more efficiently and improving programming.

Governor Meehan stated that all networks should be streamlined and that consolidation should occur across the board. He expressed a concern for the amount of time and resources spent in working groups on the restructuring of U.S. international broadcasting and questioned whether the BBG is able to manage these efforts and concentrate on the mission of the Agency all at once. In his opinion, with the amount of time and resources spent on these efforts, the Board should consider reforming all of U.S. international broadcasting. Governor McCue responded that the Board had decided to restructure U.S. international broadcasting through grantee consolidation and through legislation for the International Broadcasting Innovation Act (IBIA). She added that these paths are complementary, concurrent and parallel, and that if the BBG can demonstrate that grantee consolidation saves money and enhances content and programming, this would help the BBG move the IBIA forward.

Governor Ashe commented that the adoption of the grantee consolidation plan will be the Board's most significant vote during its appointment and cautioned a rush to judgment. He said that there is a unanimous effort by the Board to be transparent, and thus, the Board has decided to post the draft grantee consolidation plan on the BBG's website at www.bbg.gov to seek public comments. He added that documentation showing \$10 million in savings has not been provided to him and noted that the Governance Committee will examine the draft grantee consolidation plan at its next meeting and that the public, in the meantime, may contact him directly via personal email at vhashe@aol.com with any comments on the draft plan.

The Alternate Presiding Governor offered a resolution on the grantee consolidation, asking for the Governance Committee to consider the plan and asking the IBB Director to work with the Governance Committee to identify, but not select, outside specialists who may be necessary to implement the plan, and to prepare, but not submit, Congressional notifications that might be necessary in the event that the Board decides to move forward with consolidation.

As requested by Governor Ashe, the Board then voted on and passed each element of the resolution on the basis of separate motions, except that the Alternate Presiding Governor decided not to put forward the third element regarding preparation of Congressional notifications for a vote.

Minutes of June 7, 2012 Meeting

Governor Meehan highlighted some issues covered in the April 10, 2012 meeting of the Strategy and Budget Committee. He stated that the Committee intends to meet on a monthly basis going forward, either in-person or telephonically.

Governor Meehan asked the Board to consider a proposal to make a recommendation to Congress to restore FY 2013 funding for broadcasting to China, including Tibet. The proposal requires the IBB Director to identify proposed offsetting savings in order to pay for the restored amounts. The Board resolved to adopt the proposal.

Referring to Mr. Jay Tolson's plan for the Global News Network in the briefing book, Governor Meehan noted that the Strategy and Budget Committee had considered the comments and concerns of each of the networks on the proposed news aggregation website and plans to review the aggregation website at its next meeting.

On BBG strategy for Latin America, Governor Meehan commented that the Board's visit to OCB was timely as it provided an opportunity for the Board to discuss VOA and OCB's shared coverage in important countries in Latin America with the Miami Herald Editorial Board and to hold robust roundtable discussions about the region with local media. He said that the Strategy and Budget Committee acknowledges that the BBG needs to provide news and information programming for countries in Latin America where press freedom remains under pressure. He also said that the Committee felt that VOA and OCB should collocate reporters in Miami as a hub for Latin America, that VOA should leverage the Latin American stringer networks of OCB, and that it is important to expand the use of VOA as the "Washington Bureau" for Latin American audiences.

Governor Meehan noted that the Strategy and Budget Committee had received a briefing on plans for surge efforts, enhanced transmission, and other means of addressing countries or regions in crisis, such as Syria, Nigeria and others. He announced that the FY 2014 budget planning process had begun, and a schedule with key dates and milestones for submitting the Agency's proposal to the Office of Management and Budget was provided in the briefing book by Chief Financial Officer (CFO) Maryjean Buhler.

Governor Ashe gave a report on the Governance Committee meeting in March. Governor Ashe asked the Board to vote on certain proposed amendments to the BBG By-Laws regarding the authorities of the Board Chair and of the Presiding Governor and Alternate Presiding Governor, as well as a protocol for the release of materials from closed Board meetings.

Governor Ashe then briefly described the listening session held by the Governance Committee on March 9 that focused on employee morale issues within the Agency and issues dealing with contractors at BBG. He noted that the Committee had heard comments from contractors and representatives of the Agency's three unions and was informed about a number of issues. Due to time constraints, Governor Ashe asked that his remarks as prepared by the Board Secretary be submitted for the record. (Please see Attachment 2.)

Minutes of June 7, 2012 Meeting

As suggested by Governor Ashe, the Board voted on a resolution to change the dates of the July 2012 Board meeting to be selected by Governors Lynton and Mulhaupt with the Board's concurrence. In response to Governor Meehan's request for additional time in Board meetings to allow in-depth discussion on important topics, Alternate Presiding Governor Mulhaupt suggested that the Governance Committee consider the issue at its next meeting.

Governor Ashe then described his recent second trip to Asia, including Laos, Cambodia and Thailand. In Laos, Governor Ashe met with Laos' Vice Minister of Information to explore establishing an office for Radio Free Asia (RFA) in Vientiane. In Cambodia, Governor Ashe visited the offices of VOA and RFA and met with journalists. In Thailand, Governor Ashe met with the acting Public Affairs Officer at the U.S. embassy and with the representatives of VOA and RFA. Also in Thailand, Governor Ashe visited the Agency's transmitting stations in Udon and Bangkok. He stated that the cost of his entire trip was roughly \$7400 as he felt travel costs should be made public. VOA Director David Ensor noted that VOA was also interested in having a presence in Vientiane in order to provide coverage in that region.

CFO Maryjean Buhler provided a fiscal report. For FY 2012, Ms. Buhler announced that the Agency's program plan had been cleared by the Congress. She said that the Agency's FY 2013 budget was still pending in Congress. In closing, Ms. Buhler noted that collaboration with all networks was underway for the planning of FY 2014 budget.

For the IBB Director's report, Mr. Lobo announced that the second transmitter in Tripoli, Libya was operational and that the Agency will explore funding for a third transmitter in Misratah, Libya. He summarized the recent meeting of the IBB Coordinating Committee, which focused on improving collaboration on digital media among all networks. The IBB Coordinating Committee had agreed to future discussions on a shared digital platform, web analytics, online video/audio platforms and common standards and software for mobile applications.

As part of the Agency's efforts to address workplace and human capital issues, Mr. Lobo reported that he and Mr. Ensor will meet with the Agency's task force on morale on April 26 to collaborate on the implementation of some of the task force's recommendations. He also noted that the Agency's task force on Civility in the Workplace had formulated an awareness campaign to increase understanding of appropriate behavior in the workplace and the Agency's task force on wellness had drafted a plan for wellness programs and improvements. Mr. Lobo noted that the Agency continues to hold brownbag discussions specifically for contractors.

In response to Governor Ashe's question about travel policy, Mr. Lobo said that the Agency has been reducing travel costs in the last several years and will soon be able to implement a policy for the employees to elect, with appropriate approval, to purchase non-contract non-refundable tickets through the Agency's travel system for official government travel. Governor Ashe then commended Mr. Lobo for scheduling a meeting on April 30 for union/management contract negotiations. He also briefly mentioned the upcoming rededication of the Edward R. Murrow Transmitting Station in Greenville, North Carolina, on May 2 where Congressman Walter Jones and Casey Murrow would speak along with IBB Director Lobo.

Minutes of June 7, 2012 Meeting

Director of the Office of Communications and External Affairs Lynne Weil updated the Board on recent activities. Ms. Weil announced that, immediately after the meeting, the Board will meet with at least two Members of Congress over lunch to discuss BBG activities in Cuba, as well as in Latin America. For Congressional outreach, she noted that Governor Wimbush had had a meeting with Congressman Rohrabacher to address his concerns related to VOA and other issues. The IBB-BBG senior staff had a meeting with the staff of the House Committee on Foreign Affairs to provide information on the FY 2013 budget and to discuss the Board's overall strategy and its vision for the Agency. With respect to media outreach, a meeting with the Miami Herald Editorial Board was scheduled (with Governor Perino by phone) the previous day and a roundtable with interested Board members was scheduled later in the afternoon. In support of the Board's effort to be transparent, the Office had set procedures in place to allow for a certain number of members of the general public and interested parties to attend Board of Governors meetings. Ms. Weil thanked Governor Ashe for organizing the May 2 ceremony in Greenville, North Carolina, to rededicate the Agency's Edward R. Murrow Transmitting Station.

OCB Director Carlos Garcia-Perez thanked the Board for visiting OCB and expressed his appreciation for the Board's greet and meet with employees. Mr. Garcia-Perez noted OCB's coverage of Jose Daniel Ferrer, Coordinator of Cuba's Patriotic Union, who may have been detained in Cuba. Mr. Garcia-Perez briefly mentioned his participation in the conference sponsored by the Heritage Foundation and Google to speak about OCB's initiatives in Cuba. He then played a short video highlighting the activities at OCB in March.

VOA Director David Ensor reported on the Korean Service's coverage of the North Korea's missile launch site. He noted that a VOA team was in Syrian refugee camp. He played a short video describing "VOA 60" programs. He said that VOA will extend its coverage of the U.S.-Latin America's Summit in Colombia and noted that 16 affiliates in Latin America rely on VOA's coverage.

There being no other business, the Alternate Presiding Governor adjourned the meeting.

The Broadcasting Board of Governors agreed to the following decision elements (all decisions were adopted by a unanimous vote unless otherwise indicated):

1. Adoption of Minutes of March 8, 2012 Meeting. Governor Wimbush made a motion for the adoption of the minutes. Governor McCue seconded. The Board adopted the minutes of March 8, 2012 meeting as set forth in Attachment 3.
2. Resolution Honoring Ambassador Kathleen Stephens. Governor Ashe moved to adopt a draft resolution thanking and honoring Ambassador Kathleen Stephens for her service as Acting Under Secretary for Public Diplomacy & Public Affairs and the Secretary of State's designee to the BBG. The resolution is set forth in Attachment 4.
3. Adoption of Strategy and Budget Committee Recommendations. The Board heard a report from Governor Meehan regarding the Strategy and Budget Committee meeting held on April 10, 2012:

Minutes of June 7, 2012 Meeting

- a. Governor Meehan noted that the Board had heard a briefing on April 19 from a working group formed at the request of the Strategy and Budget Committee to develop a holistic plan for broadcasting to China, including Tibet. The working group members included: David Ensor, the Director of the Voice of America (VOA), Libby Liu, the President of Radio Free Asia (RFA), Bruce Sherman, the Director of Strategy and Development, Andre Mendes, the Director of Technology Services and Innovation, and Maryjean Buhler, the BBG Chief Financial Officer.
- b. Based on the Committee's recommendation, the Board agreed with the recommendation of the working group that funding in the Agency's proposed FY 2013 budget for broadcasting to China, including Tibet, should be restored to FY 2012 levels. The proposal also includes a VOA proposal for satellite television capability in China.
- c. The Board directed the IBB Director to report at the next meeting of the Strategy and Budget Committee on ways to pay for the recommended restoration of funding for broadcasting to China through partial KU band migration, acceleration of the Poro Transmitting Station closure, and other means of transmission optimization. The IBB Director should also consider opportunities to reduce management costs.

A motion to adopt the Committee's recommendations was made by Governor Meehan and seconded by Governor Ashe. The motion passed unanimously.

4. Adoption of Governance Committee Recommendations. The Board heard a briefing from Governor Ashe on proposed amendments to the BBG By-Laws, the March 9, 2012 Governance Committee listening session, and a proposed change to the July 2012 Board meeting dates. The Board adopted the following recommendations by the Governance Committee:
 - a. Amendments to BBG By-Laws. The Board adopted the following amendments to the BBG By-Laws:
 - i. An amendment to clarify that the Chair of the Board is a non-voting, ex officio member of all committees as set forth in Attachment 5. A motion to adopt the amendment was made by Governor Ashe and seconded by Governor Mulhaupt. The motion passed unanimously.
 - ii. An amendment incorporating the statement of authorities of the Presiding Governor and alternate Presiding Governor as set forth in Attachment 6. A motion to adopt the amendment was made by Governor Ashe and seconded by Governor Meehan. The motion passed unanimously.
 - iii. An amendment incorporating the protocol for the release of materials from closed Board meetings as set forth in Attachment 7. A motion to adopt the

Minutes of June 7, 2012 Meeting

amendment was made by Governor Ashe and seconded by Governor McCue. The motion passed unanimously.

- b. Change to July 2012 Board Meeting Date. Governor Ashe made a motion to change the date of the July 2012 meeting (as previously approved in December 2011) to be selected by Governors Lynton and Mulhaupt with the Board's concurrence. Governor Wimbush seconded. The motion passed unanimously.
5. Decision on Grantee Consolidation. The Board received a briefing from Dick Lobo, the IBB Director, and Brian Conniff, the Board's designated Project Leader and President of Middle East Broadcasting Networks (MBN), on the Grantee Consolidation Plan submitted to the Board as directed by the Board in January 2012. The Board adopted the following decisions:
- a. The Board noted the January 2012 decision announcing its intention to issue the three grants which BBG currently makes separately to Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty, RFA, and MBN to a single, consolidated grantee (when created) subject to Administration approval, Congressional consultation and guidance, and other due diligence and the implementation of a consolidation transaction plan.
 - b. The Board noted the Grantee Consolidation Plan submitted by the IBB Director describing anticipated savings of approximately \$10 million beginning in FY 2014 with an initial upfront, one-time implementation cost of \$4.5 million.
 - c. The Board requested that the Governance Committee examine the plan at its May 24, 2012 meeting with a view toward making a recommendation to the plenary Board at the appropriate time thereafter. A motion to adopt this next step was made by Governor Ashe and seconded by Governor Wimbush. The motion passed unanimously.
 - d. The Board directed the IBB Director to begin, with the consultation and concurrence of the Governance Committee, the process of identifying professional advisers who may be necessary to implement the transaction if the Board decides to move forward. A motion to adopt this next step was made by Governor Wimbush and seconded by Governor McCue. The motion passed by a 5-1 vote. Governor Ashe voted 'no'.
 - e. The Board directed the IBB Director to prepare the Grantee Consolidation Plan for public release on the BBG's public website as soon as practicable.

Other Attendees:

The following persons were also present during all or part of the meeting: International Broadcasting Bureau (IBB) Director Richard Lobo, IBB Deputy Director Jeffrey Trimble (via video conference), Deputy General Counsel and Board Secretary Paul Kollmer-Dorsey, Director

Minutes of June 7, 2012 Meeting

of Communications & External Affairs Lynne Weil, Chief Financial Officer Maryjean Buhler (via video conference), Director of the Office of Strategy & Development Bruce Sherman, Director of Board Operations Oanh Tran, Board Operations and Policy Adviser Ashley Pyle (via video conference), Congressional Coordinator Susan Andross (via video conference); and Director of Public Affairs Letitia King (via video conference); David Ensor, Director of the Voice of America (VOA); Carlos Garcia-Perez, Director of the Office of Cuba Broadcasting (OCB) via video conference; Steven Korn, President of Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty (RFE/RL); Libby Liu, President of Radio Free Asia (RFA); Brian Conniff, President of the Middle East Broadcasting Networks (MBN); and Nicholas Giacobbe, Jr., Chief of Staff & Executive Assistant to the Under Secretary for Public Diplomacy & Public Affairs.

Approved:

Dennis Mulhaupt
Alternate Presiding Governor

Witnessed:

Paul Kollmer-Dorsey
Secretary

Attachments:

1. Agenda for April 20, 2012 Meeting
2. Prepared Talking Points for Governor Ashe on Governance Issues
3. Minutes of March 8, 2012 Meeting
4. Resolution Honoring Ambassador Kathleen Stephens
5. By-Law Amendment Clarifying Board Chair as Non-Voting, Ex Officio Member of All Committees
6. By-Law Amendment Incorporating Statement of Authorities of Presiding and Alternate Presiding Governor
7. By-Law Amendment Incorporating the Protocol for the Release of Materials from Closed Board Meetings

Minutes of June 7, 2012 Meeting

ATTACHMENT 3

RESOLUTION REGARDING ESTABLISHING A PRESENCE FOR UNITED STATES INTERNATIONAL BROADCASTING IN BURMA June 7, 2012

The Board notes the current opportunity to establish a credible presence for United States international broadcasting in Burma and the important role that both the Voice of America (VOA) and Radio Free Asia (RFA) can play in that market.

The Board directs the VOA Director and the RFA President (as a condition of the BBG grant to RFA for Burmese programming) to work with the International Broadcasting Bureau Director to coordinate their activities in and for Burma, including collocating in-country bureaus, sharing stringer networks, undertaking a pilot satellite television program, and (where appropriate) sharing content.

The U.S. Department of State and appropriate Congressional oversight committees should be notified of VOA and RFA activities in Burma, especially in the event the Board determines that a bureau for VOA and/or RFA should be established in Burma.

**RESOLUTION
POLICY REGARDING NON-DISCLOSURE OF DELIBERATIVE INFORMATION**

For the purposes of this policy:

“The Board” refers to the Members of the Broadcasting Board of Governors.

“Deliberative information” means any non-public information, either tangible records or otherwise, exchanged between two or more Board members, or between Agency staff members and Board members. Deliberative information is information pertaining to (1) budgetary matters that are determined to be pre-decisional under Office of Management and Budget guidelines; (2) legislative proposals that are developed for the consideration of the Board, as determined by the Chair or Presiding Governor, subject to the Board’s further review; and (3) such other matters as the plenary Board may determine, based on the recommendation of the Governance Committee. Purely factual information that is otherwise publicly available or an individual Board member’s own opinion that does not reflect the Board’s deliberative processes is not deliberative information.

Each member of the Board has a duty to keep deliberative information privileged and confidential. More specifically, each member of the Board is obligated not to disclose:

1. The substance of deliberative information or the status of discussions about it;
2. Positions of other Board members regarding deliberative information or their individual comments about it;
3. Documents prepared to provide the Board with deliberative information or to memorialize any aspect of such deliberative information, or any subsection of documents that contain such deliberative information; or
4. The identity of Board members or staff members who provide deliberative information to and/or prepare deliberative information for the Board.

The obligation not to disclose deliberative information continues even after a final decision is publicly announced, and such information remains protected until authorized for release by the Board. Deliberative information should only be released after consultation with the Agency’s Office of General Counsel regarding the implications of waiving the deliberative process privilege for release and upon an official Board resolution providing the authority to do so.

Disclosure of deliberative information is a serious matter and constitutes both mismanagement and misconduct. The unauthorized disclosure of official non-public information is prohibited by 5 CFR 2635.703, and employees engaging in the unauthorized disclosure of deliberative information may be subject to punishment or discipline.

Minutes of June 7, 2012 Meeting

This policy does not affect (i) the Agency's requirements to comply with the Government in the Sunshine Act and shall be implemented in a manner consistent with its provisions; or (ii) the rights of any individual under the Whistleblower Protection Act of 1989.

Minutes of June 7, 2012 Meeting

ATTACHMENT 5

RESOLUTION HONORING ENDERS WIMBUSH June 7, 2012

WHEREAS, S. Enders Wimbush, in his role as a member of the Broadcasting Board of Governors from July 2010 to May 2012, steadfastly supported U.S. international media by applying his full range of talent and expertise to the Board's efforts;

WHEREAS, Mr. Wimbush brought quality, erudition and distinction to the Board as it worked to promote the mission of these media to inform, engage and connect people around the world in support of freedom and democracy;

WHEREAS, Mr. Wimbush's involvement in U.S. international media includes distinguished service at RFE/RL as Director of Radio Liberty during six historic years that spanned the collapse of Communism and the demise of the Soviet Union;

WHEREAS, Mr. Wimbush's rich professional experience in the public and private sectors, combined with his scholar's grasp of history and profound understanding of history and current issues throughout the world, made him a most effective member of the Board; and

WHEREAS, the Board will miss Mr. Wimbush's contributions and lively company, but will count on his continued involvement with its work.

NOW, THEREFORE, be it resolved that the Broadcasting Board of Governors honors Mr. Wimbush's extraordinary contributions to the agency, and extends its deepest thanks for all that he has done.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that an appropriate copy of this resolution be forwarded to S. Enders Wimbush.

Minutes of June 7, 2012 Meeting

ATTACHMENT 6

RESOLUTION REGARDING SENATOR COBURN'S AMENDMENT TO LIMIT SPENDING ON GOVERNMENT-SPONSORED CONFERENCES AND TRAVEL June 7, 2012

WHEREAS, an amendment offered by Senator Tom Coburn (R-OK) proposes a model of reform by scaling back, and making more transparent, spending on government-sponsored conferences by establishing attendance limitations on conferences, capping the amount that can be spent on a single conference, capping Agency travel, and requiring all conference expenses to be published online¹; and

WHEREAS, the Broadcasting Board of Governors (BBG) notes that the United States Senate agreed to the Coburn amendment by a voice vote.

NOW, THEREFORE, be it resolved that the Board concurs with the spirit and principles of the amendment and agrees to institute further efforts to ensure transparency and accountability of spending on Agency-related conferences consistent with the Administration's guidance. On the matter of travel, the Board concurs with the spirit and principles of the amendment and agrees to consider their practical application for United States international broadcasting.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Board requests the Governance Committee consider in detail the Coburn amendment and develop a broader and more transparent agency policy on attendance at government-sponsored conferences and travel for consideration by the Board at its July 2012 meeting.

¹ Senator Coburn's press release, "Senate Votes to Limit Lavish Spending on Government Conferences." April 24, 2012.