



From: Broadcasting Board of Governors
Date: September 13, 2012
Subject: **Minutes of the BBG Meeting of September 13, 2012**

The Broadcasting Board of Governors (BBG) met today at BBG Headquarters in Washington, D.C. The meeting was attended by members of the public and was also open for public observation via streaming on the BBG website.

The meeting was attended by the following Board members:

Presiding Governor Michael Lynton
Alternate Presiding Governor Dennis Mulhaupt
Governor Victor Ashe
Governor Susan McCue
Governor Michael Meehan
Under Secretary for Public Diplomacy & Public Affairs Tara Sonenshine

Governor Dana Perino was not in attendance at the meeting.

Other persons in attendance are listed at the end of these minutes.

The agenda of the meeting is set forth in Attachment 1.

Alternate Presiding Governor Mulhaupt called the meeting to order and announced that, at the March 2012 Board meeting, the Board designated him to serve as “Alternate Presiding Governor” to preside at meetings of the Board in the event that the Presiding Governor cannot be physically present at the meeting. He noted the presence of Presiding Governor Lynton but noted that Governor Lynton would need to depart in a short while. Therefore, at the Presiding Governor’s request, Alternate Presiding Governor Mulhaupt accepted to chair the meeting. The Alternate Presiding Governor also noted the absence of Governor Perino.

The Alternate Presiding Governor stated that the meeting was being held in compliance with the Government in the Sunshine Act and streamed live over the Internet at the BBG website.

Alternate Presiding Governor Mulhaupt said that nothing is more important to the Board than the threats to lives of BBG journalists. He noted that Alhurra correspondent Bashar Fahmi and cameraman Cüneyt Ünal have been missing since they entered Syria to report from Aleppo on August 20. He also noted that the Board has called on Syrian authorities to answer questions about their whereabouts, and that the Governors had raised the topic during the Board’s meeting with the Secretary of State earlier in the day.

Minutes of September 13, 2012 Meeting

At the Alternate Presiding Governor's invitation, Middle East Broadcasting Networks (MBN) President Brian Conniff updated the Board on their situation and played a short video about the threats to journalists in Syria and the case of Bashar and Cüneyt. On behalf of the Board, Alternate Presiding Governor Mulhaupt reiterated the call for Syrian officials to release any information they have on the capture and whereabouts of these brave journalists.

The Alternate Presiding Governor highlighted other threats to BBG journalists around the world: (1) in Tibet, BBG-sponsored reporters have faced harassment and excessive interrogation while traveling to visit families in the Tibet autonomous region; (2) in Mali, Malick Aliou, a local radio reporter who contributes stories to the Voice of America (VOA), was badly beaten by Islamists occupying north of the country after reporting on the Islamists' failed plans to amputate a thief's hand; (3) in Angola, VOA correspondent and human rights lawyer José Manuel Gimbi had reporting equipment stolen from his home; (4) in Azerbaijan, Nushaba Fatullayeva was attacked while covering a story at a steel factory in Baku while Turkhan Kerimov, another RFE/RL reporter who arrived soon after to cover the incident, was also roughed-up; and (5) in Nigeria last week, Boko Haram, a radical Nigerian sect, again threatened reporters working with VOA and expressed in a statement that the group was going to target VOA and "will not leave any correspondent or staff of VOA alone." On behalf of the Board, Alternate Presiding Governor Mulhaupt condemned the ill-treatment of these individuals and urged officials and local authorities to ensure the safety of all journalists operating in these locations and punish those who threaten or harm reporters or their families.

Alternate Presiding Governor Mulhaupt expressed condolences to Tara Sonenshine, Under Secretary of State for Public Diplomacy and Public Affairs, for the passing of four diplomats in Libya, including the new U.S. Ambassador, Christopher Stevens, who visited the Cohen Building before heading out to his post. Governor Ashe spoke up and said that it was not a passing but "murder". On behalf of the Board, the Alternate Presiding Governor condemned the cowardly act of violence in the strongest possible terms and reaffirmed the Board's commitment to a robust presence in Libya at this critical time, including that of BBG personnel who are covering the events there.

The Board considered the minutes of the June 7, 2012 meeting. Governor Ashe asked the Board's permission to change his vote on the resolution establishing a policy regarding non-disclosure of deliberative information from a "yes" to a "no". The Board gave its consent and voted on the minutes, as amended. Governor Ashe abstained.

As Chair of the Governance Committee, Governor Mulhaupt reported on its recent Committee meeting. Governor Mulhaupt said that there was a consensus among the Committee members that the Board should proceed to appoint a Chief Executive Officer (CEO) of United States international broadcasting as a matter of urgency. He also said the Committee is recommending to the plenary Board that a CEO position be created under the existing statutory framework provided by the International Broadcasting Act. He noted that the Committee's recommendations do not necessarily reflect the views of Governor Ashe, but do reflect the views of other Committee members (Governors Lynton, McCue and himself). He added that the Secretary of State has communicated her strong support for a CEO in a recent meeting with the

Minutes of September 13, 2012 Meeting

Board. There followed discussions of the Governance Committee's recommendations for the creation of a CEO position, including the formation of a Nominating Committee by the Presiding Governor, the IBB Director's plan for the creation of a CEO, the preparation of Congressional reprogramming notification, the Agency's consultation with the Congressional oversight committees as soon as practicable and with others that may be suggested by the Board, and among other things. Based on comments and suggestions by the Governors, the Board then voted to adopt the Governance Committee's recommendation to create a CEO position under the existing statutory authority.

Governor Ashe commented that he originally thought about opposing the Governance Committee's recommendation due to lack of a public hearing to seek input from stakeholders and others. After understanding that the methodology for creating a CEO would include more outreach, consultation and public input, Governor Ashe felt that he is comfortable in voting "yes" to support and move forward with the proposal, but reserving the right, if he considers the Nominating Committee's recommendation is flawed or the process is not inclusive, to vote against it at later time.

Governor Mulhaupt announced that the Governance Committee did not consider the issue of grantee administrative streamlining. To elaborate, Governor Ashe stated that, in his view, there should be a further review of the Deloitte's rebuttal to concerns raised by one of the grantees, and that the Board felt the appointment of a CEO could solve most of the problems caused for a push to consolidate. He noted that the Governance Committee plans to revisit the issue of grantee administrative streamlining in November. Governor Meehan asked whether Deloitte could do another study to review all U.S. international broadcasting in order to determine other cost savings. Governor Ashe expressed that he was unimpressed with the Deloitte report and felt that a more objective, impartial study should be sought. To address Governor Ashe's concerns, the Board agreed that the Governance Committee would consider the scope of work as suggested by Governor Meehan and recommend whether to retain Deloitte for a review of all U.S. international broadcasting. Deputy General Counsel and Board Secretary Paul Kollmer-Dorsey reminded the Board of the importance of federal procurement integrity rules. He said that the staff understands the Board's request and will look at the existing scope of work to determine if it is adequate to encompass the requested study.

Governor Mulhaupt stated that the Governance Committee also considered the revised policy statements for Equal Employment Opportunity (EEO) and sexual harassment. In response to Governor Ashe's question about his suggestions at the March 2012 Governance Committee meeting, Mr. Kollmer-Dorsey replied that all of his suggestions was incorporated except for the suggestion to add a clause in the policy statement for EEO about the protection of employees who participate in union activities. Mr. Kollmer-Dorsey explained to Governor Ashe that union activities are covered under different labor laws. Governor Ashe proposed an amendment to the revised policy statement for EEO to include union activities would not result in any penalty. Governor Mulhaupt suggested that the Governance Committee consider Governor Ashe's amendment at its next meeting with the participation by labor/employment attorneys. With Mr. Kollmer-Dorsey's assurance about the availability of labor/employment attorneys for a discussion by phone, Governor Ashe agreed with Governor Mulhaupt's suggestion and requested

Minutes of September 13, 2012 Meeting

that his proposed amendment be referred to the Governance Committee and then the plenary Board at the next meeting.

Finally, Governor Mulhaupt noted that the Governance Committee discussed the resolution adopted by the Board at its June 2012 meeting to establish a policy regarding non-disclosure of deliberative information by Governors. He said that, although individual Governors have different views about aspects of the policy and its operation, the Committee adopted no further recommendations with respect to the policy at this time and will continue to monitor and discuss the implementation of the non-disclosure policy. Governor Mulhaupt stated that further refinement to the non-disclosure policy would be considered in the Governance Committee as intended originally. Governor Ashe added that the Governance Committee should consider the consequences of unauthorized disclosure of deliberative information and discuss the non-disclosure policy in the BBG open meeting.

Governor Meehan updated the Board on the activities of the Strategy and Budget Committee. He noted that the Committee held two meetings in August to focus on the FY 2014 budget. Due to OMB restrictions, Governor Meehan was not able to speak about the FY 2014 budget in the open meeting. However, the Strategy and Budget Committee had robust discussions with the broadcast entities about executing the Board's strategy in the budget process and received briefings on crisis contingency planning for the Middle East (Syria) and Africa (Mali). The Strategy and Budget Committee was also briefed on mobile web distribution opportunities and the status of BBG programming opportunities in respect of Iran and Burma. Governor Meehan stated that the Strategy and Budget Committee intends to meet on a monthly basis with Agency staff and the representatives of the broadcasters to help them work through implementation challenges and looks forward to working closely with BBG-sponsored programmers on the implementation the Board's strategy. Governor Ashe noted that the Strategy and Budget Committee also discussed the BBG research contract with Gallup in light of an action by the U.S. Department of Justice (DOJ) to join a lawsuit against Gallup after a whistle-blower alleged the organization overcharged the government for polling services. Governor Ashe urged that an audit of the BBG research contract with Gallup be executed as soon as possible. Mr. Kollmer-Dorsey and Chief Financial Officer Maryjean Buhler strongly recommended that the Board receive a separate briefing due to pending DOJ litigation. At the request of the Strategy and Budget Committee members, staff will brief on the planned audit of the BBG research contract with Gallup at the Committee's next meeting.

With the possibility of losing quorum, Alternate Presiding Governor Mulhaupt asked the Board to consider and vote for the adoption of the resolutions honoring former IBB Congressional Coordinator Susan Andross and former General Counsel of RFE/RL John Lindburg. Governor Ashe expressed a concern for the inability of the Board to complete business in the allotted time given a number of topics on the agenda and suggested that more time be allotted for future meetings, including a consideration of a two-day meeting.

Governor Ashe made a motion to adopt the resolutions honoring Ms. Andross and Mr. Lindburg as well as a motion to adjourn the meeting and place the remaining agenda topics that the Board

Minutes of September 13, 2012 Meeting

did not get to on the October Board meeting agenda. Governor Meehan seconded. The motions were carried.

There being no other business, the Alternate Presiding Governor adjourned the meeting.

The Broadcasting Board of Governors agreed to the following decision elements (all decisions were adopted by a unanimous vote unless otherwise indicated):

1. Adoption of Minutes of June 7, 2012 Meeting. With the permission of the Board, Governor Ashe changed his vote on Decision Element 3 of the Record of Decisions from the June 7, 2012 Board meeting (dealing with the Board's nondisclosure policy) from a "yes" to a "no". Governor Lynton made a motion for the adoption of the amended minutes as set forth in Attachment 2. Governor McCue seconded. The Board adopted the minutes of the June 7, 2012 meeting of the plenary Board with five (5) Governors voting "yes". Governor Ashe abstained.
2. Adoption of Governance Committee Recommendations. The Board heard a report from Governor Mulhaupt regarding the Governance Committee meeting held on September 13, 2012. Governor Mulhaupt noted that the proposed recommendations do not reflect the views of Governor Ashe.
 - a. Discussion of Creation, Role and Method of Appointment of CEO. Governor McCue moved to adopt the Governance Committee's recommendations, as amended, to create a CEO position under the existing statutory. Governor Lynton seconded. The recommendation was unanimously adopted by the Board.
 - i. That the Board note that both the BBG Strategic Plan (adopted by the Board in October 2011) and the Board's January 2012 decision call for the creation of the position of Chief Executive Officer (CEO) of United States international broadcasting (USIB).
 - ii. That the Board note the efforts of the IBB Director to develop draft legislation entitled the International Broadcasting Innovation Act (IBIA) with the characteristics required by the Board's January 2012 decision, including the creation of a CEO of USIB.
 - iii. That, notwithstanding efforts to pursue the IBIA legislation, the plenary Board should act now to create a CEO of United States international broadcasting *within the Board's existing statutory authority* under the United States International Broadcasting Act of 1994 (as amended). The intent of this effort is to empower the CEO to the greatest extent permitted under existing law to act as the day-to-day executive of BBG-sponsored U.S. international broadcasting, including both its federal and non-federal components. The non-delegable authorities of the Board as set forth in the International Broadcasting Act will not be changed.

Minutes of September 13, 2012 Meeting

- iv. That the Board authorizes the Presiding Governor to form a Nominating Committee composed of three (3) Governors to recommend a method of selecting, appointing, remunerating and evaluating the CEO in accordance with federal law and regulation. The Nominating Committee will not begin its work until the reprogramming notification required by this decision has been sent to the appropriate Congressional Committees.
 - v. That the Board instruct the IBB Director, under the guidance of the Governance Committee, to develop a plan to address the following issues:
 - a. The authorities that should be delegated from the Board to the CEO;
 - b. The agency officers who should report directly to the CEO;
 - c. The relationship of the CEO and the IBB Director;
 - d. The relationship between the CEO and the Grantees, including how the relationship should be formalized and expressed in the grant agreements;
 - e. A proposed budget and timeline for implementation of a CEO.
 - vi. That the IBB Director is directed to work in close cooperation with the BBG-sponsored broadcasters, including the grantees, in preparing the requested plan. The Board directs and encourages all elements of USIB to cooperate fully with the IBB Director in facilitating the timely and accurate completion of the requested plan and budget.
 - vii. That the Board directs the IBB Director, as soon as practicable, to prepare and deliver any Congressional reprogramming notification that may be required to implement the Board's intentions as stated in this decision (a copy of which will be simultaneously transmitted to Board members).
 - viii. The Governance Committee will consider the IBB Director's plan and any recommendations from the Nominating Committee at the next meeting of the Governance Committee. The actual appointment of a CEO will be the subject of a further Board decision.
 - ix. The Board directs the IBB Director to engage in appropriate Congressional consultation as soon as practicable with the Agency's eight Congressional oversight committees at a minimum, and others as may be suggested by Board members.
- b. Policy Statement on Equal Employment Opportunity
Governor Ashe moved to adopt the revised policy statement on Equal Employment Opportunity as set forth in Attachment 3. Governor McCue seconded. The revised policy statement was unanimously adopted by the Board.

Minutes of September 13, 2012 Meeting

c. Policy Statement on Sexual Harassment

Governor Ashe moved to adopt the revised policy statement on Sexual Harassment as set forth in Attachment 4. The revised policy statement was unanimously adopted by the Board.

3. Strategy and Budget Committee Report. The Board heard a report from Governor Meehan regarding the Strategy and Budget Committee meetings on August 2 and 28, 2012.
4. Resolution Honoring Susan Andross. Governor Ashe moved to adopt the resolution thanking and honoring Susan Andross, former IBB Congressional Coordinator, as set forth in Attachment 5. Governor Meehan seconded. The resolution was unanimously adopted by the Board.
5. Resolution Honoring John Lindburg. Governor Ashe moved to adopt the resolution thanking and honoring John Lindburg, former General Counsel of RFE/RL, as set forth in Attachment 6. Governor Meehan seconded. The resolution was unanimously adopted by the Board.

Other Attendees:

The following persons were also present during all or part of the meeting: International Broadcasting Bureau (IBB) Director Richard Lobo, IBB Deputy Director Jeffrey Trimble, Chief of Staff Marie Lennon, Deputy General Counsel and Board Secretary Paul Kollmer-Dorsey, Chief Financial Officer Maryjean Buhler, Director of Communications & External Affairs Lynne Weil; Director of Strategy & Development Bruce Sherman, Director of Board Operations Oanh Tran, Congressional Coordinator Suzie Carroll, Director of Public Affairs Letitia King, Jay Tolson on IPA from RFE/RL, Assistant General Counsel (Ethics and Compliance) Andrew Krog, and Executive Assistant to the IBB Director Douglas Schuette; David Ensor, Director of the Voice of America (VOA); Carlos Garcia-Perez, Director of the Office of Cuba Broadcasting (OCB); Steven Korn, President of Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty (RFE/RL); Libby Liu, President of Radio Free Asia (RFA); Brian Conniff, President of the Middle East Broadcasting Networks (MBN); Steve Redisch, VOA Executive Editor; Barbara Brady, VOA Chief of Staff; John Lennon, VOA Senior Advisor for Strategy; Rebecca McMenamin, VOA Acting Associate Director for Language Programming; Andre Mendes, IBB Director of the Office of Technology, Services, and Innovation; Gary Thatcher, IBB Director of the Office of Marketing and External Liaison; Bernadette Burns, RFA General Counsel; Anne Noble, MBN General Counsel; Dale Cohen, RFE/RL Vice President and Director of Administration; John Giambalvo, RFE/RL Vice President and Chief Financial Officer; Benjamin Herman, RFE/RL Assistant Secretary; Brian Cullin, Senior Advisor on Intergovernmental Affairs to the Under Secretary for Public Diplomacy & Public Affairs; and the Office of Inspector General's (OIG) Inspection Team for the inspection of BBG, including Team Leader Ambassador Kenton Keith, Deputy Team Leader Robert Torres, Martha "Marcy" Goode, Elizabeth "Betsy" Whitaker, and Laura Shane.

Minutes of September 13, 2012 Meeting

Approved:

Dennis Mulhaupt
Alternate Presiding Governor

Witnessed:

Paul Kollmer-Dorsey
Secretary

Attachments:

1. Agenda for September 13, 2012 Meeting
2. Minutes of June 7, 2012 Meeting
3. Revised Policy Statement on Equal Employment Opportunity
4. Revised Policy Statement on Sexual Harassment
5. Resolution Honoring Susan Andross
6. Resolution Honoring John Lindburg

Minutes of September 13, 2012 Meeting

ATTACHMENT 1

BROADCASTING BOARD OF GOVERNORS September 2012 Meeting Agenda

Thursday, September 13

4:45 – 6:00 Broadcasting Board of Governors' Open Meeting

I. Open Session

Presiding Governor's Remarks

- A. Adoption of Minutes of June 7, 2012 Meeting
 - B. Governance Committee Report
(Governor Mulhaupt)
 - C. Grantee Administrative Streamlining
(Governors Lynton, Mulhaupt)
 - D. Strategy & Budget Committee Report
(Governor Meehan)
 - E. Programming Initiatives/Program Development
 - MBN President's Report
(Brian Conniff)
 - OCB Director's Report
(Carlos Garcia-Perez)
 - VOA Director's Report
(David Ensor)
 - RFA President's Report
(Libby Liu)
 - RFE/RL President's Report
(Steve Korn)
 - F. IBB Director's Report
(Dick Lobo)
 - Distribution/Technology Initiatives
(Andre Mendes)
 - Fiscal Report
(Maryjean Buhler)
 - Communications & External Affairs Director's Report
(Lynne Weil)
 - Strategy & Development Director's Report
(Bruce Sherman)
 - G. Resolution Honoring Susan Andross
(Governor Ashe)
 - H. Resolution Honoring John Lindburg
(Governor Mulhaupt)
 - I. Recognition of Language Services' Anniversaries
(Governor Ashe)
 - J. Other Items for Consideration at Next Board Meeting
-



Minutes of September 13, 2012 Meeting

ATTACHMENT 2

From: Broadcasting Board of Governors
Date: June 7, 2012
Subject: **Minutes of the BBG Meeting of June 7, 2012**

The Broadcasting Board of Governors (BBG) met today at Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty (RFE/RL) headquarters in Prague, Czech Republic. The meeting was open and streamed on the BBG website.

The meeting was attended by the following Board members in Prague:

Alternate Presiding Governor Dennis Mulhaupt
Governor Victor Ashe
Governor Michael Meehan

The meeting was attended by the following Board members via phone or videoconference:

Governor Susan McCue
Governor Michael Lynton
Under Secretary for Public Diplomacy & Public Affairs Tara Sonenshine

Governor Dana Perino was not in attendance at the meeting.

Other persons in attendance are listed at the end of these minutes.

The agenda of the meeting is set forth in Attachment 1.

Alternate Presiding Governor Mulhaupt called the meeting to order and announced that, at the March 2012 Board meeting, the Board designated him to serve as “Alternate Presiding Governor” to preside at meetings of the Board in the event that Governor Lynton, the Presiding Governor, cannot be physically present at the meeting. He then noted the participation of Governor Lynton by phone from California, the participation by Governor McCue and Under Secretary Sonenshine via video link from RFE/RL’s Washington, DC office, and the absence of Governor Perino. He announced the departure of Enders Wimbush from the Board in May, and that the Board will later consider a resolution to honor Mr. Wimbush for his service with U.S. international broadcasting as well as on the Board.

The Alternate Presiding Governor stated that the meeting was being held in compliance with the Government in the Sunshine Act. He noted that the meeting was being held at the headquarters of RFE/RL in Prague, Czech Republic and thanked RFE/RL President Steve Korn and RFE/RL

Minutes of September 13, 2012 Meeting

for their hospitality. He added that the Board had an opportunity to meet and talk with the staff at RFE/RL and to thank them for their important contributions to U.S. international broadcasting. The Alternate Presiding Governor said that the Board is reminded of the risks that BBG journalists face when reporting on regions in conflict or transition. He then pointed out the following incidents since the last Board meeting: (1) a video by Boko Haram, Nigeria's radical Islamist sect, containing threats against the Voice of America (VOA) Hausa-language service; (2) an arrest of VOA correspondent Peter Heinlein and his translator Semegnesh Yekoye by the Ethiopian police for trying to cover a Muslim demonstration in Addis Ababa and their release thanks to intervention by the U.S. Department of State and the Committee to Protect Journalists; (3) a libel conviction in the case of RFE/RL journalist Petar Komnenic who is appealing his conviction to the Montenegro high court; (4) a detainment and interrogation of RFE/RL Belarus Service's freelancer Ina Studzinskaja by the BelaRussian authorities while she was reporting on an opposition meeting that took place in a city near Minsk; (5) threats to Hamida Usman, a Kabul-based reporter for RFE/RL, by an Afghan Interior Ministry official after publishing a report implicating the official in corruption and cases of murder and rape; and (6) growing number of incidents where family members of the staff of VOA's Persian Service and RFE/RL's Radio Farda are targeted by Iranian authorities and have been repeatedly summoned and interrogated in Tehran and at least six other Iranian towns and cities. On behalf of the Board, Alternate Presiding Governor Mulhaupt urged officials and local authorities to ensure the safety of all journalists and to punish those that misuse authority, threaten or harm reporters or their families.

There followed a Board vote to adopt the draft minutes of April 20, 2012 meeting.

Governor Ashe asked about certain redactions in the draft grantee consolidation plan that was posted on the BBG website. Director of Communications and External Affairs Lynne Weil replied that salary information contained in the draft plan was considered sensitive and needed to be redacted to protect its confidentiality. Radio Free Asia (RFA) President Libby Liu added that RFA was concerned that the release of salary information could impact RFA's contract renegotiation with its labor union. Governor Ashe stressed that the Board should be kept apprised of actions taken in the implementation of a Board decision.

In order to recognize the important work by the networks and their activities, the Alternate Presiding Governor noted a change in the usual order of business to allow reporting by network heads at the top of the agenda. Governor Ashe concurred with the order of business change and suggested that the Governance Committee might want to consider implementing this new order of business for future Board meetings.

Office of Cuba Broadcasting (OCB) Director Carlos Garcia-Perez began his report by thanking former Governor Enders Wimbush for his support and leadership. In particular, Mr. Garcia-Perez acknowledged former Governor Wimbush's guidance in the development of a strategy for OCB that is successfully in place. He thanked Under Secretary Sonenshine and her staff for their assistance with securing a license to engage the services of Cuban nationals in Cuba for the purpose of preparing news-related broadcasting materials for rebroadcast. He then played a short video highlighting the recent activities at OCB. In response to Governor McCue's question, Mr.

Minutes of September 13, 2012 Meeting

Garcia-Perez briefly described how OCB and other networks such as RFE/RL and VOA are sharing content and cooperating to cover events of interest to the audience in Cuba.

Sitting in for VOA Director David Ensor who was on official travel, VOA Executive Editor Steve Redisch showed several recent photos of Mr. Ensor's trip to Burma, Cambodia and Thailand. Mr. Redisch reported that, in Burma, Mr. Ensor signed an agreement for VOA English teaching programs to air on Burmese state radio and gained support from the Burmese Minister of Information to issue multiple entry visas to VOA reporters. To provide examples of VOA coverage on Syria, Mr. Redisch stated that Elizabeth Arrott had managed to get into Syria in May to produce a series of radio, TV, and Internet reports, Henry Ridgwell had produced several TV reports from the Syria/Turkey border, Scott Bob had reported from Lebanon on when pro and anti-Syrian factions clashed in Tripoli and Beirut, and VOA Persian team also had reported from the Syria/Turkish border. In conclusion, Mr. Redisch played a short video of VOA Persian's report from a refugee camp in Turkey and showed a photo of a Syrian Kurdish child at a protest rally holding a poster thanking VOA Kurdish Service for its coverage of the uprising in Syria via radio programs on direct to home satellite TV. There followed questions from Governor McCue and Under Secretary Sonenshine regarding VOA programming in Kurdish-language and Middle East Broadcasting Networks (MBN) programming in Arabic-language in Syria, respectively. In response to Governor Ashe's question, Mr. Redisch updated on the status of VOA Persian News Network and the recruiting process for a permanent director. Mr. Redisch and other International Broadcasting Bureau (IBB) senior management then responded to Governor Ashe's questions about the annual Office of Personnel Management's Federal Employee Viewpoint Survey and the current labor negotiations between the Agency and American Federation of Government Employees, Local 1812, for a collective bargaining agreement.

Noting the BBG's opportunity to establish a credible presence in Burma and the important role the VOA and RFA can play in that market, Governor Meehan offered a resolution regarding VOA and RFA activities in Burma. Governor Meehan asked IBB Director Richard Lobo to report to the Board in July on efforts to leverage the pilot project for a satellite TV program. The Board voted and passed the resolution with an amendment to notify appropriate Congressional oversight committees should the Board determine it is necessary to establish a bureau for VOA and/or RFA.

RFE/RL President Steve Korn reported on the loss of Radio Mashaal's reporter, Haseeba Shaheed, who died tragically from injuries sustained in a car accident in Prague. In her memory, RFE/RL has begun a Haseeba Shaheed Journalism Fellowship program, which an Afghan female journalist would be selected every six months to work mostly in Kabul and briefly in Prague. Mr. Korn then played a video in tribute to Ms. Shaheed. In response to Under Secretary Sonenshine's question whether the pending Board decision on grantee consolidation has had any impact on employment decisions, Mr. Korn responded affirmatively that RFE/RL was postponing key employment decisions until a decision was made by the Board on grantee consolidation. Governors McCue and Mulhaupt commented that the Board should be prepared to make a decision on grantee consolidation at the July Board meeting. With respect to the handling of Congressional outreach and external affairs matters, Governor Meehan remarked that

Minutes of September 13, 2012 Meeting

U.S. international broadcasting should be represented and coordinated by one person and that the Board hired Ms. Lynne Weil for that reason.

RFA President Libby Liu referred to her written report in the briefing book for details on programming content and activities. Ms. Liu thanked RFE/RL for facilitating the screening of RFA's human trafficking documentary on May 24. She then played brief video clips from the documentary that also was available on iTunes as an e-book. There followed questions from Governor Ashe regarding RFA's policy on recording of time and attendance in the event that an RFA official engages in outside activities unrelated to official work during normal work hours.

MBN President Brian Conniff highlighted coverage of the Egyptian presidential elections, including Alhurra's partnership with the Egyptian channel, Al Hayah TV 2, for a series of high-profile interviews with Egyptian presidential candidates. Mr. Conniff announced that a fourth episode of the five-part "Arab Spring" documentary series focusing on Syria had premiered in late May and was co-produced by the MacNeil/Lehrer Productions. He also announced the launch of new and improved websites for Alhurra and Radio Sawa, using the new content management system, Pangea. Responding to Under Secretary Sonenshine's question, Mr. Conniff explained MBN's local and pan-Arab reporting in the region. At Governor McCue's request, Mr. Conniff briefly described the audience interactions planned for the improved websites but will provide a progress report to the Board at a future meeting on those efforts. Governor Ashe then asked Mr. Conniff about MBN's policy on recording of time and attendance in the event that an MBN official engages in outside activities unrelated to official work during normal work hours. Mr. Conniff replied that the grantees may have similar policies on conflict of interest and noted that employees are required to report on any outside interests and to record time spent on such activities by docking appropriate leave for time and attendance purposes.

Governor McCue joined Under Secretary Sonenshine in asking Governor Ashe to explain his line of questioning and if the Board should be made aware of certain issues. Governor Ashe responded that comments had been made to him about a matter, and that he thought those comments worth an exploration to determine the validity of the matter. Governor Mulhaupt said that the Governance Committee will consider the issues of reporting of time and attendance with respect to external activities.

Alternate Presiding Governor Mulhaupt initiated a discussion of proposed protocol to prevent unauthorized disclosure of confidential and pre-decisional information. He noted that, at the request of several Board members, he would like to introduce a resolution to establish "ground rules" and policies among the Board members regarding the disclosure of non-public and pre-decisional information. He emphasized the importance of having "ground rules" to protect the integrity of the Board's deliberative process. He said that the current Board has opened its proceedings in a far greater manner than any previous Board, noting that the Board now regularly holds open meetings in full compliance with the Government in the Sunshine Act, and that more documents are posted on the BBG website for public review than at any time in the past. The Alternate Presiding Governor stated that, in establishing "ground rules" for the Board members, the Board does not intend to retreat to a position of public inaccessibility or to reverse the steps to be as open and transparent as law and prudent policy allow. He clarified that the

Minutes of September 13, 2012 Meeting

Agency, the Board, and each individual Board member have legitimate institutional interests in allowing the Agency management, outside advisers and individual Board members to brief the Board and have the Board consider and discuss information without fear that someone will leak that information without the Board's knowledge or authorization. Alternate Presiding Governor Mulhaupt then invited Board members for their comments.

At the request of Governor Ashe, Board Secretary Paul Kollmer-Dorsey explained the draft resolution establishing a policy regarding non-disclosure of deliberative information.

Governor Ashe stated that it was important to note that he did not receive the proposed policy until the night before the meeting, and that there had been no Committee consideration of the proposed policy. Governor Ashe expressed his concern and noted that, in his view, this would be a giant step back for the Board. He then described the open environment in which he operated during his career as a public official in Tennessee.

Governor Lynton acknowledged that certain Board members feel uncomfortable that there is an active outreach to the press about discussions that may or may not be on the public record, and thus, the proposed policy would help put a stop to this. Alternate Presiding Governor Mulhaupt noted and Under Secretary Sonenshine elaborated on a statement she made at a prior Board meeting in which she was reflecting on the U.S. Department of State's reluctance to publicly discuss specific U.S. foreign policy issues due to their sensitivity. Governor Meehan shared the Board's frustration by citing moments where his position was mischaracterized or what he said was inaccurately described by some source, and emphasized a need to strike a balance for a space that the Board can be transparent and a space that the Board can express opinions in private. Governor McCue agreed with Governor Meehan that, as an Agency, the Board needs to strive for transparency but also needs to avoid misrepresentation of information. The Alternate Presiding Governor stated that the proposed policy is in line with best practices in and consistent with what is being done in the federal government.

Governor Ashe said that he felt the proposed policy was neither fully vetted by the Governance Committee nor placed on the original agenda for the June Board meeting, lacks consideration of the first amendment and the Whistleblower Protection Act, and does not contain standards or guidance for confidential and pre-decisional information.

Because of her representation of the Secretary of State on the Board, Under Secretary Sonenshine asked whether the policy under the Board's consideration was a legal proposal or policy guidance. Mr. Kollmer-Dorsey replied that the Board would be voting to impose a policy among Board members and agreeing to abide by a set of rules.

There followed a brief discussion of the Whistleblower Protection Act and a consideration of an amendment to the resolution so that the policy does not affect the rights of any individual under the Whistleblower Protection Act.

Governor Lynton asked Governor Ashe whether he agrees that the Agency has had a problem with leaks of information intended to be shared and considered by Governors at Board meetings.

Minutes of September 13, 2012 Meeting

Governor Ashe agreed that leaks are a problem at the Agency. Governor Meehan concurred in a suggestion by Under Secretary Sonenshine that there should be consensus among the Board members for a Board-regulated policy. He then agreed to work with Governor Ashe to offer another amendment to the resolution that would address Governor Ashe's concern.

Before taking a short recess, the Board voted for the adoption of the resolution honoring former Governor S. Enders Wimbush and a resolution on attendance at government-sponsored conferences, as amended by Governor Meehan.

The Board reconvened after the recess and considered another amendment to the resolution to specify the categories of deliberative information that would be included within the scope of the policy. The Board then voted to adopt the resolution, as amended. Governor Ashe expressed his appreciation of the manner in which the Board has considered the matter and also thanked Governor Meehan for his efforts. Governor Ashe said that he was prepared to vote for the resolution and that it has been vastly improved. He further added that if issues arise by practice or implementation of the policy, then he would advocate that they be resolved and reconsidered by the Board.

There being no other business, the Alternate Presiding Governor adjourned the meeting.

The Broadcasting Board of Governors agreed to the following decision elements (all decisions were adopted by a unanimous vote unless otherwise indicated):

1. Adoption of Minutes of April 20, 2012 Meeting. Governor Meehan made a motion for the adoption of the minutes. Governor McCue seconded. The Board adopted the minutes of April 20, 2012 meeting as set forth in Attachment 2.
2. Resolution Regarding Establishing a Presence for United States International Broadcasting in Burma. Governor Meehan made a motion for the adoption of a resolution noting the BBG's opportunity to establish a credible presence in Burma and the important role the Voice of America (VOA) and Radio Free Asia (RFA) can play in that market. Governor Ashe offered an amendment to the resolution to include a notification to appropriate Congressional oversight committees should the Board determine that it is necessary to establish a bureau for VOA and/or RFA. The resolution, as set forth in Attachment 3, was adopted unanimously as amended.
3. Non-Disclosure Policy. Governor Ashe made a motion to amend the resolution establishing a policy regarding non-disclosure of deliberative information to include that the policy does not affect the rights of any individual under the Whistleblower Protection Act of 1989. Governor Meehan seconded the amendment. The Board adopted the first amendment. Governor Ashe made a motion to further amend the resolution to include categories of deliberative information to be determined by the plenary Board. Governor Meehan seconded. The Board then adopted the second amendment. A motion to adopt the amended resolution was made by Governor Meehan and seconded by Governor

Minutes of September 13, 2012 Meeting

McCue. The Board adopted the amended resolution with five (5) Governors voting “yes”. Governor Ashe voted “no”¹. The amended resolution is set forth in Attachment 4.

4. Resolution Honoring S. Enders Wimbush. Governor Ashe made a motion for the adoption of a draft resolution thanking and honoring S. Enders Wimbush. Governor Meehan seconded. The Board adopted the resolution as set forth in Attachment 5.
5. Resolution Regarding Senator Coburn’s Amendment to Limit Spending on Government-Sponsored Conferences and Travel. Governor Ashe made a motion for the adoption of Governor Meehan’s amendment to the resolution to request that the Governance Committee consider in detail the Coburn amendment and develop a broader and more transparent agency policy on attendance at government-sponsored conferences and travel for consideration by the Board. Governor Meehan seconded. The Board adopted the amended resolution as set forth in Attachment 6.

Other Attendees:

The following persons were also present during all or part of the meeting: International Broadcasting Bureau (IBB) Director Richard Lobo, IBB Deputy Director Jeffrey Trimble, Deputy General Counsel and Board Secretary Paul Kollmer-Dorsey, Director of Communications & External Affairs Lynne Weil, Chief Financial Officer Maryjean Buhler (via video conference), Director of the Office of Strategy & Development Bruce Sherman (via video conference), Director of Board Operations Oanh Tran, Board Operations and Policy Adviser Ashley Pyle (via video conference), Congressional Coordinator Susan Andross (via video conference); and Director of Public Affairs Letitia King (via video conference); Steve Redisch, Executive Editor for the Voice of America (VOA) via video conference; Barbara Brady, VOA Chief of Staff (via video conference), Carlos Garcia-Perez, Director of the Office of Cuba Broadcasting (OCB) via video conference; Steven Korn, President of Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty (RFE/RL); RFE/RL Vice President & Chief of Staff Elizabeth Portale; RFE/RL Vice President of Content, Distribution & Marketing Julia Ragona; RFE/RL Vice President of Administration Dale Cohen; RFE/RL Vice President of Finance/CFO John Giambalvo; Libby Liu, President of Radio Free Asia (RFA) via video conference; Brian Conniff, President of the Middle East Broadcasting Networks (MBN) via video conference; Nicholas Giacobbe, Jr., Chief of Staff & Executive Assistant to the Under Secretary for Public Diplomacy & Public Affairs; Martha Goode, Office of Inspector General (OIG) Consultant; Boyd Doty, OIG Management Inspector; and Laura Shane, OIG Inspector.

¹At the September 13, 2012 meeting, Governor Ashe changed his vote on this item from “yes” to “no” with the consent of the Board of Governors.

Minutes of September 13, 2012 Meeting

Approved:

Dennis Mulhaupt
Alternate Presiding Governor
Witnessed:

Paul Kollmer-Dorsey
Secretary

Attachments:

1. Agenda for June 7, 2012 Meeting
2. Minutes of April 20, 2012 Meeting
3. Resolution Regarding Establishing a Presence for United States International Broadcasting in Burma
4. Resolution Adopting a Policy Regarding Non-Disclosure of Deliberative Information
5. Resolution Honoring S. Enders Wimbush
6. Resolution Regarding Senator Coburn's Amendment to Limit Spending on Government-Sponsored Conferences and Travel

Minutes of September 13, 2012 Meeting

ATTACHMENT 3

POLICY STATEMENT ON EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY September 13, 2012

The Broadcasting Board of Governors (BBG or Agency) is firmly committed to equal employment opportunity (EEO), diversity, and the promotion of a strong affirmative employment program. It is the policy of BBG to provide equal opportunities in employment for every employee and job applicant, and to ensure a workplace that is free of discrimination on the basis of race, color, religion, sex (including sexual harassment and sexual orientation), age (person 40 years of age and older), national origin, disability (physical and mental), genetic information, and retaliation because an individual engaged in prior EEO activities. The BBG strongly promotes the full realization of equal opportunity in employment through a continuing affirmative program to identify and eliminate discriminatory practices.

EEO principles govern all aspects of the Agency's personnel policies, programs, practices, and operations. All phases of the Agency's employment – recruitment, hiring, retention, evaluations, promotions, transfers, benefits, assignments, training opportunities, awards, and separations – shall be conducted in compliance with the EEO laws and regulations.

The Agency holds each manager and supervisor accountable for ensuring a continuing affirmative application and enforcement of this EEO policy. Additionally, managers and supervisors must continue to take positive steps toward ensuring a supportive work environment and reaching early resolution of complaints. They must avoid even the appearance of acts of retaliation against individuals who exercise their right to file a complaint. Accordingly, equal opportunity will continue to be a factor in the total performance evaluation of managers and supervisors.

Employees are essential in maintaining a work environment of equal opportunities, and have a moral and legal responsibility to treat all of their colleagues with respect and professionalism. The BBG strongly supports a workplace free of discrimination and holds every employee accountable for contributing to the achievement of a Model EEO Program.

Minutes of September 13, 2012 Meeting

ATTACHMENT 4

POLICY STATEMENT ON SEXUAL HARASSMENT September 13, 2012

It is the policy of the Broadcasting Board of Governors (BBG or Agency) to provide a work environment free of any form of unlawful harassment or intimidation. This policy includes but is not limited to sexual harassment, a form of sex discrimination that violates *Title VII of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, as amended*.

Sexual harassment is defined as unwelcome sexual advances, requests for sexual favors, and other verbal or physical conduct of a sexual nature when:

- Submission to or rejection of such conduct by an individual is made either explicit or implicitly as a term or condition of an individual's employment;
- Submission to or rejection of such conduct by an individual is used as the basis for employment decisions affecting an individual; or
- Such conduct has the purpose or effect of unreasonably interfering with an individual's work performance or creates an intimidating, hostile or offensive working environment.

Managers and supervisors are responsible for ensuring that the workplace is free from sexual harassment and that appropriate action is taken promptly when allegations of violations of this policy are brought to their attention. The Agency will not tolerate retaliation against an individual who presents a harassment complaint or who provides any information related to such a complaint.

Any Agency employee found to have engaged in sexual harassment in violation of this policy is subject to disciplinary action. The offending individual, however, may not necessarily be an employee, but may be a contractor or non-employee. Supervisors and managers who observe or are informed of any unprofessional behavior that may create a work environment offensive to any staff member have a responsibility to take appropriate, effective and immediate steps to prevent such behavior from continuing or recurring.

Minutes of September 13, 2012 Meeting

ATTACHMENT 5

RESOLUTION HONORING SUSAN ANDROSS September 13, 2012

WHEREAS, Susan Andross, the long-serving Legislative Coordinator for the Broadcasting Board of Governors, has just completed her service;

WHEREAS, during more than three decades with the Federal Government – first as a staffer with the House Committee on Foreign Affairs, then with the U.S. Department of State, and finally with the Broadcasting Board of Governors starting in 1999 – Ms. Andross has shown consistent dedication to promoting the goals of U.S. foreign policy;

WHEREAS, as a member of the Board’s senior management team, Ms. Andross directed the agency’s legislative program and coordinated closely colleagues on the agency’s budget requests;

WHEREAS, Ms. Andross has written countless hours of testimony, reams of reports to Congress, and myriad agency responses to the Government Accountability Office and Office of the Inspector General;

WHEREAS, Ms. Andross has acted as principal point of contact on all agency matters for congressional inquiries; worked with the agency’s leadership and key managers to ensure that policies and programs are consistent with Congressional and Board mandates and expectations; and consulted knowledgably with the U.S. Department of State on legislative matters of mutual interest; and

WHEREAS, for this work Ms. Andross has received numerous professional accolades, among them a Gold Medal Award and a Career Achievement Award, in addition to steady recognition of her value to the agency via stellar annual performance appraisals.

NOW, THEREFORE, be it resolved that the Broadcasting Board of Governors honors Ms. Andross’ inestimable contribution to the agency, and extends its deepest thanks for all that she has done to support U.S. international broadcasting.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that an appropriate copy of this resolution be forwarded to Susan Andross.

Minutes of September 13, 2012 Meeting

ATTACHMENT 6

RESOLUTION HONORING JOHN LINDBURG September 13, 2012

WHEREAS, John A. Lindburg has devoted nearly 40 years of his career to the mission of U.S. international broadcasting;

WHEREAS, Mr. Lindburg joined the United States Information Agency's Office of the General Counsel in 1973 and worked there for 15 years;

WHEREAS, Mr. Lindburg then served for 10 years as General Counsel of the Board for International Broadcasting, where he helped draft the legislation that created the Broadcasting Board of Governors (BBG) and governs us today;

WHEREAS, Mr. Lindburg served the BBG from its inception as Legal Counsel and Ethics Officer;

WHEREAS, Mr. Lindburg became the first General Counsel of Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty, Inc. (RFE/RL) in 2003;

WHEREAS, Mr. Lindburg has announced his retirement from RFE/RL effective July 23, 2012;

WHEREAS, Mr. Lindburg has performed his work with intelligence, calm, kindness, and humor; and

WHEREAS, Mr. Lindburg has been a beloved figure at every place he has worked and will be missed enormously.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Broadcasting Board of Governors expresses its deep gratitude and appreciation to Mr. Lindburg for his loyal and outstanding service to the mission of U.S. international broadcasting.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that an appropriate copy of this resolution be forwarded to John A. Lindburg.