



From: Broadcasting Board of Governors  
Date: December 14, 2012  
Subject: **Minutes of the BBG Meeting of December 14, 2012<sup>1</sup>**

The Broadcasting Board of Governors (BBG) met today at BBG Headquarters in Washington, D.C. The meeting was attended by members of the public and was also open for public observation via streaming on the BBG website.

The meeting was attended by the following Board members:

Presiding Governor Michael Lynton  
Alternate Presiding Governor Dennis Mulhaupt  
Governor Victor Ashe  
Governor Susan McCue  
Governor Michael Meehan  
Under Secretary for Public Diplomacy & Public Affairs Tara Sonenshine

Governor Dana Perino was not in attendance at the meeting.

Other persons in attendance are listed at the end of these minutes.

The agenda of the meeting is set forth in Attachment 1.

Presiding Governor Lynton called the meeting to order and noted that, in February 2012, the Board designated him to serve as “Presiding Governor” on an interim basis.

The Presiding Governor announced that the meeting was being held in compliance with the Government in the Sunshine Act and streamed live over the Internet at the BBG website. He noted the absence of Governor Perino.

Presiding Governor Lynton said there was nothing more important than the protection of BBG journalists and responding to threats to them. On behalf of the Board, Presiding Governor Lynton expressed concern over the lack of information about Alhurra correspondent Bashar Fahmi and called on anyone with information about Mr. Fahmi’s whereabouts to come forward and asked for his immediate release to the safety of his family. The Presiding Governor welcomed the support of the South East Europe media organization in Istanbul, which awarded Bashar Fahmi and Cüneyt Ünal its 10<sup>th</sup> annual human rights award on December 6. (Mr. Ünal also went missing on August 20, 2012 and was held captive for almost three months, but since

---

<sup>1</sup> Adopted by the Board at the August 21, 2013 BBG Meeting.

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

had been reunited safely with his family.) Presiding Governor Lynton stated the BBG will continue to investigate every possible avenue to secure Mr. Fahmi's release.

The Presiding Governor highlighted recent attacks against the free flow of information, including the harassment and detention of BBG journalists around the world: (1) In Cuba, Antonio Rodiles, the Cuba-based independent producer of the Emmy-nominated TV Martí program *Estado de SANTS*, was jailed in Havana after seeking information on the arrest of two Cuban dissidents and later released, and charges of "resisting authority" were dropped; (2) In Azerbaijan, Yafez Hasanov, a Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty (RFE/RL) correspondent, had received repeated telephone calls and text messages from unidentified persons threatening reprisals against him and his family if he did not stop investigating the death last year of a man in the custody of Azerbaijan's Ministry of National Security; (3) In Tajikistan, earlier this month the government blocked access to the website of RFE/RL's Tajik Service, Radio Ozodi, only days after authorities blocked Facebook inside the country; (4) In Egypt, an Alhurra reporter covering the constitutional crisis in Egypt received threats on his cellphone from an unidentified person; (5) In Angola, Voice of America (VOA) is concerned about its local reporter, Antonio Capalandanda, who was robbed of his equipment while walking on the street, and is looking into the circumstances surrounding the robbery; and (6) In Zimbabwe, VOA reporters face renewed threats from the ruling party Zanf, which wants to discourage independent reporting, and the head of the party's media, Science and Technology Committee referred to VOA's Studio 7 as hostile foreign media, and called on the government to do more to jam its signal. On behalf of the Board, Presiding Governor Lynton called on governments to cease the intimidation and incarceration of journalists, and to hold accountable those who try to obstruct their reporting or harm them for simply doing their jobs.

On a positive note, the Presiding Governor announced that the Board was pleased to learn that Khadija Ismailova, an investigative journalist for RFE/RL's Azerbaijan Service, had received the "Courage in Journalism" award from the International Women's Media Foundation. Ms. Ismayilova was honored for her unflinching reporting in the face of continued harassment, slander campaigns, and blackmail for her investigations into corruption within the Azerbaijan's ruling family. Presiding Governor Lynton said that the Board will hear later from Ms. Ismayilova during the RFE/RL President's report.

There followed a Board vote to adopt the draft minutes of October 11, 2012 meeting.

As Chair of the Governance Committee, Governor Mulhaupt reported on its meetings on November 8 and December 13, 2012. Governor Mulhaupt noted that the IBB Director had provided to the Committee for its consideration a plan to create a Chief Executive Officer (CEO) under the Board's existing legislation, as required by the Board's September 2012 decision. He commended the IBB Director and his staff for their efforts in developing the plan and in working with the BBG-sponsored broadcasting entities to obtain their input on the feasibility of the plan. Governor Mulhaupt said the Committee had considered the IBB Director's plan but needs more time to study the plan in detail and to work out a few of the more difficult details of the plan as there are important limitations due to the features of the existing International Broadcasting Act. He added that the sense of the majority of the Committee members is that proceeding with the

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

creation of a CEO under existing legislation, notwithstanding these limitations, is a meaningful first step toward the achievement of the Board's objective of providing a day-to-day executive with authority over both the federal and non-federal elements of U.S. international broadcasting. Governor Mulhaupt then proposed the Committee's recommendations relating to the creation of a CEO under existing legislation and invited comments from Board members.

In Governor Ashe's opinion, he felt that a plan for a CEO overseeing the International Broadcasting Bureau (IBB), the Voice of America (VOA), and the Office of Cuba Broadcasting (OCB) is worth pursuing and should move forward. He also felt that there may be major legal and Congressional issues with the CEO's authority vis-a-vis the BBG-sponsored grantees, which are private non-profit corporations. He urged the Board to seek an independent legal opinion in order to determine legally appropriate governance relationships between the CEO and the BBG-sponsored grantees. He suggested that a Congressional notification and participation on the issue would be helpful. He stated that the success of the plan would be determined in the details, such as what authorities the CEO would have, how the CEO would be selected, what are the duties the CEO would have with respect to the Board and its members, and what is the process. Governor Ashe said that, conceptually, he is supportive of the plan, but reserving final judgment until more details are presented.

Governor Mulhaupt reported that the Governance Committee also discussed guidelines for international travel that would apply to both Governors and members of Agency senior staff. He said the crux of these guidelines is that the Board should be informed, where practicable, about international travel undertaken by the Governors and members of Agency senior staff, including the objective and costs of the travel. Agency senior staff should report about their international travel to the IBB Director who will prepare a report for the Board. Governor Mulhaupt noted that the guidelines were developed by Governor McCue in consultation with other Governors. He then invited Governor McCue to discuss the guidelines that she had proposed. Governor McCue noted that the guidelines were developed for the purposes of notification, awareness, and transparency, and that they can be updated, modified and expanded further at future Board meetings. Governor Ashe expressed appreciation for Governor McCue's work in proposing the travel guidelines and noted that the Office of Inspector General had pointed out in its recent inspection that the BBG does not have a written travel policy. He noted that the actual cost of international travel by Board members is quite small compared to senior staff members who travel often because of their line of work. He said that Board members need to travel to places, both domestic and international, in order to better understand the issues. As an example, Governor Ashe mentioned his recent travel to Burma with Governors McCue and Meehan, Radio Free Asia (RFA) President Libby Liu, and VOA Director David Ensor.

Governor Mulhaupt stated that, at its meeting the previous day, the Governance Committee also discussed the Board's entire meeting dates in 2013. Governor Mulhaupt said that the sense of the Committee is that the number of plenary Board meetings should be reduced to a total of six (6) meetings. He noted that the Committee recommends holding a meeting every other month beginning in February 2013 and announced the dates for meetings as proposed by the Committee. Governor Ashe commented that the proposed dates represent a substantial change from prior practices of the Board, and that it made sense to meet every other month so that the

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

Board could better manage and have more productive meetings while the Committees would meet during the months when the plenary Board does not meet to discuss specific issues.

In conclusion, Governor Mulhaupt asked the Board to consider the reports of the Committee's meetings of March 7, March 9 and September 13, 2012.

At about 1:35 p.m., Governor Meehan joined the meeting.

The following Governors introduced resolutions honoring employees for their service: Governor McCue introduced a resolution honoring Mr. John Lennon, VOA Senior Advisor for Strategy; Governor Ashe introduced a resolution honoring Ms. Maryjean Buhler, former Chief Financial Officer; and Governors McCue and Meehan introduced a resolution honoring Ms. Dana Perino for her service on the Board.

At the Presiding Governor's invitation, Governor Meehan spoke about the two recent separate panels with internal and external experts that were assembled by the Strategy and Budget Committee to discuss U.S. international broadcasting in Russia and Iran. He thanked the expert panelists, RFE/RL staff, and all participants for the robust discussions which will be helpful in developing BBG strategy in those markets. He mentioned that a discussion of Africa mobile strategy had been tentatively planned for January. Governor Meehan reported that, through the course of Committee meetings in November, the Strategy and Budget Committee had discussions of broadcasting efforts in Mali-Nigeria and China as well as a discussion of Internet Anti-Censorship (IAC) projects. With respect to IAC, Governor Meehan noted a recent trip to Burma and India by a team of technical experts in order to collect on the ground data and information to help understand the challenges and technology efforts there.

There followed a trip report by Governors Meehan, McCue and Ashe on their visit to Burma. The Governors described their meetings with government officials and private media companies, including a signing ceremony, also attended by VOA Director Ensor, for VOA to enter an agreement with Skynet to broadcast via direct-to-home satellite in Burma. Both Governors McCue and Ashe expressed their cautious optimism as Burma makes efforts to transition to a democratic government. Governor Meehan echoed Governor McCue's point on the importance of maintaining VOA and RFA presence in the country.

Presiding Governor Lynton stated that, as a result of the strategy session, the Board has initiated a review of recent developments in Moscow regarding RFE/RL. The review, lasting approximately six months, will be led by IBB Deputy Director Jeffrey Trimble and will provide a perspective on the current and future media landscape in Russia. The Board thanked Mr. Trimble for accepting this assignment and for the recommendations he will make.

RFE/RL President Steven Korn announced Radio Farda's collaboration with VOA for the launch of its first TV program, *Breakfast with News*, which is simulcast on VOA's Persian News Network satellite channel. He played a short video clip of the show. Mr. Korn also announced a resolution passed recently by the RFE/RL Board of Directors honoring RFE/RL Azerbaijani Service Correspondent Khadija Ismayilova, an investigative reporter and host for the Service,

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

Radio Azadliq. Joining by a video link via Skype, Ms. Ismayilova gave brief remarks, including commending the Board for its support for the journalists and emphasizing the important role RFE/RL plays in Azerbaijan.

Joining the meeting by video conference, OCB Director Carlos Garcia-Perez gave his report. Mr. Garcia-Perez noted that a number of arrests of journalists and dissidents by the Cuban authorities. He played a short video highlighting recent reports filed by Radio and TV Marti.

VOA Director Ensor described two new VOA television programs featured in *VOA Music Alley* that showcase American music and build on VOA's music legacy that helped popularize jazz around the world. *VOA Music Alley* offers jazz, blues, and swing music through a program called *Beyond Category with Eric Felten*, and brings intimate performances with musicians from every genre, including rock n' roll, rhythm-and-blues, gospel and bluegrass through a program called *Hamilton Live*. The Board then viewed a brief promotional video of *VOA Music Alley*.

At about 2:30 p.m., Presiding Governor Lynton departed and Alternate Presiding Governor Mulhaupt chaired the rest of the meeting.

RFA President Liu stated that RFA's substantive issues and activities in the past month are highlighted in her written monthly report to the Board. Ms. Liu mentioned a video of 2012 end-of-year summary of major events had been produced by RFA and narrated by Burmese opposition leader Aung San Suu Kyi. She noted that RFA had issued a statement supporting Mam Sanando, Director of Beehive Radio in Cambodia who recently was denied second bail request by Cambodia's Court of Appeals, and asking for his immediate release. Ms. Liu played the video of RFA's 2012 end-of-year summary of major events.

Middle East Broadcasting Networks (MBN) President Brian Conniff echoed the Presiding Governor's open remarks regarding the continuing lack of information about Alhurra correspondent Bashar Fahmi, and that MBN continues to follow all leads and has made its priority for Mr. Fahmi's safe return. Mr. Conniff highlighted MBN's efforts to break news in the Middle East, including the Israeli clashes, the continuing demonstrations in Egypt, and the deteriorating situation in Syria. On cooperative efforts with other U.S. international broadcasters, Mr. Conniff noted that colocation opportunities with VOA in London and New York were in near completion, establishment of a work space at MBN's production center in Dubai was completed for a VOA correspondent, and preparation with VOA was underway for the Presidential inauguration. In addition, MBN's Dubai Production Center has regularly offered support to the U.S. Department of State on a few types of productions including *Ask Alan*, a 10-minute Farsi-language Q & A video segment with Alan Eyre, and provided training and production services for the U.S. Department of State to train Arabic and Farsi language Public Affairs Officers on how to communicate and interview with Arab and Farsi media. In conclusion, Mr. Conniff highlighted progress and activities in digital operations, including a single traffic record on alhurra.com.

IBB Director Dick Lobo announced, among other personnel matters, the first-ever "Spotlight on Excellence" Awards ceremony on November 28, where six language services from VOA or OCB were recognized for their great work based on the criteria used in the annual program

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

review process by the Office of Performance Review.

Phillip T. Balazs, IBB Deputy Director for Engineering and Transmission Services of the Office of Technology, Services and Innovation (TSI), provided brief highlights including the completion of installation of another transmitter in Afghanistan, continuing efforts to convert fiber and other communications circuits throughout the BBG global delivery network to more economical and versatile MPLS (Multi-Protocol Label Switching) connections, and the production of reports by TSI of its 2012 annual performance and FY 2012 accomplishments by each of its Directorate, Division and Branch.

Jeffrey Trimble, IBB Deputy Director, presented a brief report on FY 2013, FY 2014, and sequestration. For FY 2013, the Agency continues to operate on a Continuing Resolution that should go through the end of March. For FY 2014, OMB passback to the Agency was expected on or about January 2, 2013. Working with the broadcast entities, the Office of Chief Financial Officer continues to plan for budget reductions as they relate to sequestration.

Lynne Weil, Director of Communications and External Affairs, briefly summarized the following activities and events: Regular updates and briefings to the Congress on the arrest and eventual release of Antonio Rodiles, the Cuba-based independent producer of TV Martí's "Estado de SATS;" continuing efforts to publicize two Alhurra journalists who went missing in Syria and the eventual release of one journalist; coordination with IBB offices and all broadcast entities on the annual release of the Performance Accountability Report; production of sets, backdrops and Election 2012 on-air logos; and production of VOA 2013 Calendar.

Bruce Sherman, Director of Strategy and Development, distributed packets of trip reports produced by the Office of Strategy and Development. He highlighted some of the Office's accomplishments, including an agreement with Skynet for VOA to broadcast via direct-to-home satellite in Burma, new affiliations to grow the audience, and new development agreements with U.S. Agency for International Development and U.S. Department of State on health and other programming. Governors McCue and Ashe expressed their interests in receiving trip reports on a regular basis. At the request of Mr. Lobo, Mr. Sherman summarized a recent meeting in Berlin with the DG-5, comprising of western international broadcasters, to discuss cooperation and advancing common interests. He briefly explained about a recent gathering in Dubai for countries to discuss Internet policy and international communications policy.

Governor Ashe noted his prior visit with Mr. Ensor to the VOA Korean Service to recognize its 70th anniversary.

The Board accepted a request from Ann Noonan, Executive Director of Committee for U.S. International Broadcasting to speak for three minutes. The Board acknowledged that it was a one-time event but would discuss a policy on public speaking at Board meetings at a future Governance Committee meeting. Ms. Noonan spoke about the termination of employees from RFE/RL Russian and Kazakhtan Services. To that end, the Board suggested that Ms. Weil make a recommendation to the Governance Committee regarding a policy on public speaking at Board meetings.

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

There being no other business, the Alternate Presiding Governor adjourned the meeting. The Broadcasting Board of Governors agreed to the following decision elements (all decisions were adopted by a unanimous vote unless otherwise indicated):

1. Adoption of Minutes of October 11, 2012 Meeting. Governor Mulhaupt made a motion for the adoption of the minutes. Governor McCue seconded. The Board adopted the minutes of the October 11, 2012 meeting of the plenary Board as set forth in Attachment 2.
2. Adoption of Governance Committee Recommendations. The Board heard a briefing from Governor Mulhaupt on the recent meetings of the Governance Committee. The Board adopted the following recommendations by the Governance Committee:
  - a. BBG Travel Guidelines

Governor McCue made a motion for the adoption of the preliminary statement of guidelines for Governors and IBB/BBG senior management and staff as set forth in Attachment 3. Governor Ashe seconded. The motion passed unanimously.
  - b. Committee Reports

Governor Mulhaupt made a motion for the adoption of the reports of the Governance Committee meetings on March 7, March 9, and September 13, 2012 as set forth in Attachments 4, 5 and 6, respectively. Governor Ashe seconded. The motion passed unanimously.
  - c. Discussion of Creation, Role and Method of Appointment of CEO
    - i. That the Board note that the BBG Strategic Plan (adopted by the Board in October 2011) calls for the creation of the position of Chief Executive Officer (CEO) of United States international broadcasting (USIB). In its January 2012 decision, the Board decided to pursue legislation to restructure USIB called the International Broadcasting Innovation Act (IBIA), a central feature of which is the creation of a CEO of USIB.
    - ii. That the Board note its September 2012 decision to create a CEO under existing legislation on an interim basis pending passage of the IBIA.
    - iii. That the Board note that the IBB Director presented to the Committee a plan to create a CEO as required by the Board's September 2012 decision. The proposed plan addresses the following issues:
      - a. The authorities that should be delegated from the Board to the CEO;
      - b. The agency officers who should report directly to the CEO;
      - c. The relationship of the CEO and the IBB Director;
      - d. The relationship between the CEO and the Grantees, including how the relationship should be formalized and expressed in the grant agreements;

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

- e. The limits that should be placed on the CEO's authority to protect the integrity and independence of journalism conducted by the BBG-sponsored broadcasters;
  - f. A proposed budget and timeline for implementation of a CEO.
- iv. That the IBB Director direct the BBG Office of General Counsel to work with the General Counsels of the BBG-sponsored grantees to develop appropriate amendments to the grant agreements to effect the intent of the Board's September 2012 decision to empower the CEO to act as the day-to-day executive of BBG-sponsored U.S. international broadcasting, including both its federal and non-federal components, to the fullest extent permitted under existing law. Governor Mulhaupt made a motion for the adoption of this particular recommendation by the Committee. Governor McCue seconded. The motion passed unanimously.
- v. That the Board reaffirm its commitment to create a CEO under existing legislation. To this end, the Board authorizes and directs the Governance Committee to conduct a review of the IBB Director's plan and to make further recommendations regarding the details of the plan to the plenary Board. Governor Mulhaupt made a motion for the adoption of this particular recommendation by the Committee. Governor McCue seconded. The motion passed unanimously.
- d. Proposed BBG Meeting Dates in 2013  
Governor Mulhaupt made a motion to rescind the Board's previously adopted 2013 calendar and substitute the proposed BBG meeting dates in 2013 as set forth in Attachment 7. Governor McCue seconded. The motion passed unanimously.
3. Resolution Honoring Dana Perino. Governor Meehan moved to adopt the resolution thanking and honoring Dana Perino as set forth in Attachment 8. Governor McCue seconded. The resolution was adopted unanimously by the Board.
4. Resolution Honoring Maryjean Buhler. Governor Ashe moved to adopt the resolution thanking and honoring Maryjean Buhler, former Chief Financial Officer, as set forth in Attachment 9. Governor McCue seconded. The resolution was adopted unanimously by the Board.
5. Resolution Honoring John Lennon. Governor McCue moved to adopt the resolution thanking and honoring John Lennon, VOA Associate Director of Strategy and Planning, as set forth in Attachment 10. Governor Ashe seconded. The resolution was adopted unanimously by the Board.

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

### Other Attendees:

The following persons were also present during all or part of the meeting: International Broadcasting Bureau (IBB) Director Richard Lobo, IBB Deputy Director Jeffrey Trimble, IBB Chief of Staff Marie Lennon, Deputy General Counsel and Board Secretary Paul Kollmer-Dorsey, Director of Communications & External Affairs Lynne Weil, Director of Board Operations Oanh Tran, Congressional Coordinator Suzie Carroll, Director of Public Affairs Letitia King, IBB Director of Strategy and Development Bruce Sherman, IBB Research Manager Leah Ermarth, IBB Director of Performance Review Kelu Chao, and Ashley Lancaster on detail; Phillip T. Balazs, IBB Deputy Director for Engineering and Transmission Services of the Office of Technology, Services and Innovation; David Ensor, Director of the Voice of America (VOA); Carlos Garcia-Perez, Director of the Office of Cuba Broadcasting (OCB) via video conference; Steven Korn, President of Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty (RFE/RL); Libby Liu, President of Radio Free Asia (RFA); Brian Conniff, President of the Middle East Broadcasting Networks (MBN); Barbara Brady, VOA Chief of Staff; John Lennon, VOA Senior Advisor for Strategy; Steve Redisch, VOA Executive Editor; Rebecca McMenemy, VOA Acting Associate Director for Language Programming; William Marsh, VOA Senior Project Officer; John Giambalvo, RFE/RL Vice President and Chief Financial Officer; Benjamin Herman, RFE/RL Assistant Secretary; Julia Ragona, RFE/RL Vice President and Director of Content, Distribution and Marketing; Dale Cohen, RFE/RL Vice President of Administration; Brian Cullin, Senior Advisor on Intergovernmental Affairs to the Under Secretary for Public Diplomacy & Public Affairs; and Robert Torres, the Office of Inspector General's (OIG) Deputy Team Leader for the inspection of BBG.

### Witnessed:

---

Paul Kollmer-Dorsey  
Secretary

### Attachments:

1. Agenda for December 14, 2012 Meeting
2. Minutes of October 11, 2012 Meeting
3. BBG Travel Guidelines
4. Governance Committee Report from March 7, 2012 Meeting
5. Governance Committee Report from March 9, 2012 Meeting
6. Governance Committee Report from September 13, 2012 Meeting
7. Proposed BBG Meeting Dates in 2013
8. Resolution Honoring Dana Perino
9. Resolution Honoring Maryjean Buhler
10. Resolution Honoring John Lennon

# Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

ATTACHMENT 1

## BROADCASTING BOARD OF GOVERNORS December 2012 Meeting Agenda

Friday, December 14

---

**1:00 – 3:00**                      **Broadcasting Board of Governors' Open Meeting**

### **I. Open Session**

Presiding Governor's Remarks

- A. Adoption of Minutes of October 11, 2012 Meeting
  - B. Governance Committee Report  
(Governor Mulhaupt)
  - C. Strategy & Budget Committee Report  
(Governor Meehan)
  - D. Resolution Honoring Dana Perino  
(Governors McCue, Meehan)
  - E. Resolution Honoring Maryjean Buhler  
(Governor Ashe)
  - F. Resolution Honoring John Lennon  
(Governor McCue)
  - G. Programming Initiatives/Program Development
    - OCB Director's Report  
(Carlos Garcia-Perez via video link)
    - VOA Director's Report  
(David Ensor)
    - RFE/RL President's Report  
(Steve Korn)
    - RFA President's Report  
(Libby Liu)
    - MBN President's Report  
(Brian Conniff)
  - H. IBB Director's Report  
(Dick Lobo)
    - Technology, Services and Innovation Director's Report  
(Andre Mendes)
    - Fiscal Report  
(Jeffrey Trimble)
    - Communications & External Affairs Director's Report  
(Lynne Weil)
    - Strategy & Development Director's Report  
(Bruce Sherman)
  - I. Burma Trip Report  
(Governors Meehan, McCue, Ashe)
  - J. Recognition of Language Services' Anniversaries  
(Governor Ashe)
  - K. Other Items for Consideration at Next Board Meeting
- 



## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

### ATTACHMENT 2

From: Broadcasting Board of Governors  
Date: October 11, 2012  
Subject: **Minutes of the BBG Meeting of October 11, 2012**

The Broadcasting Board of Governors (BBG) met today at BBG Headquarters in Washington, D.C. The meeting was attended by members of the public and was also open for public observation via streaming on the BBG website.

The meeting was attended by the following Board members:

Presiding Governor Michael Lynton  
Alternate Presiding Governor Dennis Mulhaupt  
Governor Victor Ashe  
Governor Susan McCue  
Governor Michael Meehan  
Governor Dana Perino (via telephone)

Under Secretary for Public Diplomacy & Public Affairs Tara Sonenshine was not in attendance at the meeting.

Other persons in attendance are listed at the end of these minutes.

The agenda of the meeting is set forth in Attachment 1.

Presiding Governor Lynton called the meeting to order and noted that, in February 2012, the Board designated him to serve as “Presiding Governor” on an interim basis.

The Presiding Governor announced that the meeting was being held in compliance with the Government in the Sunshine Act and streamed live over the Internet at the BBG website. He noted the absence of Under Secretary for Public Diplomacy & Public Affairs Tara Sonenshine and welcomed Governor Perino’s participation by telephone.

Presiding Governor Lynton expressed the Board’s concern over the recent disruption of broadcast signals carrying U.S. government-sponsored international news and information across several continents. He reported that Eutelsat, a European satellite operator, had confirmed that intermittent interference on October 3 and 4 was traced to Iran. In addition to Voice of America’s (VOA) Persian service and Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty’s (RFE/RL) Radio Farda, the jamming affected dozens of satellite broadcasts of BBG radio and TV programs on the Eutelsat satellites, including Arabic, Georgian, Armenian, Bosnian, Korean and many other broadcasts. On behalf of the Board, the Presiding Governor called on Iran to cease disrupting

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

broadcast signals, and to respect the well-established international agreements that prohibit jamming.

In addition, the Presiding Governor stated that the Board condemns the harassment and intimidation of BBG journalists abroad by police and government officials. He noted the following: Marthe Van Der Wolf, a VOA reporter in Ethiopia, was forced to erase recordings that she had made of a protest rally by local police; Gulnur Kazimova was prevented from taking pictures and was physically blocked from attending a public event by Azerbaijani officials; Radio Free Asia (RFA) and VOA reporters were summoned to a meeting with government officials in a blatant attempt to discourage objective reporting on the Cambodian government; and journalists in Belarus, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan, and Libya have been harassed and prevented from doing their work. On behalf of the Board, the Presiding Governor called on governments to cease the intimidation of journalists, and to hold responsible those who try to obstruct their reporting.

Presiding Governor Lynton noted that Alhurra journalists Bashar Fahmi and Cüneyt Ünal are still missing in Syria. He said the Board is deeply disturbed by the lack of information and is increasingly concerned about the well-being of the missing journalists. On behalf of the Board, the Presiding Governor demanded their immediate release.

The Board considered a correction by Governor Mulhaupt on the minutes of the September 13, 2012 meeting. Governor Mulhaupt clarified that materials related to the International Broadcasting Innovation Act including the creation of a Chief Executive Officer for United States international broadcasting, the legislative initiative which the Board voted to pursue in January 2012, are not subject to the Board's policy regarding non-disclosure of deliberative information.

The Board considered Governor Ashe's suggestions for the proposed BBG meeting dates through May 2013. For scheduling purposes, the Board adopted the dates and agreed to hold the March 2013 Board meeting at Office of Cuba Broadcasting (OCB) headquarters in Miami. The Board also agreed that the Governance Committee would consider other Board meeting dates beyond May 2013.

At the Presiding Governor's invitation, VOA Director David Ensor announced the recent retirement of Leo Sarkisian and described his extraordinary work for the popular English-language "Music Time in Africa" radio program. Governor McCue introduced a resolution in the briefing book honoring Mr. Sarkisian for his invaluable contributions to VOA more than 49 years ago.

The Board viewed a brief video compilation of the winners for the David Burke Distinguished Journalism Awards. Presiding Governor Lynton presented awards to the following broadcasters: the late Mukarram Khan Aatif of VOA's Deewa Radio; Karen Caballero of OCB; Sailab Mahsud of RFE/RL's Radio Mashaal; RFA Korean Service; and Mohamed Moawad and Lamia Rezgui Bouroogaa of Middle East Broadcasting Networks' (MBN) Radio Sawa.

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

Before turning to the RFE/RL President for his report, Presiding Governor Lynton said noted that Russia is a key strategic priority for RFE/RL and the BBG. He noted the Board's objection to Russia's "Law on Mass Media" which becomes effective on November 10 and represents a significant tightening on the free flow of information in Russia. He reiterated the Board's support for the efforts by RFE/RL management to keep audiences in Russia and elsewhere apprised of the news in spite of the Russian government's efforts to restrict it.

RFE/RL President Steve Korn then updated the Board on the situation in Russia and provided information on plans for its Russian service and office in Moscow to focus on a new strategy in digital media in order to adapt to the changed conditions. He noted that RFE/RL would need time to transform and retool as it embarks on this new strategy and expressed his confidence about the future. Governor Meehan commented that the Strategy and Budget Committee would meet soon to discuss the new research on Russia and U.S. international broadcasting efforts there. Governor Ashe expressed his concerns for the actions taken by RFE/RL to terminate employees and for the direction RFE/RL is heading, but noted that the Board has had robust discussions internally about the issues. In response to Governor McCue's question, Messrs. Korn and Ensor described examples of the collaboration between RFE/RL and VOA in Russia. Governor McCue indicated that a few Board members may take a trip in January 2013 to survey the situation in Russia. Mr. Korn acknowledged and said that an event is planned in late January for the opening of its new facility in Russia. The Presiding Governor asked Mr. Korn to report to the Board at its next meeting on plans for any further reductions in Prague.

Joining the meeting by video conference, OCB Director Carlos Garcia-Perez gave his report. Mr. Garcia-Perez congratulated Karen Caballero and all winners of the David Burke Awards. He reported that blogger Yoani Sanchez was briefly jailed in Cuba for reporting on an important trial in Bayamo and had been transported back to Havana so she could no longer report on the trial. He announced that OCB's website had the highest increase in the last few days, receiving over 12,000 hits per day. To give examples of sharing resources, Mr. Garcia-Perez noted the filing of a report for Alhurra by an OCB reporter from Venezuela and the coverage of the Republican and Democratic conventions. He then played a short video of OCB's coverage of the Republican and Democratic conventions and the Presidential elections in Venezuela.

VOA Director Ensor began his report by highlighting a visit to VOA headquarters by Burmese opposition leader and Nobel Peace Prize winner Aung San Suu Kyi and showing photographs of her visit, including those with Governors Meehan and Ashe. Mr. Ensor elaborated on the jamming by Iran which affected not only just the Persian-language programs but most of BBG broadcasts on the HotBird satellite. Mr. Ensor thanked the Board for its support by making public announcements condemning jamming. He noted that Eutelsat had appealed to the International Telecommunications Union about the jamming. Governor Ashe noted that Aung San Suu Kyi also visited RFA headquarters where Board participation included Governors Meehan and McCue and himself. In response to Governor Ashe's question, Mr. Ensor explained that while *Parazit* show remains in suspension due to some personnel matters, *OnTen (Antenna)* show is gaining attention and building audience for VOA Persian News Network.

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

Governor Meehan said that, on his recent trip to the Middle East with MBN President Brian Conniff and Communications and External Affairs Director Lynne Weil, they met with the leader of the Iran Regional Presence Office in Dubai who had high praises for U.S. international broadcasting efforts there. Governor Meehan expanded on his trip and noted that he was attending a conference in Saudi Arabia to deliver remarks on Global Internet Freedom efforts. In closing, Governor Meehan thanked Mr. Conniff, Ms. Weil and other staff members for organizing the trip and for preparing his speech right up to the last minute.

In the absence of RFA President Libby Liu, Dan Southerland, RFA Executive Editor, thanked Governor Lynton and the Board for their statement of support for its broadcasts in Cambodia. He highlighted RFA's coverage of the plight of the Rohingya in Burma and played a short video clip of the coverage and previewed RFA's special Rohingya hub page on its English website with continuously postings of information and updated news stories on the violence.

Presiding Governor Lynton announced that he would depart in a short while and asked Alternate Presiding Governor Mulhaupt to preside for the rest of the meeting.

MBN President Brian Conniff stated that his Middle East trip was already reported by Governor Meehan and that there was nothing to add to his written report. He echoed Presiding Governor Lynton's remarks concerning Alhurra journalists Bashar Fahmi and Cüneyt Ünal who are missing in Syria and said MBN's top priority is their release and will continue to follow all available leads in the region.

Governor Ashe updated the Board on his visits to VOA Kurdish and Swahili Services to present their service anniversary certificate. He briefly highlighted their programming efforts and invited Fakhria Jawhary, Chief of Kurdish Service, and Mwamoyo Hamza, Chief of Swahili Service, to give brief remarks on their milestone.

International Broadcasting Bureau (IBB) Director Dick Lobo announced the departure of Chief Financial Officer (CFO) Maryjean Buhler. Governor Ashe suggested a resolution for Ms. Buhler at the next Board meeting.

Mr. Lobo highlighted recent events at the Cohen Building, including the National Hispanic American Heritage and the presentation of annual Gold Medal Awards to employees. He informed the Board that the Agency had entered into a project with the Partnership for Public Service to help improve workplace morale at the BBG, and as a deliverable, a report will be produced focusing on major challenges and action plans to be developed by senior management and the workforce in order to make measurable improvements in the workplace. Governor Ashe urged that contractors be included as well.

Andre Mendes, Director of the Office of Technology, Services, and Innovation (TSI), gave an update on the implementation of a single content management system by expanding Pangea across the broadcast entities as approved by the Board almost a year ago. He said that the migration over to Pangea for participating broadcast entities was completed in August 2012, meeting or exceeding timelines with significant cost savings. In response to questions by

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

Governors Mulhaupt and McCue, Mr. Mendes replied that VOA, OCB, MBN, and RFE/RL are currently utilizing Pangea, and that RFA had chosen not to participate. Several Governors asked for a report from RFA President Liu regarding RFA's decision not to participate in Pangea. Mr. Mendes reported on the progress to install FMs in Afghanistan and Libya as well as to rebuild FM affiliates in Haiti. In conclusion, Mr. Mendes played a webcast demonstrating the signal quality of transmission of VOA programs into China from Telstar 18 on the Ku-band. At the request of Governor Ashe, Mr. Mendes updated the Board on the status of the Edward R. Murrow Transmitting Station in Greenville, North Carolina. Governor McCue requested a briefing on mobile technology initiatives at the BBG and their effectiveness at the next Board meeting.

CFO Maryjean Buhler gave a fiscal report. Ms. Buhler noted that FY 2012 was successfully closed out, and that a Continuing Resolution went into effect in FY 2013 for approximately six months. She added that the President's report on sequestration had been released and that the percentage reduction for the BBG is 8.2 percent if implemented in January 2013. For FY 2014, Ms. Buhler stated that the BBG's Budget Request was submitted to the Office of Management and Budget on October 21, 2012 and thanked the budget staff for their hard work in the late hours and through the weekends in order to prepare the final budget document. Alternate Presiding Governor Mulhaupt echoed Ms. Buhler's appreciation for the staff and acknowledged that it was a very difficult budget process. On behalf of the Board, Governor Ashe expressed appreciation for Ms. Buhler's tenure at the BBG.

Ms. Weil highlighted the activities of the Office of Communications & External Affairs and referred the Board to the IBB Director's written report for details. She noted, among other developments, the Office's collaboration with Congressional staff to pursue passage of legislation regarding the domestic dissemination ban in the Smith-Mundt Act, and its coordination with RFE/RL in order to provide updates to Congressional staff regarding RFE/RL's Russian Service. The Office organized Governor Meehan's trip to the Middle East to meet with various officials and assisted Governor Meehan with his speech at the Saudi Broadcasting Business Forum. The Office hosted a panel of experts at the Cohen Building to discuss developments in Russia and sent Public Affairs Director Tish King to Syracuse University's Newhouse School of Public Communications and Maxwell School of International Affairs for a day to do in-person outreach with faculty and students. In conclusion, Ms. Weil introduced Suzie Carroll as an addition to the staff to serve as BBG Congressional Coordinator.

There being no other business, the Alternate Presiding Governor adjourned the meeting.

The Broadcasting Board of Governors agreed to the following decision elements (all decisions were adopted by a unanimous vote unless otherwise indicated):

1. Adoption of Minutes of September 13, 2012 Meeting. A correction was proposed by Governor Mulhaupt. Governor Lynton seconded. The Board adopted the corrected minutes of September 13, 2012 meeting as set forth in Attachment 2.

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

2. Adoption of Proposed BBG Meeting Dates in 2013. Governor Ashe made a motion to adopt the proposed BBG meeting dates from January to May 2013. Governor Mulhaupt seconded the motion. The Board adopted the first motion. Governors Ashe made a second motion to hold the meeting in March in Miami, Florida. Governor Mulhaupt seconded the motion. The proposed BBG meeting dates from January to May in 2013 were adopted by the Board as set forth in Attachment 3.
  
3. Resolution Honoring Leo Sarkisian. Governor McCue made a motion for the adoption of a draft resolution thanking and honoring Leo Sarkisian. Governor Meehan seconded. The Board adopted the resolution honoring Leo Sarkisian for his 49 years of service and contributions to U.S. international broadcasting as set forth in Attachment 4.

### Other Attendees:

The following persons were also present during all or part of the meeting: International Broadcasting Bureau (IBB) Director Richard Lobo, IBB Deputy Director Jeffrey Trimble, IBB Chief of Staff Marie Lennon, Deputy General Counsel and Board Secretary Paul Kollmer-Dorsey, Chief Financial Officer Maryjean Buhler, Director of Communications & External Affairs Lynne Weil, Director of Board Operations Oanh Tran, Congressional Coordinator Suzie Carroll, Director of Public Affairs Letitia King, Jay Tolson on IPA from RFE/RL, Deputy Chief Financial Officer MelaJo Kubacki, Assistant General Counsel (Ethics and Compliance) Andrew Krog, Ashley Lancaster on detail, and Executive Assistant to the IBB Director Douglas Schuette; David Ensor, Director of the Voice of America (VOA); Carlos Garcia-Perez, Director of the Office of Cuba Broadcasting (OCB) via video conference; Steven Korn, President of Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty (RFE/RL); Brian Conniff, President of the Middle East Broadcasting Networks (MBN); Barbara Brady, VOA Chief of Staff; John Lennon, VOA Senior Advisor for Strategy; Stephen McGinley, VOA Congressional Liaison; William Marsh, VOA Senior Project Officer; Spozhmai Maiwandi, VOA Director of South Asia Division; Leo Sarkisian, VOA founder of *Music Time in Africa*; Fakhria Jawhary, VOA Chief of Kurdish Service; Mwamoyo Hamza, VOA Chief of Swahili Service; Kyle King, VOA Senior Editor for Public Relations; Bruna Ladeira, VOA Student Trainee for Public Relations; Andre Mendes, IBB Director of the Office of Technology, Services, and Innovation; Karen Caballero, OCB Internet Team Leader for News Division; Dan Southerland, Vice President of Programming/Executive Editor for Radio Free Asia (RFA); Max Kwak, RFA Chief of Korean Service; Bernadette Burns, RFA General Counsel; Norman Thompson, RFA Vice President of Administration and Finance; Kelley Sullivan, MBN Vice President of Administration; Anne Noble, MBN General Counsel; Mohamed Moawad, MBN Correspondent for Radio Sawa; Lamia Rezgoui Bourogaa, MBN Correspondent for Radio Sawa; Elizabeth Portale, RFE/RL Chief of Staff; John Giambalvo, RFE/RL Vice President and Chief Financial Officer; Benjamin Herman, RFE/RL Assistant Secretary; Brian Cullin, Senior Advisor on Intergovernmental Affairs to the Under Secretary for Public Diplomacy & Public Affairs; and the Office of Inspector General's (OIG) Inspection Team for the inspection of BBG, including Team Leader Ambassador Kenton Keith, Deputy Team Leader Robert Torres, and Martha "Marcy" Goode.

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

Approved:

---

Michael Lynton  
Presiding Governor

Witnessed:

---

Paul Kollmer-Dorsey  
Secretary

Attachments:

1. Agenda for October 11, 2012 Meeting
2. Minutes of September 13, 2012 Meeting
3. Proposed BBG Meeting Dates for 2013
4. Resolution Honoring Leo Sarkisian

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

ATTACHMENT 3

### **Preliminary Statement of Guidelines for Governors and IBB/BBG Senior Management and Staff Travel**

The following is a preliminary statement of principles and guidelines for BBG Governors and IBB/BBG senior management and staff travel.

BBG Governor and IBB/BBG senior management and staff travel should be linked to the Agency's strategic plan and/or BBG needs in support of objectives that are clearly defined before the trip.

In consultation with Governors and entity directors, BBG management and staff will develop a priority list of travel targets consistent with the strategic plan. This list will be reviewed at subsequent Board meetings.

The full Board will be notified in advance of Governor(s)' travel and the IBB Director will be notified of IBB/BBG senior management and staff travel.

Governors and IBB/BBG senior management will report on completed travel, including purpose and outcomes where appropriate. BBG senior management and staff will report on upcoming staff travel as appropriate and judicious.

Entity heads and IBB/BBG senior management should be consulted regarding regional priorities and strategic perspectives that should be considered in planning of Governors' travel.

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

ATTACHMENT 4

### REPORT OF THE BBG GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE MEETING

**Members:** Governor Dennis Mulhaupt, Committee Chair  
Governor Victor Ashe, Committee Member  
Governor Michael Lynton, Committee Member  
Governor Susan McCue, Committee Member

**Meeting Date:** Wednesday, March 7, 2012

**Venue:** BBG Headquarters, Washington D.C.

This meeting of the Governance Committee took place on March 7, 2012 at BBG Headquarters. Governor Dennis Mulhaupt chaired the proceedings. Governor Victor Ashe and Governor Susan McCue were also in attendance. Governor Michael Lynton was not in attendance. Governor Michael Meehan attended a portion of the meeting to contribute to the discussion on the Freedom2Connect Foundation.

The agenda of the meeting is set forth in Attachment 1 to this report.

Based on its deliberations, the Governance Committee makes the following recommendations to the plenary Board:

#### **Freedom2Connect Foundation**

---

- That the plenary Board note that the Governance Committee received a briefing from the President of Radio Free Asia (RFA) on the relationship between RFA and the Freedom2Connect Foundation. The President reported to the Committee that the Freedom2Connect Foundation is an entirely independent and separate legal entity from Radio Free Asia and is not connected in any way to United States international broadcasting. On that basis, the Committee concluded that there is no oversight role for the Board of Governors to play with respect to the foundation.
- That the plenary Board note that, with respect to grantee fund-raising, Article IX of the grant agreement adopted by the Board in September 2011 states:

*Grantee may not engage in fundraising from other sources except in accordance with the principles of fundraising to be agreed by BBG and Grantee. Grantee is prohibited from using any Federal funds to finance its fundraising efforts.*

- That the plenary Board direct the International Broadcasting Bureau (IBB) Director to work with appropriate representatives of each BBG-sponsored grantee to develop a set of

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

fundraising principles that meets the standard required by Article IX of the grant agreement.

### Role of the Presiding Governor

---

- **Discussion of Authorities of the Presiding Governor**

- That the Board note the February 11, 2012 decision of the plenary Board during a special telephonic meeting to appoint Governor Michael Lynton as the “Presiding Governor” on an interim basis until such time as the Board select an alternate presiding Governor, Governor Lynton chooses to step down as Presiding Governor, or a new Chairman is appointed by the White House and confirmed by the Senate.
- That the Board agree to the following statement of the authorities of the Presiding Governor:
  - The Presiding Governor shall exercise the roles and authorities of the Chair of the Board, as such roles and authorities are defined in these By-Laws and the decisions of the Board.<sup>2</sup>

In the event that the Board appoints a Presiding Governor, the Presiding Governor may select an Alternate Presiding Governor with the approval of the plenary Board. The Alternate Presiding Governor shall have the authority to perform the duties of the Presiding Governor in the event the Presiding Governor is absent from a meeting or is otherwise unable to perform his or her duties.<sup>3</sup>
- That the plenary Board agree to appointing Governor Dennis Mulhaupt as the Alternate Presiding Governor.<sup>4</sup>
- That the plenary Board direct the IBB Director to draft and submit an amendment to the By-Laws to reflect the roles and authorities of the Presiding Governor for consideration by the Board at the April 2012 meeting of the plenary Board.

### Future Structure of United States International Broadcasting

---

- **Update on Grantee Consolidation**

- That the plenary Board note that the Governance Committee received a briefing from Brian Conniff, the Board’s designated Project Leader and President of Middle East Broadcasting Networks, on the status of the Grantee consolidation, which included the following points:

---

<sup>2</sup> Adopted by the plenary Board at the March 8, 2012 Board Meeting.

<sup>3</sup> Adopted by the plenary Board at the March 8, 2012 Board Meeting.

<sup>4</sup> Adopted by the plenary Board at the March 8, 2012 Board Meeting.

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

- The grantees continue to meet in working groups for human resources, communication, technology, finance, legal, and administration on a weekly basis.
- The heads of the working groups will meet the week of March 19, 2012 to compile their findings and produce a draft consolidation transaction plan with a timeline and a proposed implementation budget for consideration by the IBB Director and the Board at the April 2012 meeting of the plenary Board.
- **Update on International Broadcasting Innovation Act (IBIA)**
  - That the plenary Board note that the Governance Committee received a briefing from Lynne Weil, the Director of the Office of Communications and External Affairs, which included the following points:
    - The Agency has continued its outreach efforts with Congress, most recently meeting with the Senate foreign relations staff and the Senate Foreign Relations and the Senate Appropriations staff.
    - The meetings with Congressional stakeholders have emphasized the importance of receiving input and ideas for the eventual drafting of the International Broadcasting Innovation Act.
    - The IBB Director continues to work with staff, with the guidance of Governor McCue, to develop recommendations for a draft IBIA in a manner consistent with the January 2012 Board decision.

### **Governance Committee Housekeeping Matters**

---

- **Adoption of November 2011 Governance Committee Report, including the Protocol for Release of Material from Closed Board Meetings<sup>5</sup>**
  - That the plenary Board adopt the report of the November 17, 2011 Governance Committee (included in Attachment 2) noting that it includes the protocol for release of materials from closed Board meetings. The Committee considered the protocol at the November 2011 meeting and an updated version at the February meeting. The proposed protocol is included in Attachment 3. As stated in the November 2011 Governance Committee report, the plenary Board should direct the Board Secretary to incorporate the protocol into the BBG By-Laws for adoption by the Board.

---

<sup>5</sup> Adopted by the plenary Board at the March 8, 2012 Board Meeting.

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

- **Adoption of February 2012 Governance Committee Report<sup>6</sup>**
  - That the plenary Board adopt the report of the February 9, 2012 Governance Committee meeting. The report is included in Attachment 4.
  
- **Discussion of BBG Committee Membership**
  - That the plenary Board note that membership of BBG committees requires a decision by the plenary Board.
  
  - That the plenary Board adopt the following Committee rosters<sup>7</sup>:
    - The Communications and Outreach Committee is co-chaired by Governors McCue, Meehan, and Perino. The Communications and Outreach Committee has a sub-committee on Global Internet Freedom co-chaired by Governors Meehan and Perino and a sub-committee on Innovation chaired by Governor McCue.
  
    - The Governance Committee is chaired by Governor Mulhaupt. Governors Ashe, Lynton, and McCue are members of the Governance Committee.
  
    - The Strategy and Budget Committee is co-chaired by Governors Meehan and Wimbush. Governor Ashe is a member of the Committee.
  
  - That the plenary Board direct the IBB Staff to submit a By-Law amendment providing that the Chair is a non-voting *ex officio* member of each Committee of the BBG Board for consideration by the plenary Board at the April 2012 Board meeting.<sup>8</sup>
  
- **Discussion about BBG Resolution on 2012 BBG Policy Statements on Equal Employment Opportunity and Sexual Harassment**

The Committee discussed policy statements on equal employment opportunity and sexual harassment and decided to defer further consideration until the next meeting of the Governance Committee.

---

<sup>6</sup> Adopted by the plenary Board at the March 8, 2012 Board Meeting.

<sup>7</sup> Adopted by the plenary Board at the March 8, 2012 Board Meeting.

<sup>8</sup> Adopted by the plenary Board at the March 8, 2012 Board Meeting.

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

### ATTACHMENT 1

## MEETING OF THE BBG GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE

March 7, 2012

4:00-5:30 PM

BBG Conference Room

**Members**  
Governor Dennis Mulhaupt, Committee Chair  
Governor Victor Ashe, Committee Member  
Governor Michael Lynton, Committee Member  
Governor Susan McCue, Committee Member

### AGENDA

*Preliminary Topic*     **Radio Free Asia's Freedom2Connect Foundation**

*Agenda Topic 1*     **Role of the Presiding Governor**

- Discussion of Authorities of the Presiding Governor
- Amending BBG By-Laws to Reflect Presiding Governor's Authorities

*Agenda Topic 2*     **Future Structure of United States International Broadcasting**

- Update on Grantee Consolidation
- Update on International Broadcasting Innovation Act

*Agenda Topic 3*     **Governance Committee Housekeeping Matters**

- Adoption of November 2011 Governance Committee Report, including the Protocol for Release of Material from Closed Board Meetings
- Adoption of February 2012 Governance Committee Report
- Protocol for Governors Who are Contacted by Individual Employees and Contractors
- Discussion of BBG Committee Membership
- Discussion about BBG Resolution on 2012 BBG Policy Statements on Equal Employment Opportunity and Sexual Harassment

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

### ATTACHMENT 2

[ATTACHMENTS HAVE BEEN REMOVED]

### REPORT OF THE BBG GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE<sup>9</sup>

**Members:** Walter Isaacson, Chair of the Broadcasting Board of Governors (*ex officio*)  
Governor Dennis Mulhaupt, Committee Chair  
Governor Victor Ashe, Committee Member  
Governor Michael Lynton, Committee Member

**Meeting Date:** Thursday, November 17, 2011

**Venue:** BBG Headquarters, Washington D.C.

This meeting of the Governance Committee took place on November 17, 2011 at BBG Headquarters. Governor Dennis Mulhaupt chaired the proceedings. Governor Victor Ashe was also in attendance. BBG Chair Walter Isaacson and Governor Michael Lynton were not in attendance.

The agenda of the meeting is set forth in Attachment 1 to this report.

Based on its deliberations, the Governance Committee makes the following recommendations to the plenary Board:

#### **Adoption of September 2011 Governance Committee Report**

---

- That the plenary Board adopt the September 14, 2011 Governance Committee report in its entirety, noting that the plenary Board already adopted a number of recommendations individually at its September 15, 2011 Board meeting. The September 2011 Governance Committee report is included in Attachment 2.

#### **Board Meetings<sup>10</sup>**

---

- The Committee considered the 2012 Board Meeting schedule and, more generally, the structure of Board meetings.
- That the plenary Board note its existing decisions to establish a Committee structure in order to focus and facilitate Board consideration of strategic and high-level operational issues and its November 2010 decision that “[i]n order to take advantage of BBG staff resources as efficiently as possible, individual Governors should endeavor, where

---

<sup>9</sup> Adopted by the plenary Board at the March 8, 2012 Board Meeting.

<sup>10</sup> The Board adopted a revised 2012 BBG meeting schedule by notation vote in December 2011. The revised schedule is set forth in Attachment 5.

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

possible, to raise new issues and requests for information as agenda items within the Board's existing committee structure..."

- That the plenary Board note the September 15, 2011 Board decision directing the IBB Director to develop a protocol for producing minutes for all future closed meetings of the plenary Board and releasing to the public such portions of the minutes as may be lawful and prudent to release. The Board also specified that the protocol should involve a mechanism for interested Governors to review the minutes prior to their release.
- That the plenary Board adopt the proposed protocol for the release of materials from closed meetings which is consistent with the requirements of the Government in the Sunshine Act. The proposed protocol is included in Attachment 3. The plenary Board should direct the Board Secretary to incorporate the protocol into the BBG By-Laws for adoption by the Board.

### Joint Audit Committee for Grantees

---

- The Committee considered Audit Committees composed of the same individual Governors for each BBG-sponsored Grantee. The Committee deferred continued consideration to a later time.

### Use of Contractors at BBG

---

- That the Committee note that the Agency's mission requires operational nimbleness and technological expertise which the BBG can achieve only by being able to adjust its workforce through a mix of full-time employees and contractors.
- That the Committee encourage the IBB Director to continue taking steps to address the concerns of contractors and other problems associated with their use, and note the IBB Director is carrying out a detailed assessment of the number and use of contractors at the Agency and seeking information on issues affecting contractors to better enable the Agency to address the problems involved.

Other attendees: Richard Lobo, IBB Director; Jeffrey Trimble, BBG Executive Director; Marie Lennon, IBB Chief of Staff; Jack Welch, IBB Senior Adviser; Paul Kollmer-Dorsey, IBB Staff and Board Secretary; Maryjean Buhler, Chief Financial Officer; Oanh Tran, Special Projects Officer; Ashley Pyle, Board Operations and Policy Adviser; David Ensor, VOA Director; Barbara Brady, VOA Chief of Staff; Bernadette Burns, RFA General Counsel; Richard Smith, RFA Budget Director; Michael Marchetti, RFE/RL Chief Financial Officer; Ben Herman, RFE/RL Assistant General Counsel; Kelley Sullivan, MBN Vice President for Administration; Anne Noble, MBN General Counsel; and Andrew Krog, Assistant General Counsel.

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

### ATTACHMENT 3

#### PROPOSED PROTOCOL FOR RELEASE OF MATERIALS FROM CLOSED BOARD MEETINGS<sup>11</sup>

Closed Board meetings, or closed portions of open Board meetings, shall be recorded, either via video with audio, audio only, or by stenographer. The Board Secretary will create a complete record of the closed proceedings (either a verbatim transcript or unabridged recording, at the Board Secretary's discretion) in draft form within three (3) business days of a closed meeting or session; for meetings recorded by stenographer, a transcript should be obtained from the stenographer within three (3) business days.

The Board Secretary will highlight statements, testimony, or other information that may be subject to withholding from public release under the Government in the Sunshine Act (GISA) within three (3) business days. Interested Governors shall be provided a copy of the draft complete record to review not later than ten (10) calendar days after a closed meeting or session and should return the draft complete record with comments to the Board Secretary within five (5) business days.

The Board Secretary will finalize the complete record for legal sufficiency and compliance with the GISA and coordinate with Public Affairs for posting to the Agency's public website. The entire process should be completed in fewer than twenty-one (21) calendar days.

The Board Secretary shall maintain the original complete draft record and/or complete unabridged electronic recording of each meeting or portion of a meeting closed to the public for at least two years after such meeting, or until one year after the conclusion of any Board proceeding with respect to which the meeting or portion was held, whichever occurs later. After the applicable holding period expires, the Board Secretary shall dispose of such records in accordance with the Agency's applicable document retention schedule.

Once materials from closed Board meetings have been made available to the public, there is no requirement to maintain their availability beyond initial release. However, materials released to the public should generally be kept publically available on the Agency's website as long as space and funding permits.

---

<sup>11</sup> The proposed protocol for release of materials from closed Board meetings was discussed at the November 17, 2011 and February 9, 2012 Governance Committee meetings. This protocol reflects the protocol considered by the Committee and adopted by the Board at the April 2012 meeting.

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

### ATTACHMENT 4

[ATTACHMENTS HAVE BEEN REMOVED]

### REPORT OF THE BBG GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE<sup>12</sup>

February 9, 2012

2:00 – 5:00 EDT

BBG Conference Room

**Members** Governor Dennis Mulhaupt, Committee Chair  
Governor Victor Ashe, Committee Member  
Governor Michael Lynton, Committee Member  
Governor Susan McCue, Committee Member

This meeting of the Governance Committee took place on February 9, 2012 at BBG Headquarters. Governor Dennis Mulhaupt chaired the proceedings. Governor Victor Ashe was also in attendance. Governor Michael Lynton and Governor Susan McCue participated in the meeting via telephone.

The agenda of the meeting is set forth in Attachment 1 to this report.

Based on its deliberations, the Governance Committee makes the following recommendations to the plenary Board:

#### **Discussion to Frame Issues Concerning Use of Human Capital within BBG-Funded United States International Broadcasting**

- The Committee noted the IBB Director's proposed protocol for the March 2012 Governance Committee discussion concerning BBG employee morale and related issues and the use of contractors at BBG.
- Drawing from the IBB Director's proposal, the Committee discussed the most effective and appropriate manner for handling the discussion at the March 2012 meeting of the Governance Committee and agreed on the protocol included in Attachment 2.
- The Committee heard from the Chief Financial Officer and noted that in 2011, three percent (3%) of payments to contractors were delayed. The Committee recommends that the plenary Board direct the IBB Director to develop a protocol for making timely and consistent payments for contracted services, which should include transitioning to an electronic system for processing and receiving payments. The IBB Director is requested to implement an electronic system by Thanksgiving 2012.

---

<sup>12</sup> Adopted by the plenary Board at the March 8, 2012 Board Meeting.

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

### Future Structure of United States International Broadcasting: Grantee Consolidation

---

- The plenary Board announced its intention at the January 2012 Board meeting to issue the three grants which BBG currently makes separately to Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty (RFE/RL), Radio Free Asia (RFA) and Middle East Broadcasting Networks (MBN) to a single, consolidated Grantee (when created) subject to Administration approval, Congressional consultation and guidance, and other due diligence and the implementation of a consolidation transaction plan approved by the Board.
- The Board instructed the IBB Director, working with Governor Mulhaupt, to develop a plan for structuring, documenting, and implementing a grantee consolidation transaction, including the conduct of adequate due diligence and secure the services of legal and other experts who may be required to assist in the transaction. The Board requested the IBB Director to provide such a plan, and a proposed budget for its implementation, to the Board for its consideration at the March 2012 Board meeting.<sup>13</sup>
- The Board also authorized and encouraged the IBB Director to work in close cooperation with the Grantees. The Board authorized the IBB Director to work with Brian Conniff, President of MBN, who will act as project leader for the consolidation, in preparing the requested plan. The Board directed and encouraged all elements of USIB to cooperate fully with the IBB Director in facilitating the timely and accurate completion of the requested plan and budget.
- That the plenary Board note that the Governance Committee received a briefing from Brian Conniff on the status of the Grantee consolidation, which included the following points:
  - Working groups comprised of professionals from each BBG-sponsored Grantees (RFE/RL, RFA and MBN) have been established to collect and provide information needed to develop a plan for a grantee consolidation transaction. Six working groups were formed for the following functional areas: administrative/facilities, human resources, legal, communications, financial/budget, and technology.
  - Each working group is tasked with identifying activities and functions that need to be addressed in order to achieve consolidation, potential obstacles to planning and implementation, and strategies to overcome obstacles. The working groups will also estimate transaction costs arising from consolidation, and propose a functional structure, staffing levels, and budget for the consolidated grantee.
  - Deloitte Consulting, LLP, has been engaged to review the working groups' input and to make suggestions on how to best proceed.

---

<sup>13</sup> The IBB Director's provision of a grantee consolidation plan and proposed budget for its implementation to the Board for its consideration has been delayed to the April 2012 Board meeting.

---

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

- An initial meeting was held with staff members of the Senate Foreign Relations Committee to gauge reaction to the grantee consolidation plan.
- That the plenary Board note that a draft consolidation transaction plan with a transaction timeline and a proposed implementation budget will be presented to the Board at its April 2012 meeting.

### **Future Structure of United States International Broadcasting:** International Broadcasting Innovation Act

---

- At its January 2012 meeting, the Board announced its intention to pursue legislation to be called the International Broadcasting Innovation Act of 2012 (the “IBIA”). The Board directed the IBB Director to work with IBB staff and outside experts, and with Governor McCue, in order to develop a draft IBIA for the Board’s further consideration. The Board specified that the draft IBIA should include five (5) basic attributes:
  - Optimal mix of federal and non-federal assets to implement the Board’s strategic plan
  - Creation of Chief Executive Officer
  - Elimination of IBB Director as a Presidentially-appointed and Senate-confirmed appointment
  - Repeal of the ban on domestic dissemination
  - New name for the agency to reflect the unified structure
- That the plenary Board note that Ms. Lynne Weil began her appointment as the Director of the Office of Communications and External Affairs on February 6, 2012. The Governance Committee received a briefing from Ms. Weil on the status of the International Broadcasting Innovation Act, which included the following:
  - Governor Susan McCue, Ms. Weil, and Mr. Conniff met with Senate Foreign Relations Committee staffers Paul Foldi (minority) and Deputy Staff Director Peter Scoblic (majority) to discuss agency interaction in the wake of the Board’s decisions regarding the restructuring of U.S. international broadcasting and to consider options for the International Broadcasting Innovation Act.
  - Regarding the Board’s decision to develop IBIA and streamline United States international broadcasting, the staffers made the following comments and suggestions:
    - The legislative process will take at least two years to complete.
    - The Board should take a two-pronged approach: developing the legislation and encouraging discussion in the media and among recognized broadcast professionals recognizing the need for change, including advocacy by past and current Board members.

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

- The formation of an advisory committee could be useful in gathering support of both traditional broadcasters and new media.
- The legislation should include the idea of moving to a more appropriate location than the Cohen building, with state of the art technology.
- Regarding the other main pillars of the strategy – creation of a Board-appointed CEO, grantee consolidation, and repeal of the Smith-Mundt domestic dissemination ban – the staffers provided the following comments and suggestions:
  - The goals of unifying hiring, salary and benefits, procurement, consolidation of the physical plant, and other functions of the grantees are worthy, but the main benefit of grantee consolidation is the elimination of program duplication.
  - The Senate staff members also encouraged BBG to “think big” to address concerns of private vs. federal staffing, and to make known China’s growing communications expenditures and presence in order to highlight the need to invest in U.S. international broadcasting.

### Governance Committee Housekeeping Matters

---

- **Discussion of the Role of the BBG Chair**
  - The Committee deferred discussion of the role of the BBG Chair in light of the special telephonic meeting of the plenary Board scheduled for February 11, 2011.
- **Adoption of November 2011 Governance Committee Report, including the Protocol for Release of Material from Closed Board Meetings.**
  - The Committee considered the report from the November 17, 2011 Governance Committee meeting, noting that it also includes the Governance Committee report of the September 14, 2011 meeting. The plenary Board has already adopted a number of recommendations in the September 2011 Committee report individually at its September 15, 2011 Board meeting.
  - The Committee received an updated proposed protocol for the release of materials from closed meetings to account for retention and disposition of Board recordings or transcripts at the February 2011 Committee meeting. The protocol is included in Attachment 3.
  - The Committee deferred adopting the November 2011 Governance Committee report pending further discussion on the updated proposal for the protocol for release of material from closed board meetings.

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

- **Protocol for Providing Notice of Board Resolutions**
  - That the plenary Board should continue its current practice regarding notice of Board resolutions, recognizing the need to provide as much notice as practicable to individual Governors on the proposed wording of resolutions under consideration by the Board.
  
- **Formalizing Board Committee Roster**
  - The Committee discussed the current membership of BBG Committees and deferred adoption of a BBG Committee roster to a later date.
  - The Committee recommends that the plenary Board note membership of BBG committees requires a decision of the plenary Board.
  
- **Use of Proxies at Committee Meetings**
  - That the plenary Board note that the Governance Committee considered permitting voting by proxy at its September 2011 Committee meeting and informally decided that proxy voting would be inappropriate for meetings of the plenary Board.
  - That the plenary Board note that there is scope for the use of proxy voting at the Committee-level of the BBG Board because Committees make recommendations to the Board, rather than decisions, per the BBG By-Laws.
  - That the plenary Board note that the Governance Committee may revisit the use of proxy voting at the Committee-level at a future meeting.

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

### ATTACHMENT 5

#### 2012 BOARD MEETING SCHEDULE<sup>14</sup>

<u>MONTH</u>	<u>DATES</u>	<u>VENUE</u>
<b>January</b>	12 (Thursday)	Off-Site (Full day) (Washington, D.C)
	13 (Friday)	BBG Headquarters (Washington, D.C)
<b>March</b>	8 (Thursday)	MBN Headquarters (Springfield, VA)
	9 (Friday)	BBG Headquarters (Washington, D.C)
<b>April</b>	19 (Thursday)	OCB Headquarters (Miami, FL)
	20 (Friday)	
<b>June</b>	7 (Thursday)	RFE/RL Headquarters (Prague, Czech Republic)
	8 (Friday)	
<b>July</b>	12 (Thursday)	BBG Headquarters (Washington, D.C)
	13 (Friday)	
<b>September</b>	13 (Thursday)	BBG Headquarters (Washington, D.C)
	14 (Friday)	
<b>October</b>	11 (Thursday)	BBG Headquarters (Washington, D.C)
	12 (Friday)	
<b>November</b>	15 (Thursday)	RFA Headquarters (Washington, D.C.)
	16 (Friday)	
<b>December</b>	13 (Thursday)	BBG Headquarters (Washington, D.C)
	14 (Friday)	

---

<sup>14</sup> This schedule was adopted by the Board by notation vote in December 2011.

---

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

ATTACHMENT 5

### REPORT OF THE BBG GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE MEETING

**Members:** Governor Dennis Mulhaupt, Committee Chair  
Governor Victor Ashe, Committee Member  
Governor Michael Lynton, Committee Member  
Governor Susan McCue, Committee Member

**Meeting Date:** Friday, March 9, 2012

**Venue:** BBG Headquarters, Washington D.C.

This meeting of the Governance Committee took place on March 9, 2012 at BBG Headquarters. Governor Dennis Mulhaupt chaired the proceedings. Governor Victor Ashe and Governor Susan McCue were also in attendance. Governor Lynton was not in attendance.

The agenda of the meeting is set forth in Attachment 1 to this report.

- **Introductory Remarks**

Chairman Mulhaupt welcomed all attendees and thanked Governor Victor Ashe for his leadership in addressing the agency's use of human capital. He explained that the meeting was a listening session and that the Committee was committed to an open, transparent, respectful process so the Board could help create the best and most successful working environment possible. The Chair clarified that the Board is responsible for supervision of the federal agency and has delegated almost all management functions to agency management, including matters of employee and contractor relations.

Governor Susan McCue also thanked Governor Ashe for his leadership. She noted that the Board is interested in doing a deeper dive and finding out what can be done differently with management and employees to improve the morale of employees and contractors.

Governor Victor Ashe thanked the Committee and participants. He asked that the union and contractor representatives focus their discussion on the top three problems they would like to see solved. He asked the representatives for their candid opinions on what policies can improve the agency's the Federal Employee Viewpoint Survey results.

**Use of Human Capital within BBG-Funded USIB: Employee Morale and Other Issues Raised in the Federal Employee Viewpoint Survey**

---

- **Statement by IBB Director**

The International Broadcasting Bureau (IBB) Director, Dick Lobo, acknowledged that he was aware of the morale problems in the agency even before beginning his tenure. He expressed

---

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

dissatisfaction with the current state of employee morale, but explained that the IBB front office has worked hard and made significant progress in the last few years.

The IBB Director provided several statistics to illustrate the agency's improvement since the low point in 2008, noting that the agency had improved significantly (defined as a 5 point change by OPM) on all four major indices: leadership and knowledge management, talent management, results-oriented performance culture, and job satisfaction. He highlighted what he considers the most encouraging result – that the agency exceeded government-wide results in positive responses to the statement: “I believe the results of this survey will be used to make my agency a better place to work.”

The IBB Director explained that this improvement was the result of several steps the agency has taken to respond to the results of previous surveys, including: working with employee unions; hiring an ombudsman and employee assistance counselor; doubling the training budget; increasing the awards budget five fold over a few years; expanding internal communication efforts; providing all managers with extensive leadership and communication training; and partnering with the labor unions on special projects for performance management, employee wellness, and civility in the workplace.

The IBB Director recognized that despite the improvements and agency efforts, the agency is still faced with challenges because of budget uncertainties and dealing with rapid changes in broadcasting priorities, reallocation of resources, changes in media, and advancements in technology. Currently the IBB has formed a joint labor-management task force on morale and required that each office with more than ten employee responses on the Federal Employee Viewpoint Survey complete a six-month action plan to respond to their particular survey results.

The IBB Director concluded his statement by expressing his gratitude for the opportunity to participate in the listening session and reiterating his commitment to working constructively with the Unions and addressing employee concerns.

- **Statements from Agency's three (3) Unions**

A list of the Union Representatives is included in Attachment 2.

Tim Shambles, President of American Federal of Government Employees (AFGE), Local 1812, began his statement explaining that reductions-in-force (RIFs) and the fear of RIFs are a primary cause of low morale in the agency. Mr. Shambles expressed a desire for increased employee counseling services and a better effort to find new positions for employees.

The Committee noted that there has not been a RIF since 2009.

Mr. Shambles also expressed the frustration among employees that senior management and the Board do not recognize the different missions of VOA and RFE/RL, RFA, and MBN. He also noted that employees feel budget implications are not tied to the quality of their work or ability to attract large audiences. He discussed the perceived disproportionality of proposed cuts across

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

the BBG entities in the FY 2013 budget request, noting that VOA was proposed to take a majority of the cuts.

Mr. Shambles described the agency's management style as "top down" and "dictatorial", providing the example of employees being moved from one office space to another. Mr. Shambles stated that employees have not wanted to change spaces but that management explained increased proximity and improved communication as the reason for the move.

Mr. Shambles, the Committee, and IBB staff representatives discussed the procedure for filing a grievance. There was disagreement among Mr. Shambles and IBB staff on the process.

Mr. Shambles provided the following recommendations for improving employee morale: increased employee involvement in decision-making and fewer bureaucratic steps for reporters. Mr. Shamble concluded noting that the issues with contractors also contribute to low employee morale.

A statement submitted by Mr. Shambles is included in Attachment 3.

Andre DeNesnera, BBG representative for American Foreign Service Association (AFSA), began his statement explaining that employee morale is at the lowest point he has seen in his 31 years with the agency. He expressed that employees feel a sense of resentment because of the large budget cuts from VOA proposed in the FY 2013 President's budget, noting that VOA has "75% of the audience but took 60% of the cuts." He noted a perceived difference among employees of the Board's words and its actions, highlighting the BBG's goal of being a leading international news agency while planning to reduce the News Division staff.

Mr. DeNesnera also noted a lack of trust in the Board and senior management among employees. He suggested that some trust could be restored by managers walking around the services and speaking directly with employees.

Greg Burns, President of American Federation of State, County, and Municipal Employees (AFSCME), Local 1418, provided insight about the agency's structure being the cause of many problems. With regard to the planned restructuring, Mr. Burns stated that AFSCME believes consolidation is necessary, that the Board should be advisory, and that the IBB Director should be the head of agency.

Mr. Burns communicated a frustration among employees because they lack a sense of purpose – whether the agency is a news organization, national security organization, or combination of both. He noted the perception among employees that senior management and the Board do not understand the varying missions of VOA to tell America's story and RFE/RL, RFA, and MBN to act as surrogate broadcasters. Employees desire a clearer sense of IBB's purpose and mission for VOA.

Mr. Burns stated that shortwave is a vital platform for the agency and communicated the frustration among employees broadcasting in shortwave as the agency moves more and more

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

resources to television and internet. He criticized the recent research contract with Gallup, explaining that the funds could have been used to spare reductions.

Bill Barber, Vice-President of AFSCME Local 1418, echoed Mr. Burns' statement that management visibility is important and managers should meet with services and employees to address issues of concern.

Mr. Burns and Mr. Barber submitted an article for the Committee's consideration, included in Attachment 4.

### **Use of Human Capital within BBG-Funded USIB: Contractor Issues**

---

- **Statements from Contractors**

A list of the contractor representatives is included in Attachment 5.

Paul Ndiho, a producer with VOA's English Division, thanked the Governance Committee for holding the listening session and the IBB Director for providing contractor brown bags. Consistent with Governor Ashe's request, Mr. Ndiho prioritized three issues to discuss: (1) late payments, (2) fair compensation, and (3) a lack of sick and vacation time.

Mr. Ndiho proposed that management inform contractors of their right to negotiate contracts in an effort to receive fair pay and ensure that contracts are revised annually. He also proposed that contractors receive 2-3 days of paid time off annually.

Mike Gloss, a graphic designer for VOA's Urdu and Bangla services, began his statement by noting that the brown bags for contractors have been a very good start to improving the situation for contractors in the agency.

Mr. Gloss discussed the way in which the agency chooses to spend the operations budget, noting that the agency has invested in two new studios but cannot afford the people to run them to their full potential. He also discussed the problem with contractor rates not increasing over several years.

Jeff Blagg, a video editor with VOA, focused his statement on the lack of communication between contractors and the Office of Contracts. Mr. Blagg highlighted the fact that several terms in contracts are not defined (*e.g.* "assignment"). He also communicated a feeling among contractors that they cannot ask questions about their contracts, for fear of having the contract terminated. Mr. Blagg suggested annual one-on-one meetings between contractors and an Office of Contracts representative to discuss the terms of each contract and negotiate in good faith.

Rusudan Tsereteli, a multimedia journalist working in the Georgian Service, expressed that her contractor colleagues feel demoralized and confused about their status, especially in light of upcoming budget cuts. Ms. Tsereteli echoed Mr. Blagg's comment that contractors worry about

## **Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting**

asking the Office of Contracts about their contract out of a concern that the contract will be terminated.

- **Closing Remarks**

Chairman Mulhaupt reiterated that the Governance Committee and plenary Board take the issue of human capital seriously and are committed to improving the situation.

Governor Ashe suggested that many of the problems can be dealt with sooner rather than later and that the Committee should choose a few issues and direct IBB staff to report at the next Governance Committee meeting.

Director Lobo expressed appreciation for the open Committee meeting with input from the unions and contractors. He noted that the problem will take time to solve, but that the agency has started taking steps to improve the use of human capital.

Governor McCue concurred with the expression of support and commitment, mentioning that more and open communication will continue to build trust between the agency's senior leadership and employees and contractors.

Chairman Mulhaupt concluded the Governance Committee.

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

### ATTACHMENT 1

#### MEETING OF THE BBG GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE

March 9, 2012

9:00-11:30

BBG Conference Room

**Members**  
Governor Dennis Mulhaupt, Committee Chair  
Governor Victor Ashe, Committee Member  
Governor Michael Lynton, Committee Member  
Governor Susan McCue, Committee Member

#### AGENDA

- Agenda Topic 1*      **Use of Human Capital within BBG-Funded United States International Broadcasting:** Employee Morale and Other Issues Raised in the Federal Employee Viewpoint Survey
- Introductory Remarks from Chairman Mulhaupt
  - Statement by IBB Director with Support from IBB Staff
  - Statements from Agency's three (3) Unions Followed by Question and Answer Period
- Agenda Topic 2*      **Use of Human Capital within BBG-Funded United States International Broadcasting:** Contractor Issues
- Introductory Remarks from Chairman Mulhaupt
  - Statement by IBB Director with Support from IBB Staff
  - Statements from Contractors Followed by Question and Answer Period

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

### ATTACHMENT 2

#### UNION REPRESENTATIVES

(as of 2-27-2012)

Of 1,713 BBG Federal employees (excluding foreign nationals overseas), approximately 1,031, or about 60 percent, are represented by a Union.

#### **American Federal of Government Employees (AFGE), Local 1812**

- AFGE is the largest of the agency's labor organizations, covering 913 employees with approximately 387 dues paying members. AFGE is the union with the largest effect on the day-to-day lives of staff and management
- **Timothy (Tim) Shamble**, President (EOD 6-30-91 Production Specialist Radio English Division)

#### **American Federation of State, County, and Municipal Employees (AFSCME), Local 1418**

- AFSCME represents 94 Radio Broadcast Technicians with 79 dues paying members
- **Gregory (Greg) Burns**, President (EOD 6-26-83 Radio Broadcast Technician, VOA)
- **Bill Barber**, Vice President

#### **American Foreign Service Association (AFSA)**

- AFSA covers approximately 24 Foreign Service positions, with 10 paying dues
- Andre DeNesnera**, BBG Representative (EDO 12-22-83, Correspondent VOA News)

# Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

## ATTACHMENT 3

### PROBLEMS WITH MORALE

Statement from Timothy Shanley,

President AFGF Local 1812

March 9, 2012

In any discussion about morale at this Agency there is no way to avoid the topic of reductions-in-force. It's the 800-pound gorilla in the room. It overshadows any other issue affecting morale in this Agency. For over a decade, when the budget for the next fiscal year is sent to Congress, employees hunker down to see which Services will be ended or reduced. This has been the case year after year. RIFs are not acts of nature. They are choices deliberately made by individuals in management who decide how the resources will be allocated. Somewhere along the line, a deliberate choice was made to run this organization in this manner and it has had a devastating effect on morale.

The OPM Employee Viewpoint surveys have revealed that we believe what we do is important. However, the message we receive from those running this Agency is the exact opposite. A good example of this occurred last month when the latest budget plan was released. One of the Services targeted for reduction is the Tibetan Service which will cease its radio broadcasting in favor of a 50% increase in TV when research shows that the popularity of TV can only reliably be measured in India and Nepal among Tibetan refugees who have migrated there. To whom will VOA be broadcasting? Recently NPR reported on the Chinese government's crackdown in Tibet. The story revealed that Tibetan monks went to dark secluded spaces inside locked monasteries to listen to the Voice of America as heavily-armed Chinese soldiers patrolled outside. Those monks obviously believe that what the VOA broadcasters and journalists do is important enough to risk their lives. If Tibetans must seek a secret space to listen to radios, what makes VOA think it can reach an audience on TV screens inside that persecuted country?

The Agency refuses to acknowledge and embrace its strength. For some reason the BBG has been slowly phasing out its radio broadcasts. The most recent data released by the BBG indicates that its largest audience is still those who access our radio broadcasts despite over a decade of eliminating frequencies, transmitters, broadcasts, and broadcasters. The fact is that there are roughly 2.5 billion shortwave receivers world wide. Even the IBB is quoted in a recent article as saying that at any given time of the day or night, one BILLION shortwave receivers are turned on. In some places, car radios come equipped with shortwave bands. For millions of people around the world, shortwave radio is the only means they have for communication with the outside world. There needs to be a frank and open discussion regarding the Agency's strategic plan with a willingness to at least discuss the possibilities of modifying it.

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

If there is to be any improvement in morale at this Agency these latest reductions must be reversed. The halls are seething with discontent, frustration, anger and bewilderment. When announcing these cuts, at the very least the Agency could have increased its career and psychological counseling to help employees faced with the loss of their livelihood and the uncertainties of employment. No one knows where the ax will fall, how the RIF will be administered and what positions the Agency intends to eliminate. Had the unions had the chance to have input into the pre-decisional process at the Labor/Management Forum, we would have registered our strong objections there. Again, the debates are out in the public domain, in the press and in the Congress, exposing the rift between management and the employees as to the mission of the Agency.

Employees have been subjected to buy-out notices that target "employees without the skills desired by the agency." Over the years, VOA employees have willingly learned new skills – Television, Internet, social media, you name it. Yet they have not been recognized for this. They have not received any grade increases for taking on new increased duties, workloads and skills. Employees have been left in the dark about what skills they should be acquiring and management has not taken the initiative in notifying the employees of what these are.

VOA employees have had their work denigrated over and over. What we do for VOA has been identified as being the same as that of the surrogate broadcasters. There is a difference in missions which have become blurred. The mission of the VOA is clearly delineated in the VOA Charter. Congress did not create two different entities to do the very same thing. However, that difference is not acknowledged by the BBG professional staff who claim there is an overlap among the VOA broadcasts and the surrogate broadcasts, and more often than not, when a determination is made as to which will be eliminated it is the VOA Services that suffer, this despite the fact that VOA is still the most recognized and trusted "brand" of United States International Broadcasting.

The dominant management style at this Agency is a top-down dictatorial style. The agency seems to go out of its way to hire managers without people skills who berate and belittle employees. We have waited for each incarnation of the BBG to change the way management operates but each Board has failed to make any significant changes. ✓

We are weary of having new managers, who can truly make a difference tell us: "We don't want to undermine anyone's authority by going against recommendations of the professional staff." Since no one will do so, we continue to see the same results on the employee viewpoint surveys. The BBG was rated at the bottom or near the bottom for the following categories: "I have a high level of respect for my organization's senior leaders", "My organization's leaders maintain high standards of honesty and integrity", "I have trust and confidence in my supervisor", "Leaders generate high levels of motivation and commitment in

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

the workforce”, and “My agency is successful at accomplishing its mission”. These results are not just from the rank and file but include managers as well. Something is clearly wrong.

It is the prevailing feeling and one that the union has seen first-hand that some in senior leadership positions do not respect the law. I have a wall full of examples in my office that attest to this fact as well as several recent arbitration decisions decided in favor of the union. Union and management negotiators spent years negotiating provisions of a new Contract. Agreements were initiated by both sides only to have the management team walk away from these agreements and refuse to recognize them. One such provision was a conduct review panel in which employees accused of wrong-doing would be judged by their peers which would have gone a long way in improving employees' belief that they are being treated fairly. There is supposed to be a fair system to address employee grievances. A three tier system has been negotiated but agency management has corrupted the process so that it is in reality a two tier process. The same management officials who respond to the first level complaints are also involved in responding to the second level complaints. Employees have little chance of a fair hearing until they go to arbitration in front of a neutral third party. That costly process could, would and should be avoided.

The truth is that the democratic ideals we are asked to promote in our broadcasts are not practiced here in this building. The word “democracy” is a word that was sneered at by one upper level management official in a meeting with union representatives. It's very apparent that due process and free speech are not welcome.

Many management actions seem to be intended simply to unsettle and frustrate employees. For over a decade, employees have been moved and their workspaces changed like the pieces on a chessboard. These moves are not generated because employees requested them but were made because someone in management wanted to shake things up. A lot of taxpayer money has been spent on these various renovations. Recently English Service employees, who were completely content with where they were located in this building, were forced to move to a work space they felt would be detrimental to doing their work. This recent move was justified by management as being “to promote more interaction by moving these employees closer to their coworkers” as if proximity promotes more and better communication. That may also be the management reasoning used to block telecommuting for employees even though both Congress and the President have urged all federal agencies to promote more telecommuting.

Employees in the Central News Room have had bureaucratic changes made to the way they do their jobs. The reporters now spend more time identifying what they plan to do and reporting on what it is they have done ... than they do in actually producing what it is they are supposed to produce. Front line employees – the content producers – have also been badgered into working more than eight hours a day and forty hours a week without any additional compensation.

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

Reporters and journalists who have been working straight-eight work schedules and prefer working straight-eight work schedules have been forced to work eight hour and forty five minute schedules instead. The change was not initiated by the employees but by the Human Resources office.

The number of contract employees at the Agency has steadily increased. As employees leave whether by retirement, resignations or a RIF, they are not replaced by staff employees. Contractors are hired instead. There are many examples of how these people are abused. Almost all of the contractors work side-by-side with staff employees. They use the same equipment we use. They are directed in their work by our supervisors and not a contracting officer. But they earn no overtime, no annual or sick leave; they don't get holidays or a retirement plan. Many are paid less. The Agency claims these individuals are independent contractors but it is obvious to everyone that is not the case. And they are not going to give you an honest answer when asked "what are your complaints and how can we make things better." Contract employees are on a slippery slope if they complain knowing that if they do, their services could be ended at any time and with no justification and no recourse.

If the Board truly wants to change the disintegrating morale in this Agency, it will have to give more than lip service to turning things around. It's not an easy task. Someone will have to examine the whole culture here and resolve, firmly and openly, to work toward an enlightened workplace in which everyone's good work is recognized and valued, where discipline is meant to be remedial and corrective rather than punitive, where people come together to share ideas and yes, debate the issues. Then, the unions and management would be in a position to forge accommodations that serve the best interests of both the Agency and individual employees.

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

### ATTACHMENT 4

## Local 1418/AFSCME

American Federation of State, County and Municipal Employees  
Council 26, Capital Area Council of Federal Employees  
202 358 7043

March 9, 2012

To: The BGG Governance Committee

From: Gregory D. Burns – President

William J. Barber – Vice - President

Subject: Agency Morale – Pending the 2013 Budget Proposal

The following documents represent solutions in the decline of Agency Morale at the BGG/IBB/VOA.

In our statements, we will provide the Committee with background on the current Morale problems running rampant throughout the entire BGG/IBB. It is important to note that there is currently a joint Union/ Labor Management IBB/VOA Morale Taskforce working to resolve this dire issue. There is no question in regards to everyone agreeing that LEADERSHIP from the Top - Down is where to start.

Thank you for this opportunity to address the vital Morale Problems at the BGG/IBB/VOA.

Yours Truly,

Greg. Burns



Bill Barber



Representing the Radio Broadcast Technicians of The Voice of America  
AFL-CIO



# Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

Normal Print Message

<http://co121w.co121l.mail.sve.com/mail/PrintMessages.aspx?cpids...>

- [Competing cybersecurity bills offer best of both worlds](#)
- [Is there a performance quota system at your agency?](#)
- [NSA opens \\$286M cryptologic facility in Georgia](#)
- [CMS eyes \\$370M goal in stemming improper payments](#)
- [House probes OPM in wake of fellowship debacle](#)
- [Agencies need to 'quit whining' about SFS](#)
- [Army acquisition dysfunction is a 'myth,' leaders argue](#)
- [USDA office to cut staff by 150](#)
- [NIST rewrites FISMA standards as cyber threats evolve](#)
- [Take our survey: How important is diversity at your agency?](#)
- [Telework Week could draw as many as 50,000 stay-at-home workers](#)
- [Automatic suspension in contracting bill draws ire of industry](#)
- [DHS unification still high risk — 9 years later](#)

From federal pay freezes to tightening budgets and a shrinking workforce, federal employees and managers have had to deal with their fair share of changes the last few years. But what kind of toll has it taken on the workforce? Managers and employees alike tell Federal News Radio their morale has been affected drastically - and not in a good way. In our special report, "[Managing Morale](#)," we find out from feds just how bad the problem is; we speak with federal managers and leadership experts on what can be done to fix morale issues; and we hear straight from Congress what exactly lawmakers expect from the federal workforce during these difficult times.

## How to get the morale mojo back in your federal office

Friday - 2/17/2012, 1:46am ET

 Listen

Michael Kane, CHCO at the Energy Department, offers his advice for motivating your workforce.

[Download](#)

Tim Urtan, professor of psychology at Santa Clara University, offers his perspective on motivating employees.

[Download](#)

By Julia Ziegler  
Web Manager  
Federal News Radio

This week, Federal News Radio has been exploring the causes of low morale in the federal workforce. Managers and employees, alike, told us their levels of motivation have been affected greatly by the current two-year pay freeze, "fed hazing" by members of Congress and the public, and ineffective managers.

In an exclusive [FederalNewsRadio.com survey](#), over one-third of employees responding said *nothing* their managers are currently doing is building morale at their agencies.

"They are indifferent, demeaning, arrogant, ignorant (of their own profession) and complacent," wrote one survey respondent.

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

Print Message

<http://www.ecf121.mmlive.com/mail/PrintMessages.aspx?apid...>

When asked how well managers at their agencies motivate employees on a scale from 1 to 10, with 1 being terrible and 10 being excellent, 56 percent of federal employees gave their managers a score of 1-3, while only 10 percent gave managers a score between 8-10.

That might be because managers say they are unmotivated themselves. In Federal News Radio's survey, 65 percent of federal managers indicated their morale level somewhere between 1-5, while only 12 percent listed their morale from 8-10.

So, with managers and employees both feeling unmotivated, how can the situation improve at agencies? In order to fix morale, it's helpful to know where it comes from in the first place.

### *Quick Tips for Motivating Your Workforce:*

- Set expectations and goals.
- Set the example. Managers must be motivated too.
- Find ways to show your appreciation. Something small can go a long way.
- Make work meaningful.
- Be fair with pay, benefits, and opportunities for employees.
- Make room for growth, ideas, and creativity.
- Communicate and listen to employees.
- Be open and honest.

"We know through research that motivation is intrinsic. It is not imposed, it comes from within," said John Baldoni, president of Baldoni Consulting, a coaching and leadership development firm. "It's an adoption of behaviors. We motivate ourselves because we want to achieve something."

But, managers have a big effect on employee morale too, according to Jim Urdan, a professor of psychology at Santa Clara University.

"If you talk to people about why they've left jobs in the past, it often boils down to a bad relationship with their direct manager...I think managers can have a lot of effect on motivation."

Urdan said managers can start to change the atmosphere in their offices by making the work meaningful; making room for employee growth, ideas and creativity; and trying to make things fair when it comes to pay, benefits and the opportunities employees are given.

Robin Wink, owner of Radman Wink Associates, a training company for federal employees, said it's also important for managers to set expectations and goals, set the example, and find ways to show appreciation for employees on a daily basis. She said staff meetings are a great place to do this.

"You're actually putting your unit's goals and missions on display by what you're thanking or appreciating. It's as much about everyone else hearing these are the kinds of things we should keep doing, as it is, additionally, for the person who gets the praise in person."

What might come as a surprise to some, Urdan said, is that little things, like a "thank you," can sometimes be more effective than a monetary bonus.

"There's pretty good evidence out there that making money the primary motivator generally doesn't work. I mean, it works if you've got a really boring job that doesn't require a lot of critical thinking or problem solving...but if you have a job that involves some sort of critical thinking or problem solving aspect to it, putting all of the incentives into money can actually have an undermining effect. It can make people more conservative in their thinking and it can make them less creative in their problem solving."

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

Journal: Print Message

<http://cn121w.ccl121.mail.live.com/mail/PrintMessages.aspx?pic...>



Michael Kane, Energy Dept.

As for dealing with their own motivational problems, Michael Kane, the chief human capital officer at the Energy Department and the 2011 CIOO of the Year, said managers should look to the mission and the work being done at the agency to help rejuvenate their spirits.

"One of the things that works for me, personally, is I get out of my office and I go walk around the building. And I'll walk into an area where I know there's program activity going on - whether it's good program activity or bad program activity. I'll say, "What are you guys working on here? How are you working?" And I will engage them in a discussion. And, what I find is, when I get down in those programs around people who are connected to that mission, that improves my morale because I start looking at the things they're doing and that reminds me why I'm here and what awesome abilities there are in the federal government, what awesome things they're doing on behalf of people, but more importantly what my responsibility is. It clarifies back for me what I'm responsible for and what I need to deliver."

### What if it doesn't work?

Despite managers' best efforts, Baldoni said there will always be some employees that can't be motivated.

"Frankly, there will be some people, the outliers in your system, that are just there to throw stones and don't want to participate and only want to gum up the works. You need to find a way to, if you can't get rid of them, marginalize them so they can't infect the rest of the team."

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

Hotmail Print Message

<http://co121w.col121.mail.live.com/vmail/PrintMessages.aspx?epids...>



John Baldoni, Baldoni Consulting

Wink said it's also important for managers to confront unmotivated employees.

"We've become a society that isn't always interested in conversations that involve a level of conflict. Having to say to someone, 'look, you don't appear to be motivated' or 'the attitude you displayed in our staff meeting last week was really negative and that's dragging the group down,' we're not always comfortable with that conversation and I think we have to have it probably more than we realize." She said dealing with poor performers is also important so that it doesn't bring the entire team down.

"In some measure, folks are just not comfortable and prepared to communicate as effectively with their front-line workforce as they should be," said Tom Fox, vice president for leadership and innovation at the Partnership for Public Service. "There are folks that are doing an exceptional job and others who are struggling. Now is the time to come out of the shell and really make sure that you are communicating with folks."

Kane said communicating with employees is one of the most important things managers can do to keep a motivated workforce.

"One of the things we do here is, we do a lot of communication about what's working well and what's not working well...It's about celebrating mistakes. It's about saying, 'We discovered something we're not doing well and we're on it, and let me tell you what a great thing we're doing to correct this.' That translates to employees. It says, 'You have faith in me, you have value in me. You recognize the fact that I am trying to make this a better process, a better world.'"

While there may not be a magic bullet for fixing morale problems in the workplace, experts agree there are many things managers can do on a daily basis to get their offices' back on the right track.

"You could look at the indicators in terms of negativity around the federal workforce and declining morale, and throw up your hands and feel somewhat helpless or hopeless," said Fox. "I think, more than anything for federal leaders, now is the time to redouble those efforts and

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

Print Message

<http://col121.wednet.edu/live/content/PrintMessages.aspx?topic...>

make a commitment to focusing on the fundamentals to make sure that you're doing all you can, despite that adversity, to keep spirits high."

### ***MORE FROM THE MANAGING MORALE SERIES:***

[Motivating the workforce - it takes two to tango \(column\)](#)

[How the military gets motivation right](#)

[Federal morale deep'y impacted by pay freeze, fed bashing](#)

[Managing morale: lessons from OPM's John Berry](#)

[Pay and Benefits Bill Tracker \(chart\)](#)

[2008-2013 Spending Levels \(chart\)](#)

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

### ATTACHMENT 5

#### CONTRACTOR REPRESENTATIVES

*The IBB Director invited all BBG contractors to volunteer to speak to the Governance Committee. Seventeen contractors volunteered for this opportunity. When given the choice for a lottery or self-selection to choose 5 representatives, the volunteers asked to describe amongst themselves. On March 3, a small group met and chose the contractors below.*

##### **Jeff Blagg**

Jeff Blagg has worked at VOA for five (5) years as a video editor. Before moving to DC, he worked in the film industry in Los Angeles for several years. In addition to his work for VOA, Jeff is the owner and lead developer of a software development company focused on making apps for the iPhone and iPad.

##### **Mike Gloss**

Mike Gloss serves as a broadcast graphics designer for VOA Urdu and Bangla services. He started with VOA in the Promotion Department in 2007 and moved to Urdu about a year later. In television for almost 20 years, Mike has experience with editing, camera work, and graphic design.

##### **Paul Ndiho**

Paul Ndiho works with VOA's English Division producing television programming to Africa. In his 14 years as a journalist, Paul covered an extensive range of African affairs for media outlets in his home country, Uganda, as well as other international media organizations. Because of his reporting, Paul was forced to leave Uganda and seek political asylum in the United States. He has worked at VOA for seven (7) years.

##### **Rusudan Tsereteli**

Rusudan Tsereteli started working with the VOA Georgian service in 2011. She is a multimedia journalist, working on radio and television features and blogging. Rusudan has 15 years professional experience in journalism with media outlets in Georgia, Pakistan, Jordan, Germany, and the Czech Republic. In addition to her extensive background in investigative reporting, Rusudan has developed a documentary on the war in Abkhazia.

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

ATTACHMENT 6

### MEETING OF THE BBG GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE

**Members** Governor Dennis Mulhaupt, Committee Chair  
Governor Michael Lynton, Committee Member  
Governor Victor Ashe, Committee Member  
Governor Susan McCue, Committee Member

**Meeting Date:** Thursday, September 13, 2012

**Venue:** BBG Headquarters, Washington D.C.

This meeting of the Governance Committee took place on September 13, 2012 at BBG Headquarters. Governor Dennis Mulhaupt chaired the proceedings. Governors Victor Ashe, Susan McCue, Michael Lynton and Michael Meehan were also in attendance.

The agenda of the meeting is set forth in Attachment 1 to this report.

Based on its deliberations, the Governance Committee makes the following recommendations to the plenary Board:

#### **Policy Statements on EEO & Sexual Harassment**

---

- That the Committee considered the draft policy statements on equal employment opportunity and sexual harassment at the March 7, 2012 Governance Committee meeting. The Committee noted that Governor Ashe suggested several edits to the draft policy statements at that meeting.
- That the Offices of Civil Rights, Human Resources, and General Counsel updated the policy statements to include suggested edits by Governor Ashe.
- That the plenary Board adopt the revised EEO and Sexual Harassment policy statements as set forth in Attachment 2<sup>15</sup>.

#### **Discussion of Creation, Role and Method of Appointment of CEO**

---

- i. That the Board note that both the BBG Strategic Plan (adopted by the Board in October 2011) and the Board's January 2012 decision call for the creation of the position of Chief Executive Officer (CEO) of United States international broadcasting (USIB).

---

<sup>15</sup> Adopted by the plenary Board at the September 13, 2012 Board Meeting.

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

- ii. That the Board note the efforts of the IBB Director to develop draft legislation entitled the International Broadcasting Innovation Act (IBIA) with the characteristics required by the Board's January 2012 decision, including the creation of a CEO of USIB.
- iii. That, notwithstanding efforts to pursue the IBIA legislation, the plenary Board should act now to create a CEO of United States international broadcasting *within the Board's existing statutory authority* under the United States International Broadcasting Act of 1994 (as amended). The intent of this effort is to empower the CEO to the greatest extent permitted under existing law to act as the day-to-day executive of BBG-sponsored U.S. international broadcasting, including both its federal and non-federal components. The non-delegable authorities of the Board as set forth in the International Broadcasting Act will not be changed.
- iv. That the Board authorizes the Presiding Governor to form a Nominating Committee composed of three (3) Governors to recommend a method of selecting, appointing, remunerating and evaluating the CEO in accordance with federal law and regulation. The Nominating Committee will not begin its work until the reprogramming notification required by this decision has been sent to the appropriate Congressional Committees.
- v. That the Board instruct the IBB Director, under the guidance of the Governance Committee, to develop a plan to address the following issues:
  - a. The authorities that should be delegated from the Board to the CEO;
  - b. The agency officers who should report directly to the CEO;
  - c. The relationship of the CEO and the IBB Director;
  - d. The relationship between the CEO and the Grantees, including how the relationship should be formalized and expressed in the grant agreements;
  - e. A proposed budget and timeline for implementation of a CEO.
- vi. That the IBB Director is directed to work in close cooperation with the BBG-sponsored broadcasters, including the grantees, in preparing the requested plan. The Board directs and encourages all elements of USIB to cooperate fully with the IBB Director in facilitating the timely and accurate completion of the requested plan and budget.
- vii. That the Board directs the IBB Director, as soon as practicable, to prepare and deliver any Congressional reprogramming notification that may be required to implement the Board's intentions as stated in this decision (a copy of which will be simultaneously transmitted to Board members).
- viii. The Governance Committee will consider the IBB Director's plan and any recommendations from the Nominating Committee at the next meeting of the Governance Committee. The actual appointment of a CEO will be the subject of a further Board decision.

## **Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting**

- ix. The Board directs the IBB Director to engage in appropriate Congressional consultation as soon as practicable with the Agency's eight Congressional oversight committees at a minimum, and others as may be suggested by Board members.

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

### ATTACHMENT 1

## MEETING OF THE BBG GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE

September 13, 2012  
8:00 AM - 10:00 AM  
BBG Conference Room

**Members**  
Governor Dennis Mulhaupt, Committee Chair  
Governor Michael Lynton, Committee Member  
Governor Victor Ashe, Committee Member  
Governor Susan McCue, Committee Member

### AGENDA

- Agenda Topic 1*      **Discussion of Creation, Role and Method of Appointment of CEO**
- Agenda Topic 2*      **Grantee Administrative Streamlining**
- Agenda Topic 3*      **Board Administration**
- Discussion of President Obama's January 21, 2009 Memorandum on Transparency and Open Government
  - Policy regarding Non-Disclosure of Deliberative Information
- Agenda Topic 4*      **Governance Committee Housekeeping Matters**
- Adoption of March 7 and March 9 Governance Committee Reports
- Agenda Topic 5*      **Policy Statements on EEO & Sexual Harassment**

## **Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting**

### **ATTACHMENT 2**

#### **REVISED POLICY STATEMENT ON EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY**

September 13, 2012

The Broadcasting Board of Governors (BBG or Agency) is firmly committed to equal employment opportunity (EEO), diversity, and the promotion of a strong affirmative employment program. It is the policy of BBG to provide equal opportunities in employment for every employee and job applicant, and to ensure a workplace that is free of discrimination on the basis of race, color, religion, sex (including sexual harassment and sexual orientation), age (person 40 years of age and older), national origin, disability (physical and mental), genetic information, and retaliation because an individual engaged in prior EEO activities. The BBG strongly promotes the full realization of equal opportunity in employment through a continuing affirmative program to identify and eliminate discriminatory practices.

EEO principles govern all aspects of the Agency's personnel policies, programs, practices, and operations. All phases of the Agency's employment – recruitment, hiring, retention, evaluations, promotions, transfers, benefits, assignments, training opportunities, awards, and separations – shall be conducted in compliance with the EEO laws and regulations.

The Agency holds each manager and supervisor accountable for ensuring a continuing affirmative application and enforcement of this EEO policy. Additionally, managers and supervisors must continue to take positive steps toward ensuring a supportive work environment and reaching early resolution of complaints. They must avoid even the appearance of acts of retaliation against individuals who exercise their right to file a complaint. Accordingly, equal opportunity will continue to be a factor in the total performance evaluation of managers and supervisors.

Employees are essential in maintaining a work environment of equal opportunities, and have a moral and legal responsibility to treat all of their colleagues with respect and professionalism. The BBG strongly supports a workplace free of discrimination and holds every employee accountable for contributing to the achievement of a Model EEO Program.

**Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting**  
**REVISED POLICY STATEMENT ON SEXUAL HARASSMENT**  
September 13, 2012

It is the policy of the Broadcasting Board of Governors (BBG or Agency) to provide a work environment free of any form of unlawful harassment or intimidation. This policy includes but is not limited to sexual harassment, a form of sex discrimination that violates Title VII of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, as amended.

Sexual harassment is defined as unwelcome sexual advances, requests for sexual favors, and other verbal or physical conduct of a sexual nature when:

- Submission to or rejection of such conduct by an individual is made either explicit or implicitly as a term or condition of an individual's employment;
- Submission to or rejection of such conduct by an individual is used as the basis for employment decisions affecting an individual; or
- Such conduct has the purpose or effect of unreasonably interfering with an individual's work performance or creates an intimidating, hostile or offensive working environment.

Managers and supervisors are responsible for ensuring that the workplace is free from sexual harassment and that appropriate action is taken promptly when allegations of violations of this policy are brought to their attention. The Agency will not tolerate retaliation against an individual who presents a harassment complaint or who provides any information related to such a complaint.

Any Agency employee found to have engaged in sexual harassment in violation of this policy is subject to disciplinary action. The offending individual, however, may not necessarily be an employee, but may be a contractor or non-employee. Supervisors and managers who observe or are informed of any unprofessional behavior that may create a work environment offensive to any staff member have a responsibility to take appropriate, effective and immediate steps to prevent such behavior from continuing or recurring.

## Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting

ATTACHMENT 7

### PROPOSED DATES FOR BBG MEETINGS IN 2013

February 21-22 (Thursday, Friday)

April 10-11 (Wednesday, Thursday)

June 19-20 (Wednesday, Thursday)

August 14-15 (Wednesday, Thursday)

October 16-17 (Wednesday, Thursday)

December 11-12 (Wednesday, Thursday)

## **Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting**

**ATTACHMENT 8**

### **RESOLUTION HONORING DANA PERINO December 14, 2012**

WHEREAS, Dana Perino, in her role as a member of the Broadcasting Board of Governors (BBG) from July 2010 to December 2012, has supported U.S. international media through participation in efforts both in public and behind the scenes;

WHEREAS, Ms. Perino has taken part in pivotal strategic decisions and brought tremendous acumen and energy to her work on the BBG's behalf;

WHEREAS, with her experience at the highest levels of government, Ms. Perino has made an important contribution to advancing the Board's goals for reforming the agency;

WHEREAS, Ms. Perino took a truly collegial and bipartisan approach, forging friendships while working shoulder-to-shoulder with Board colleagues in furthering the BBG's mission; and

WHEREAS, Ms. Perino's ready wit and unique way with words will be sorely missed.

NOW, THEREFORE, be it resolved that the Broadcasting Board of Governors honors Ms. Perino's contribution to the agency, and extends its deepest thanks for all that she has done.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that an appropriate copy of this resolution be forwarded to Dana Perino.

## **Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting**

**ATTACHMENT 9**

### **RESOLUTION HONORING MARYJEAN BUHLER December 14, 2012**

WHEREAS, Maryjean Buhler, in her role as the Chief Financial Officer of the Broadcasting Board of Governors from January 2010 through November 2012, has served the agency in overseeing critical financial management operations;

WHEREAS, as a member of the Board's senior management team, Ms. Buhler has made an important contribution to leading the agency toward financial management excellence;

WHEREAS, Ms. Buhler spent countless hours managing the budget process, maintained three unqualified audit opinions, and managed four budget processes during her tenure;

WHEREAS, Ms. Buhler developed an agency-wide shut-down contingency plan that was cited by the Office of Management and Budget as a model for other agencies; and

WHEREAS, Ms. Buhler worked tirelessly to streamline processes, improve controls and improve agency compliance with Federal laws and regulations on numerous elements, and strengthen internal controls over financial management operations.

NOW, THEREFORE, be it resolved that the Broadcasting Board of Governors hereby expresses appreciation and thanks to Maryjean Buhler for her contribution to the agency and for all that she has done to support U.S. international media.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that an appropriate copy of this resolution be forwarded to Ms. Buhler.

## **Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting**

**ATTACHMENT 10**

### **RESOLUTION HONORING JOHN LENNON December 14, 2012**

WHEREAS, John Lennon has served the Voice of America (VOA) and the Agency with distinction for 44 years as a broadcast producer, journalist, manager, and senior executive;

WHEREAS, Mr. Lennon has served for the past year as VOA's first Associate Director of Strategy and Planning, working closely with the VOA and BBG leadership on planning and implementing our strategic direction;

WHEREAS, Mr. Lennon served for four years as Associate Director for Language Programming, overseeing the output and management of VOA's 43 language services whose reported audiences grew by more than 20% during that period;

WHEREAS, Mr. Lennon served for seven years as Director of International Broadcasting Bureau's (IBB) Office of Performance Review, creating new standards for quality control and emphasizing the use of audience research and market analysis in developing new programs and attracting new audiences;

WHEREAS, Mr. Lennon served for extended periods as IBB's Acting Associate Director for Program Support, helping to establish the Office of Marketing and Program Placement and strengthening the new Office of Internet Development;

WHEREAS, Mr. Lennon's management experience includes service as Deputy Director of the Latin American and European Divisions, Director of the South European Division, and Acting Director of WORLDNET Television;

WHEREAS, Mr. Lennon served as a Director in the Office of Democracy at the National Security Council from 1994 to 1995;

WHEREAS, during his early career Mr. Lennon served VOA as a radio producer, news reporter, documentary writer, and program editor; and

WHEREAS, throughout his career Mr. Lennon has volunteered to provide professional guidance to employees through the Agency's mentoring program.

NOW, THEREFORE, be it resolved that the Broadcasting Board of Governors hereby expresses its great appreciation and gratitude to John Lennon for his invaluable contributions to the furtherance of the mission of U.S. international broadcasting.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that an appropriate copy of this resolution be forwarded to Mr. Lennon.