



From: Broadcasting Board of Governors  
Date: August 21, 2013  
Subject: **Minutes of the BBG Meeting of August 21, 2013**

The Broadcasting Board of Governors (BBG) met today at BBG Headquarters in Washington, D.C. The meeting was attended by members of the public and was also open for public observation via streaming on the BBG website.

The meeting was attended by the following Board members:

Chairman Jeffrey Shell  
Governor Matthew Armstrong  
Governor Ryan Crocker  
Governor Susan McCue  
Governor Michael Meehan (via telephone)

The Under Secretary for Public Diplomacy & Public Affairs was not in attendance at the meeting.

Other persons in attendance are listed at the end of these minutes.

The agenda of the meeting is set forth in Attachment 1.

Chairman Shell called the meeting to order and noted that the meeting was being held in compliance with the Government in the Sunshine Act and streamed live over the Internet at the BBG website. He welcomed Governor Meehan's participation by telephone.

The Chairman stated that the presence of five (5) Governors satisfies the quorum requirement of the International Broadcasting Act such that the Board would be able to make decisions based on majority vote. He noted that it has been a while since the Board had a quorum. The Chairman added that, on August 5, 2013, the President had appointed the Chairman, Matthew Armstrong, and Ambassador Ryan Crocker to the Board after the United States Senate had confirmed their appointment. Additionally, he noted that Kenneth Weinstein had been nominated by the President in late July.

At the Chairman's invitation, Governors Armstrong and Crocker briefly introduced themselves.

The Chairman recognized four former Board members for their service on the Board: former Governors Victor Ashe, Michael Lynton, Dennis Mulhaupt, and Under Secretary of State Tara Sonenshine. Governors McCue and Meehan concurred and expressed their gratitude for the guidance of the former Governors.

## Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting

There followed a Board vote to adopt the draft resolutions honoring Victor Ashe, Michael Lynton, Tara Sonenshine, and Dennis Mulhaupt for their service on the Board. Governor Crocker made a motion to adopt the resolutions, Governor Armstrong seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

Chairman Shell briefly introduced himself. He noted his belief that the best way to showcase freedom and democracy is through free media and by telling people the truth—tell the story and find a way to get it to them. He and other Board members share a common belief in U.S. international broadcasting because its mission is pure, inspiring and important. The Chairman acknowledged that the Agency has a lot to do despite the rapidly changing environment in the world, and that, while there may be disagreements, the Agency should find best solutions and move forward. The organization must change in order to better address the pure mission in the changing world.

The Chairman spoke about future Board meetings. He said that the Board should operate as a Board by setting strategic directions for the organization and allowing the people in the organization to do their jobs. He added that the Board meetings will be held every other month. The Board would try to conduct its business through a consent agenda as recommended by the Office of Inspector General for the inspection of the BBG. This would allow the Board to spend more time focusing on the important work of U.S. international media by learning about their challenges and discussing their strategies. Board Committees would meet during the months when the plenary Board does not meet and would provide their reports to the plenary Board in advance of the meeting.

Chairman Shell emphasized the importance of entities' monthly reports but recognized a need to standardize the monthly reports at a future Board meeting.

Recognizing the previously adopted 2013 calendar of BBG meetings but given three new members on the Board, the Chairman proposed October 23 and December 18, 2013 as new meeting dates for the remaining calendar year. He urged all Board members to attend these meetings and future meetings and to participate by telephone or video conference if they are unable to attend in person. There followed a Board vote to adopt the new meeting dates for the remaining calendar year.

Chairman Shell announced the appointment of Suzie Carroll as Executive Director. He explained, unlike the previous Executive Director position, Ms. Carroll, in her coordinating role, will serve as the focal point for all Board-related information and communications. Specifically, Ms. Carroll will work with Board Operations to coordinate Board activities. The Chairman asked all networks and International Broadcasting Bureau (IBB) management to go through the IBB Director and Ms. Carroll initially to discuss issues or to obtain information from the Board, but welcomed direct communications between the networks and Board members as needed.

Following the tradition of past Boards, the Chairman reminded everyone of the difficult and dangerous work that BBG journalists do. He noted that yesterday, August 20, marked one year since Alhurra TV correspondent Bashar Fahmi disappeared while reporting in Aleppo, Syria.

## Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting

Mr. Bashar remains missing and incommunicado. He asked that anyone with information about Mr. Bashar's whereabouts or well-being to step forward. He repeated the Board's call for the immediate release of Mr. Bashar, as well as the other journalists being held in Syria, including Austin Tice and James Foley.

The Chairman highlighted recent attacks against BBG journalists: (1) Khadija Ismayilova, an investigative journalist with Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty's (RFE/RL) Azerbaijan Service who reported on government corruption, faces escalating threats, including a release of a new video containing illegally obtained images of her; (2) Ekho Kavkaza, RFE/RL's Georgian Service, which broadcasts to Abkhazia and South Ossetia, received a letter last week from the so-called "official representative of the President of Abkhazia" that labeled the broadcaster "a propagandist information service," adding that authorities "at some point will have to take certain measures; (3) Elizabeth Arrott, Middle East correspondent for the Voice of America (VOA), was pulled from a car and briefly detained by police during the outbreak of violent protests in Cairo, and her colleague, VOA freelance cameraman/reporter Japhet Weeks, was also detained and roughed up; and (4) the security situation with Radio Free Asia's office in Phnom Penh, Cambodia which has been under threat from the Hun Sen government. In conclusion, Chairman Shell reported that Simon Wade Kasmiro, a hard-working and dedicated reporter working on VOA's *South Sudan in Focus* radio show, died in a road accident on August 5, and on behalf of the Board, expressed his condolences to Mr. Kasmiro's family and colleagues.

Chairman Shell expressed his belief, as well as the Board's, in conducting business in the open. He noted that occasionally the Board must conduct certain business in a closed session without public observation in order to be in compliance with the law. To that end, the Chairman announced that the Board will momentarily convene a closed meeting in order to approve the appointment of the new Chief Financial Officer, Leslie Hyland. He added that, while it is a closed meeting, a redacted transcript will be published on the BBG website in accordance with the protocol adopted by the Board.

The Chairman noted that the Board had a formal meeting in December 2012 and subsequent informal meetings or briefings at the BBG headquarters in Washington, D.C. He said that the approval of the minutes may place the new Governors in a difficult position since they were not in attendance at prior meetings. Based on guidance provided by the Board Secretary, Chairman Shell made a motion to adopt a process that would authorize Governors McCue and Meehan to approve the meeting minutes for June 19, 2013, May 15, 2013, April 11, 2013, February 22, 2013, and December 14, 2012. Governor Armstrong seconded. Based on the approved procedure and the statements of Governors McCue and Meehan that they do not object to the approval of the minutes, the plenary Board then unanimously approved the adoption of the aforementioned minutes of prior Board meetings as official Agency records.

The Board accepted a request from Paul Westpheling, General Vice President of American Federation of Government Employees (AFGE) Local 1812, to speak. Mr. Westpheling congratulated the new Governors on their appointment on the Board, described the work of AFGE Local 1812, and emphasized the treatment of fairness, dignity, and respect in good

## Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting

labor/management relationships. At Mr. Westpheling's request, his prepared statement is set forth in Attachment 12.

Chairman Shell recognized the public attendance by Alan Heil, former VOA Acting Director. Governor Armstrong also recognized Katherine Brown, Executive Director of the United States Advisory Commission on Public Diplomacy.

There being no other business, the Chairman adjourned the meeting.

The Broadcasting Board of Governors agreed to the following decision elements (all decisions were adopted by a unanimous vote unless otherwise indicated):

1. Resolution Honoring Dennis Mulhaupt. The Board adopted the resolution thanking and honoring Dennis Mulhaupt as set forth in Attachment 2.
2. Resolution Honoring Michael Lynton. The Board adopted the resolution thanking and honoring Michael Lynton as set forth in Attachment 3.
3. Resolution Honoring Tara Sonenshine. The Board adopted the resolution thanking and honoring Tara Sonenshine as set forth in Attachment 4.
4. Resolution Honoring Victor Ashe. The Board adopted the resolution thanking and honoring Victor Ashe as set forth in Attachment 5.
5. Resolution to Change Meeting Dates for Remaining Year. Chairman Shell made a motion to adopt the resolution to change meeting dates for the remaining calendar year. Governor McCue seconded. The resolution was unanimously adopted by the Board and is set forth in Attachment 6.
6. Adoption of Minutes of Previous Meetings. Chairman Shell made a motion to adopt a process that would authorize Governors McCue and Meehan to approve the meeting minutes for June 19, 2013, May 15, 2013, April 11, 2013, February 22, 2013, and December 14, 2012 as set forth, respectively, in Attachments 7-11. Governor Armstrong seconded. The Board agreed to this procedure and, based on the statements of Governors McCue and Meehan that they do not object to the approval of the minutes, the plenary Board unanimously adopted the aforementioned minutes of prior Board meetings as official Agency records.

Other Attendees:

The following persons were also present during all or part of the meeting: International Broadcasting Bureau (IBB) Director Richard Lobo, IBB Deputy Director Jeffrey Trimble, Chief of Staff Marie Lennon, Deputy General Counsel and Board Secretary Paul Kollmer-Dorsey, Chief Financial Officer Leslie Hyland, Director of Communications & External Affairs Lynne

## Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting

Weil, Executive Director Suzie Carroll, Director of Strategy and Development Bruce Sherman, Director of Public Affairs Letitia King, Board Operations and Policy Adviser Ashley Lancaster, and Executive Assistant to the IBB Director Douglas Schuette; David Ensor, Director of the Voice of America (VOA); Carlos Garcia-Perez, Director of the Office of Cuba Broadcasting (OCB); Kevin Klose, President of Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty (RFE/RL); Brian Conniff, President of the Middle East Broadcasting Networks (MBN); Libby Liu, President of Radio Free Asia (RFA) via teleconference; Andre Mendes, IBB Director of the Office of Technology, Services, and Innovation; Benjamin Herman, RFE/RL Deputy General Counsel; Dan Sreebny, Senior Advisor for BBG, Office of the Under Secretary for Public Diplomacy & Public Affairs; and Robert Torres, Coordinator for International Broadcasting, Office of Inspector General.

Approved:

---

Jeffrey Shell  
Chairman

Witnessed:

---

Paul Kollmer-Dorsey  
Secretary

Attachments:

1. Agenda for August 21, 2013 Meeting
2. Resolution Honoring Dennis Mulhaupt
3. Resolution Honoring Michael Lynton
4. Resolution Honoring Tara Sonenshine
5. Resolution Honoring Victor Ashe
6. Resolution to Change Meeting Dates for Remaining Year
7. Minutes of June 19, 2013 Meeting
8. Minutes of May 15, 2013 Meeting
9. Minutes of April 11, 2013 Meeting
10. Minutes of February 22, 2013 Meeting
11. Minutes of December 14, 2012 Meeting
12. Statement from Paul Westpheling, General Vice President of AFGE Local 1812

# Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting

ATTACHMENT 1

## BROADCASTING BOARD OF GOVERNORS August 2013 Meeting Agenda

Wednesday, August 21

---

**8:30 - 9:00 Broadcasting Board of Governors' Open Meeting**

### **I. Open Session**

Chairman's Remarks

- A. Introduction of New Board Members
- B. Resolutions Honoring Former Board Members
  - Dennis Mulhaupt
  - Michael Lynton
  - Tara Sonenshine
  - Victor Ashe
- C. Resolution to Change Meeting Dates for Remaining Year
- D. Adoption of Minutes of Previous Meetings
  - June 19, 2013 Meeting
  - May 15, 2013 Meeting
  - April 11, 2013 Meeting
  - February 22, 2013 Meeting
  - December 14, 2012 Meeting
- E. Public Comments
- F. Other Items for Consideration at Next Board Meeting

## Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting

ATTACHMENT 2

### RESOLUTION HONORING DENNIS MULHAUPT August 21, 2013

WHEREAS, Dennis Mulhaupt served on the Broadcasting Board of Governors (BBG) from July 2010 to April 2013;

WHEREAS, Mr. Mulhaupt brought to this position considerable experience in the private and non-profit sectors in the United States and abroad;

WHEREAS, during the latter half of his tenure with the BBG Board, Mr. Mulhaupt also served as alternate presiding governor, devoting considerable time and energy to this leadership position, to which his colleagues had elected him;

WHEREAS, throughout his tenure he showed great dedication to his roles as chair of the BBG Governance Committee and chair of the board of Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty;

WHEREAS, Mr. Mulhaupt was tireless and selfless in his service to the BBG, believing passionately in the mission of U.S. international broadcasting;

WHEREAS, Mr. Mulhaupt approached his role with the utmost integrity, and earned widespread respect in Washington, Prague and beyond; and

WHEREAS, Mr. Mulhaupt advocated for necessary and far-reaching reform of the governance structure and organization of U.S. international broadcasting.

NOW, THEREFORE, be it resolved that the Broadcasting Board of Governors respectfully honors Mr. Mulhaupt's contribution to U.S. international broadcasting, and extends its deepest thanks for all that he has done.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that an appropriate copy of this resolution be forwarded to Dennis Mulhaupt.

## **Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting**

**ATTACHMENT 3**

### **RESOLUTION HONORING MICHAEL LYNTON August 21, 2013**

WHEREAS, Michael Lynton served on the Broadcasting Board of Governors (BBG) from July 2010 to May 2013;

WHEREAS, Mr. Lynton's deep understanding of international media business practices, and experience in leading organizational change were of tremendous value to the Board;

WHEREAS, Mr. Lynton's experience and insights helped the BBG meet the challenges of adapting to shifting overseas markets and constrained resources;

WHEREAS, Mr. Lynton helped the BBG identify and consider ways in which to improve efficiencies and capitalize on opportunities;

WHEREAS, with the departure of Chairman Walter Isaacson in January 2012, the BBG Board unanimously elected Mr. Lynton to be interim presiding governor, a role in which he served until his departure; and

WHEREAS, Mr. Lynton's collegiality, honesty, candor, professionalism and sense of humor were deeply appreciated by agency management and his fellow Board members.

NOW, THEREFORE, be it resolved that the Broadcasting Board of Governors sincerely thanks Mr. Lynton for his contributions and service to U.S. international broadcasting.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that an appropriate copy of this resolution be forwarded to Michael Lynton.

## **Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting**

**ATTACHMENT 4**

### **RESOLUTION HONORING TARA SONENSHINE August 21, 2013**

WHEREAS, Tara Sonenshine served as the Secretary of State's delegate to the Broadcasting Board of Governors (BBG) from April 2012 to June 2013;

WHEREAS, as Under Secretary of State for Public Diplomacy and Public Affairs, Ms. Sonenshine exhibited a keen understanding of and interest in U.S. international broadcasting matters from the start, visiting the BBG within days of her swearing-in;

WHEREAS, Under Secretary Sonenshine kept closely in touch with issues affecting the BBG, assigning top advisors to keep her apprised and to offer U.S. Department of State support whenever it was needed;

WHEREAS, Under Secretary Sonenshine's advice on foreign policy matters was crucial to the Board's decision-making on many occasions;

WHEREAS, Under Secretary Sonenshine's background at the U.S. Institute of Peace, the National Security Council staff and in broadcast television news helped inform her opinions and insights, which contributed greatly to the richness of Board discussions; and

WHEREAS, Under Secretary Sonenshine helped elevate the profile of the BBG and highlight its journalists' achievements through her public speaking engagements and weekly newsletters to the public diplomacy community.

NOW, THEREFORE, be it resolved that the Broadcasting Board of Governors deeply appreciates Under Secretary Sonenshine's contributions, thanks her for her service, and hopes that she will remain engaged with U.S. international media matters in the years to come.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that an appropriate copy of this resolution be forwarded to Tara Sonenshine.

## **Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting**

**ATTACHMENT 5**

### **RESOLUTION HONORING VICTOR ASHE August 21, 2013**

WHEREAS, Victor Ashe served on the Broadcasting Board of Governors (BBG) from July 2010 to August 2013;

WHEREAS, Mr. Ashe's distinguished career experience informed his work with the Board, including as the longest-serving Mayor of Knoxville, Tennessee, President of the United States Conference of Mayors, and an appointed U.S. Ambassador to Poland;

WHEREAS, during his tenure, Ambassador Ashe was a member of the BBG Governance and Strategy and Budget Committees, as well as serving as chair and co-chair of the board overseeing Radio Free Asia;

WHEREAS, Ambassador Ashe demonstrated detailed interest in all aspects of U.S. international media, from the workings of the mailroom of the Cohen Building to the global reach of the agency's shortwave transmission towers;

WHEREAS, Ambassador Ashe went to considerable great lengths to recognize the achievements of BBG-supported journalists, attending the anniversary commemorations of language services, and personally presenting them with plaques marking these milestones; and

WHEREAS, Ambassador Ashe was especially attentive to matters affecting the well-being of the agency's workforce, including health care and efforts to improve morale.

NOW, THEREFORE, be it resolved that the Broadcasting Board of Governors honors Ambassador Ashe, and extends its gratitude for his service.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that an appropriate copy of this resolution be forwarded to Victor Ashe.

## **Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting**

**ATTACHMENT 6**

### **Proposed Change to Board Meeting Dates for the Remaining Calendar Year**

RESOLVED, that the Broadcasting Board of Governors change the dates of the meetings for the remaining calendar year as follows:

Wednesday, October 23, 2013

Wednesday, December 18, 2013

## Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting

ATTACHMENT 7

From: Broadcasting Board of Governors  
Date: June 19, 2013  
Subject: **Minutes of the BBG Meeting of June 19, 2013**

The Broadcasting Board of Governors (BBG) met today at Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty (RFE/RL) offices in Washington, D.C. and Prague, Czech Republic. As a quorum was not present, the Governors were not able to make any decisions at the meeting. The meeting was open for public observation via streaming on the BBG website. (While members of the public were permitted to attend this meeting in person, no one attended.)

The meeting was attended by the following Board members in Washington:

Governor Susan McCue  
Governor Michael Meehan  
Under Secretary for Public Diplomacy and Public Affairs Tara Sonenshine

Governor Victor Ashe participated via videoconference from Prague.

Other persons in attendance are listed at the end of these minutes.

The meeting agenda is set forth in Attachment 1.

Governor McCue announced that Governor Meehan was running late and had asked her to preside at the meeting. Governor Ashe commented that this is the first time that a woman has chaired a meeting of the BBG.

Governor McCue stated that the meeting was being recorded, and that the live broadcast was available by webcast on the BBG website. She noted that a quorum of the Board was not present, and that there was neither a Presiding Governor nor an Alternate Presiding Governor. The Governors agreed that Governor McCue should act as chair *pro tem*.

Governor McCue gave brief remarks thanking and honoring Governor Lynton for his service on the Board. She announced that Under Secretary Sonenshine will depart in July 2013, and that this was her last meeting as a member of the BBG Board. On behalf of the Board, Governor McCue thanked the Under Secretary for her service on the Board and expressed hope that she will remain in touch with this Board and engage in U.S. international media matters in the years to come. Governor Ashe also expressed his appreciation of the Under Secretary and urged the attendance of the Secretary of State at a future BBG meeting.

## Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting

Governor Ashe summarized his visit at RFE/RL headquarters in Prague. He noted a sea-change in morale and attitude of employees, including enthusiasm in the building for the mission of RFE/RL. Governor McCue commented that she and Governor Meehan had visited RFE/RL's Moscow office in early May and would be happy to talk with Governor Ashe before his trip to Moscow the next day.

At about 8:30 a.m., Governor Meehan joined the meeting.

Governor McCue commended the BBG journalists for their extensive coverage—with objective up-to-the-minute reports and analysis—of the presidential elections in Iran and the protests in Turkey calling for the right to freedom of speech and right to assembly, among other issues.

Governor McCue highlighted recent harassment and threats of BBG journalists and other impediments from those who seek to restrict the free flow of information. Governor McCue noted that it has been 10 months since Alhurra correspondent Bashar Fahmi went missing in Syria. On behalf of the Board, Governor McCue demanded Mr. Fahmi's immediate release, as well as other journalists being held in Syria, including Austin Tice and James Foley, and asked for anybody with information about Mr. Fahmi's whereabouts or well-being to step forward. In addition, Governor McCue reported that, leading up to the presidential elections, Iranian authorities had made numerous attempts to get Radio Farda and Voice of America (VOA) journalists to cease reporting by threatening their families and loved ones. Furthermore, messages sent to VOA through Facebook indicate that satellite signals experienced interference in Tehran and other cities during the coverage, depriving citizens of news and information.

Governor McCue reported other threats to freedom of the press across the regions: (1) In Iraq, several journalists, including Alhurra-Iraq anchors, have been threatened in recent weeks; (2) In Azerbaijan, efforts by RFE/RL Azerbaijani Service to expand its regional reporting met with official resistance in May, as reporters in several regions were attacked while covering stories such as correspondent Elchin Ismayilli who was physically assaulted by an assistant local governor in the Ismaili district while reporting on flooding in the region, and RFE/RL regional correspondent Turla Mustafayev who was summoned to the police department and threatened three days after reporting about an incident that took place between police officers and a driver and his relatives. In addition, the Service's regional correspondent in Imishli, was detained by police while covering a protest of farmers and was charged the next day with "disobeying police orders" and fined approximately \$180, and RFE/RL's Azerbaijani-language television news program on Turksat was suspended after experiencing interference that appears to be targeted and deliberate; (3) In Turkmenistan, RFE/RL Turkmen Service correspondent Rovshen Yazmuhamedov was detained without charge and held incommunicado for two weeks by Turkmen authorities and was later released following statements and appeals on Yazmuhamedov's behalf by the European Union, Amnesty International, Human Rights Watch and Reporters Without Borders; (4) In Belarus, RFE/RL Belarus Service correspondent Aleh Hruzdilovich was officially warned by Belarusian authorities about violating Belarus' law on mass media because he posted an article that exposed security deficiencies at Minsk subway stations, and that any subsequent warning could result in Hruzdilovich being stripped of his official accreditation; (5) In Turkey, RFE/RL Azerbaijani Service correspondent Yafez Hasanov,

## Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting

who has been subject to threats since reporting on a suspicious death in a facility run by the National Security Ministry in 2011, was threatened while in Istanbul by five thugs who broke into the apartment where he was staying; and (6) In Pakistan, Adnan Khan Bitani, a stringer for VOA's Deewa Radio who regularly provides balanced coverage of attacks that take place in North/South Waziristan, has been threatened with text messages from a man who identifies himself as Ihsan Ullah Ihsan, the name of the spokesman for the Taliban. On behalf of the Board, Governor McCue urged officials and local authorities to ensure the safety of all journalists and punish those that misuse authority, threaten or harm reporters.

In conclusion, Governor McCue announced that the next regular Board meeting will be held at the Cohen Building in Washington, D.C. on August 14 and 15, 2013.

### Other Attendees:

The following persons were also present during all or part of the meeting: International Broadcasting Bureau (IBB) Director Richard Lobo, IBB Deputy Director Jeffrey Trimble, Deputy General Counsel and Board Secretary Paul Kollmer-Dorsey, Director of Communications & External Affairs Lynne Weil, Director of Board Operations Oanh Tran, Director of Strategy and Development Bruce Sherman, Board Operations and Policy Adviser Ashley Lancaster, and Director for the Office of Technology, Services and Innovation Andre Mendes; David Ensor, Director of the Voice of America; Carlos Garcia-Perez, Director of the Office of Cuba Broadcasting via teleconference; Kevin Klose, Acting President of Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty via video conference; Libby Liu, President of Radio Free Asia; Brian Conniff, President of the Middle East Broadcasting Networks; and Dan Sreebny, Senior Advisor for BBG, Office of the Under Secretary for Public Diplomacy & Public Affairs.

### Witnessed:

---

Paul Kollmer-Dorsey  
Secretary

### Attachment:

1. Agenda for June 19, 2013 Meeting

## Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting

ATTACHMENT 8

From: Broadcasting Board of Governors  
Date: May 15, 2013  
Subject: **Minutes of the Continuation of April 11, 2013 Meeting**

The Broadcasting Board of Governors (BBG) held a meeting at 3:30 p.m. EDT as a continuation of the Board's April 11, 2013 meeting. The Governors had adjourned the April 11 meeting to a fixed time due to the lack of a quorum, in accordance with the BBG By-Laws and Robert's Rules of Order. The meeting was held at BBG Headquarters in Washington, D.C., which was attended by members of the public and also open for public observation via streaming on the BBG website.

The gathering was attended by the following Board members:

Governor Victor Ashe  
Governor Michael Meehan  
Under Secretary Sonenshine (via telephone)

Governors Michael Lynton and Susan McCue were not in attendance at the meeting.

Other persons in attendance are listed at the end of these minutes.

The agenda is set forth in Attachment 1.

Governor Meehan called the meeting to order and noted that meeting was being recorded and streamed live on the BBG website.

With the absence of Presiding Governor Lynton and the departure of Alternate Presiding Governor Mulhaupt, the Board agreed to have Governor Meehan act as chair *pro tem*.

Governor Meehan noted that there was no quorum of the Board so that the Board members were not able to make decisions at the meeting.

Governor Ashe noted World Press Freedom Day on May 3 and expressed deep concern about a couple of particularly egregious and troubling cases in countries that lack press freedom and where BBG reporters continue to face threats and harassment. He said that there was still no news on the fate of Alhurra's correspondent Bashar Fahmi, who has been missing in Syria for almost nine months. On behalf of the Board, Governor Ashe asked for anybody with information about Mr. Fahmi's whereabouts or well-being to step forward, and called for his immediate release.

## Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting

Governor Ashe stated that Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty's (RFE/RL) Turkmen Service correspondent Rovshen Yazmuhamedov was detained on May 6 in Turkmenistan and last seen by his parents at a Turkmen detention center. While no charges have been filed, Mr. Yazmuhamedov's fate was unknown; however, Amnesty International, Reporters Without Borders, Human Rights Watch had all appealed for Mr. Yazmuhamedov's immediate release amid concerns about the possible risk of torture while in detention. At Governor Ashe's invitation, RFE/RL Acting President Kevin Klose provided a brief update and expressed his concern for Mr. Yazmuhamedov's wellbeing.

Governor Ashe reported that, while on personal travel in Southeast Asia in early May, he also conducted business for the BBG. He said that his trip to Cambodia coincided with Radio Free Asia (RFA) President Libby Liu's visit, where they met with RFA's staff and journalists. Governor Ashe added that U.S. Ambassador William Todd also visited the RFA's office on May 3. Governor Ashe noted that people he met had volunteered information indicating RFA is their first choice for news and information. In Bangkok, Thailand, Governor Ashe met with International Broadcasting Bureau (IBB) Regional Marketing Officer Birgit Berg and Voice of America (VOA) correspondent Barry Newhouse.

Governor Meehan spoke about the trip to Moscow, Russia, which he and Governor McCue took in early May 2013 to consider management reorganizational issues related to RFE/RL's Moscow office and to discuss the challenges for U.S. international media. He noted that they met with journalists, human rights activists, VOA Moscow Bureau Chief Jim Brooke, and U.S. Ambassador Michael McFaul. He said that the trip was very productive and had inspired him to consider the possibility of cooperating and sharing of resources with other media. Governor Ashe noted that he plans to be in Moscow after visiting Prague, Czech Republic in mid-June. At Governor Ashe's request, RFE/RL Acting President Kevin Klose updated the Board on the resignation of RFE/RL Russian Service Director Masha Gessen effective April 30, the discussions with service members regarding their future employment, and the appointment of Irina Lagunina as Chief Editor of RFE/RL Russian Service based in Prague. Governor Ashe echoed Governor Meehan's appreciation for Mr. Klose's leadership, including his unique background and qualifications.

At Governor Ashe's invitation, Ms. Liu commented on the tense political situation in Cambodia and expressed her appreciation for the visit by U.S. Ambassador Todd and the Embassy's close coordination with RFA in light of increasing pressure and intimidation by the Cambodian government. VOA Director David Ensor noted that both VOA and RFA have good-sized audiences in Cambodia.

Mr. Klose emphasized the importance of Governors McCue and Meehan's trip to Moscow and described the positive impressions that the Board's visit had left among human rights activists. Mr. Klose then thanked the Governors and noted their trip resulted in further outreach and contacts that have been very helpful to RFE/RL.

There followed a brief discussion of the previously scheduled BBG meeting in Prague, Czech Republic on June 19. Governor Ashe announced that he would be in Prague while Governors

## Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting

McCue and Meehan would be in Washington participating via video conference. Under Secretary Sonenshine indicated that she would be traveling with the Secretary of State to India around that time but could be available by telephone.

Governor Ashe asked Carlos Garcia-Perez, Director of the Office of Cuba Broadcasting (OCB), for a report on the status of OCB's facilities as a result of an accidental fire. Mr. Garcia-Perez reported that the newsroom was being repaired, and that employees and contractors continued to work in cramped conditions to ensure no disruption in broadcasts for Cuba. In response to Governor Ashe's question related to furniture replacement cost, Governor Meehan reminded Governor Ashe of attorney-client privilege information and asked that the subject be discussed in Governors' Briefing which can be held after the meeting.

Under Secretary Sonenshine ended her participation by telephone to attend an urgent matter.

In accordance with the Board's prior protocol – guidance provided by the Governance Committee – for allowing members of the public to speak at meetings, Governor Meehan invited Ann Noonan, Executive Director of Committee for U.S. International Broadcasting (CUSIB) to speak for three minutes. Ms. Noonan congratulated Governors Ashe, McCue and Meehan for receiving the Champion of Free Speech Award from the New York Chapter of the Visual Artists Guild for their hard work in promoting and improving U.S. broadcasts to China, Tibet, Russia, and other nations without free media, and for their efforts in restoring the integrity of RFE/RL. She applauded the efforts by Mr. Klose to reform RFE/RL. She noted that CUSIB remains concerned that cuts to VOA and RFA broadcast services to China continue and implores the BBG to restore radio frequencies and money for these services. She also noted CUSIB's concern regarding the President's nomination to replace Governor Ashe while two other vacancies still remain unfilled, and that CUSIB requests that the White House reconsider its decision to replace Governor Ashe and submit new nominations to fill vacancies on the Board.

Paul Westpheling, General Vice President of American Federation of Government Employees (AFGE) Local 1812, also spoke. Mr. Westpheling discussed the 2009 case involving reduction in-force (RIF) at OCB. He also discussed the pending Negotiated Labor Management Agreement, including the Agency's last and best offer before implementation. At the IBB Director's invitation, April Cabral, IBB Senior Policy Advisor, explained the contract negotiations process and provided additional details on the status.

Governor Meehan requested that further discussion of the points raised by the Union should take place in Governors' Briefing and made a motion to adjourn the meeting. Governor Ashe seconded. The meeting was adjourned.

Other Attendees:

The following persons were also present during all or part of the meeting: International Broadcasting Bureau (IBB) Director Richard Lobo, IBB Deputy Director Jeffrey Trimble, IBB Chief of Staff Marie Lennon, Deputy General Counsel and Board Secretary Paul Kollmer-

## Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting

Dorsey, Director of Communications & External Affairs Lynne Weil, Director of Board Operations Oanh Tran, Congressional Coordinator Suzie Carroll, Director of Public Affairs Letitia King, Senior Policy Advisor April Cabral, Executive Assistant to the IBB Director Douglas Schuette, Director for the Office of Technology, Services and Innovation Andre Mendes, Director of the Office of Performance Review Kelu Chao, Associate General Counsel Elizabeth Parish, and Board Operations and Policy Advisor Ashley Lancaster; David Ensor, Director of the Voice of America (VOA); Carlos Garcia-Perez, Director of the Office of Cuba Broadcasting; Kevin Klose, Acting President of Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty; Libby Liu, President of Radio Free Asia (RFA); Kelley Sullivan, Vice President of Administration for the Middle East Broadcasting Networks (MBN); William Clancy, MBN Chief Financial Officer; Barbara Brady, VOA Chief of Staff; Rebecca McMenamin, VOA Acting Associate Director for Language Programming; Steve Redisch, VOA Executive Editor; and Dan Sreebny, Senior Advisor for BBG, Office of the Under Secretary for Public Diplomacy & Public Affairs.

Witnessed:

---

Paul Kollmer-Dorsey  
Secretary

Attachment:

1. Agenda - Continuation of April 11, 2013 Meeting

## Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting

ATTACHMENT 9

From: Broadcasting Board of Governors  
Date: April 11, 2013  
Subject: **Minutes of the BBG Meeting of April 11, 2013**

The Broadcasting Board of Governors (BBG) met today at BBG Headquarters in Washington, D.C. As a quorum was not present, the Governors were not able to make any decisions at the meeting. The meeting was attended by members of the public (as seating capacity allows) and was also open for public observation via streaming on the BBG website.

The following Board members were in attendance:

Governor Michael Meehan  
Governor Victor Ashe

Governor Michael Lynton, Governor Susan McCue, and Under Secretary for Public Diplomacy and Public Affairs Tara Sonenshine were not in attendance at the meeting.

Other persons in attendance are listed at the end of these minutes.

The meeting agenda is set forth in Attachment 1.

Governor Meehan announced that Governor Mulhaupt had stepped down from the Board, and that he was asked by his colleagues to preside at this meeting. He gave brief remarks thanking and honoring Governor Mulhaupt for his service on the Board and recognized Governor Mulhaupt's expertise on governance matters. He noted the absence of Presiding Governor Lynton, Governor McCue, and Under Secretary Sonenshine.

Governor Meehan stated that a quorum of the Board was not present, and therefore, the Board cannot make formal decisions. He added that meeting would be made available by webcast on the BBG website and open to public attendance.

Governor Meehan paused to mark the death of Mohammed Ali Nuxurkey, a Somali journalist who worked for Voice of America (VOA) as well as a private radio station in Mogadishu. He then highlighted recent threats to BBG journalists and to the mission of the Agency: (1) In Pakistan, Fayaz Zafar, a regular contributor to VOA's Deewa Radio and other local stations, narrowly escaped injury during an attack by suspected Taliban gunmen; (2) In Azerbaijan, Yafez Hasanov, a correspondent for Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty's (RFE/RL) Azerbaijani Service who covers events in the Nakhchivan exclave, is again under pressure from officials there; and (3) In Cambodia, the Cambodian government exerted unacceptable private and public pressure

## Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting

on Radio Free Asia (RFA) to self-censor their reporting of issues sensitive to the government and resorted to threatening legal action against the individual investigative reporters involved. Governor Meehan also noted that there has been no news on the fate of Alhurra reporter Bashar Fahmi, who has been missing in Syria for more than seven months.

Governor Meehan commended Office of Strategy and Development (OSD) employee Joyce Ngoh, Regional Marketing Officer for West Africa, for her extraordinary efforts in securing the FM license to enable the launch of VOA French to Africa programming on the BBG's newest 24/7 FM in the Malian capital of Bamako. He also commended Joan Mower, Director of Business Development for OSD, for securing \$600,000 in new funding for special programming for Mali and the Sahel which will be distributed on an affiliate FM station, as well on affiliate stations throughout the Sahel, enabling VOA to stand up a Bambara-language program for Mali. He said that their efforts have directly contributed to advancing the BBG mission and strategy to expand its reach and impact in places where people are living under repressive regimes and in conflict zones such as Mali. He added that these efforts, achieved in concert with other government agencies such as U.S. Africa Command (Africom), were examples of government agencies working together and leveraging resources where possible. On behalf of the Board, Governor Meehan expressed his appreciation for their work.

At Governor Meehan's invitation, Governor Ashe gave a report on the recent Governance Committee meeting. Governor Ashe stated that, as a result of Governor Mulhaupt's resignation, the Committee recommended Governor McCue to serve as chair of Governance Committee. He noted there was a discussion of the impact of sequestration and that the Committee urged the VOA Director to find a way to restore funding for *Issues in the News* program. The Committee instructed the Agency's directors to provide a financial analysis of the money that could be saved by the Agency by furloughing categories of non-union employees, and a legal opinion whether there are any restrictions with regard to furloughing categories of management employees due to the effects of sequestration. The Committee considered and recommended adoption of a protocol for allowing members of the public, on a first-come, first-served based, to attend open meetings of the Board and to speak for up to three (3) minutes each at the end of the meeting, subject to a limit of ten (10) speakers. Governor Ashe announced that members of the Strategy and Budget Committee will hold a town hall meeting on the FY 2014 budget on May 15.

Due to lack of a quorum, the Governors voted to fix a time for an adjourned meeting and agreed to resume the April 11, 2013 meeting on the afternoon of April 24, 2013.

Governor Meehan provided highlights of the March 14 and April 10, 2013 meetings of the Strategy and Budget Committee. In March, the Committee discussed the importance of research and supported continued funding of Agency research projects and heard a discussion of Africa mobile strategy involving a panel of subject matter experts which was led by the Director of the Office of Digital and Design Innovation. Recently, the Committee had a discussion with RFE/RL and VOA about the current political situation and the challenging media landscape in Russia. At Governor Meehan's request, Bruce Sherman, Director of Strategy and Development, confirmed that meetings with the broadcast entities on the 2013 Language Service Review (LSR)

## Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting

were already underway, and that the LSR results and recommendations would be provided to the Strategy and Budget Committee in the coming months.

Governor Meehan welcomed Dan Sreebny who is now representing the State Department's Office of the Under Secretary Office of Public Diplomacy and Public Affairs.

Joining the meeting by video conference, Carlos Garcia-Perez, Director of the Office of Cuba Broadcasting (OCB), gave his report. Mr. Garcia-Perez highlighted a special visit at OCB headquarters by Yoani Sánchez, blogger for *Generación Y*. He publicly expressed his condolences to Congresswoman Ros-Lehtinen for a recent loss of her father who was a strong supporter of freedom in Cuba, and noted the Congresswoman's continued support for U.S. international broadcasting to Cuba. He then showed a video of the various programming content generated by OCB's journalists based in Cuba. Governor Ashe commented on a case involving the reductions-in-force of employees at OCB in 2009. Governor Meehan commended Mr. Garcia-Perez on the consistent growth of traffic on OCB's website.

VOA Director David Ensor informed the Board that VOA had been focused primarily on budget issues dealing with sequestration and Fiscal Year 2014 Budget Request. He noted his recent briefing (with IBB Director Lobo and OCB Director Garcia-Perez) to all Agency employees on workplace engagement and action plan. He presented a slide show of VOA's Persian Service celebrating Nowruz (Persian New Year), children of Pakistan raving VOA Deewa Radio's new children program called *Jump Jump Camel*, and his trip to Nigeria, Mali, and Senegal of Africa to assess developments and to take part in agreement signing of new affiliates in those countries. Governor Ashe suggested some improvements to letters to contractors when notifying them of their contract termination due to sequestration. Governor Meehan congratulated U.S. Department of State, VOA and IBB staffs on the successes in Africa as a result of their collaborations.

RFE/RL Acting President Kevin Klose briefly described the work of journalists from the Vaclav Havel Journalism Fellowship program, thanked the IBB Office of Technology, Services, and Innovation (TSI) for timely meeting their transmission needs, emphasized the constant need for change while maintaining the highest journalism standards, and encouraged collaboration among U.S. international broadcasters where it makes sense best described as a "parallax" concept. Governor Ashe announced that, as a result of Dennis Mulhaupt's resignation, the RFE/RL Board of Directors had recently approved the appointment of Susan McCue to serve as Chair and Victor Ashe as Vice Chair of RFE/RL corporate board. He noted Governor McCue's interest in visiting RFE/RL's Moscow office in May and expressed the Board's desire to meet in Prague in June. Governor Ashe also stated his intention to visit RFE/RL's Moscow office following the June Board meeting, and described his plans to visit RFE/RL's offices during a personal trip to Kyrgyzstan, Kazakhstan, and Uzbekistan.

RFA President Libby Liu referred the Board to her written monthly report in the briefing book for details on the month's activities and announced the appointment of Mr. Tenzin Namgyal Tethong as RFA's new Tibetan Service Director. Ms. Liu played a video footage that was posted on Facebook by RFA regarding the communal violence in Meiktila, Burma.

## Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting

Brian Conniff, President of the Middle East Broadcasting Networks (MBN), highlighted MBN's coverage of President Obama's trip to the Middle East, coverage of the 10<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the Iraq war, coverage of the Arab Summit in Doha, Qatar, and interviews with the Libyan Prime Minister and the Chairman of the Joint Chiefs of Staff, General Martin Dempsey. Mr. Conniff announced that Alhurra's Facebook page had surpassed a major milestone – one million fans from all over the Middle East.

Noting the Governance Committee's guidance on a protocol for allowing members of the public to speak at meetings, Governor Meehan invited Ann Noonan, Executive Director of Committee for U.S. International Broadcasting (CUSIB) to speak for three minutes. On behalf of CUSIB, Ms. Noonan congratulated Governors McCue and Ashe on their appointment on the RFE/RL corporate board, Chair and Vice Chair, respectively. Ms. Noonan also congratulated Mr. Tenzin Namgyal Tethong on his selection as RFA Tibetan Service Director and noted that CUSIB remains concerned for the self-immolations in Tibet. She said CUSIB is opposed to the proposed elimination of VOA radio broadcasts to Iran and the reduction of radio broadcasts to Afghanistan and Pakistan, and that funding for these programs can be found within IBB's resources. She added that CUSIB is also opposed to the current sequester cuts to VOA Cantonese and Mandarin Services, and stressed the importance of maintaining short wave and medium wave radio transmissions to China. She urged RFE/RL to settle its pending overseas discrimination lawsuits brought by former foreign employees in Prague. In conclusion, Ms. Noonan stated that CUSIB remains hopeful that RFE/RL employees who were let go in Moscow would be brought back to work. Governor Ashe thanked Ms. Noonan for her inquiry that resulted in the Board's development of a protocol for allowing members of the public to speak at meetings.

Tim Shamble, President of American Federation of Government Employees (AFGE) Local 1812, also spoke. Mr. Shamble raised three issues of concern: (1) A case involving the reductions-in-force of employees at OCB in 2009, including the Agency's appeal to the Federal Labor Relations Authority's decision; (2) A proposal in the FY 2014 budget to shift funds from the Edward R. Murrow Transmitting Station in Greenville, North Carolina, to OCB; and (3) A request by Agency management to remove any reference to "fairness", "dignity", or "respect" in the AFGE contract that was currently being negotiated. Governor Ashe expressed his desire to see the AFGE contract negotiations come to closure and urged employees to attend the town hall meeting on May 15 to address their issues of concern.

IBB Director Dick Lobo reported on the progress in the implementation of the Smith-Mundt Modernization Act that goes into effect on July 2 and invited Ms. April Cabral to summarize the work completed to date, including the collaboration among broadcast entities for a draft of internal policy and external regulations. Governor Ashe asked for a short summary and a copy of the draft internal policy and external regulations to be submitted to the Office of Management and Budget. He suggested that there be a period for public comment on the drafts. Governor Meehan expressed his appreciation for a public comment period, but urged that the progress continues accordingly as this provides new opportunities for the Agency to highlight and showcase its capabilities as a global media organization.

## Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting

IBB Deputy Director Jeffrey Trimble announced that the President's budget for FY 2014 had been posted on the BBG's website and noted the President's continued support for U.S. international broadcasting in light of difficult financial environment. He noted that the President's had proposed \$13.9 million for new investments and \$12.5 million for the BBG's Internet Anti-Censorship (IAC) program. Governor Ashe pointed out that the FY 2014 budget includes a legislative proposal to establish a Chief Executive Officer (CEO) for U.S. international broadcasting. In response to Governor Ashe's question, Ms. Lynne Weil, Director of Communications and External Affairs, confirmed that there will be customary hearings on the FY 2014 budget but that there might be some interests on the Hill in the future to hold a hearing on the BBG's budget. Governor Ashe felt that the Board would certainly welcome a private hearing on the BBG's budget but that Congress may wish to hold a public hearing to enhance the public's knowledge of the proposals presented in the FY 2014 budget. Governor Meehan expressed his approval for the increase in funding for the IAC program and stated that the efforts by TSI, RFA and Open Technology Fund are essential to 21<sup>st</sup> century communications environment.

Andre Mendes, IBB Director for TSI, recognized the extraordinary work by TSI's frequency team for reprogramming the network in response to the sequestration and FY 2014 budget, namely Steve Bratcher, Terry Balazs, Connie Stephens, Veris Burton, and Dannetta Dominick. In response to Governor Ashe's question whether the sequestration and FY 2014 budget would adversely impact the Edward R. Murrow Transmitting Station in Greenville, North Carolina, Mr. Mendes replied that there are sequestration transmission reductions, and that the station would be responsible for the transmissions for OCB in FY 2014.

Ms. Weil gave a report on the activities of the Office of Communications and External Affairs. She noted the hard work by the Office to pull together materials for the roll-out of the Agency's FY 2014 budget submission and the town hall on May 15, and thanked Mr. Trimble and the Office of Chief Financial Officer for their cooperation. At Governor Ashe's request, Ms. Weil updated the Board on Jeff Shell's paperwork for his nomination as BBG Chairman and Member to the Senate Foreign Relations Committee and noted that there might be other BBG nominees in the near future.

Due to lack of a quorum, Governor Meehan announced that the Board plans to meet on April 24 to continue and adjourn today's meeting, and that the Strategy and Budget Committee plans to meet on May 15 and June 19.

Other Attendees:

The following persons were also present during all or part of the meeting: International Broadcasting Bureau (IBB) Director Richard Lobo, IBB Deputy Director Jeffrey Trimble, IBB Chief of Staff Marie Lennon, Deputy General Counsel and Board Secretary Paul Kollmer-Dorsey, Director of Communications & External Affairs Lynne Weil, Director of Board Operations Oanh Tran, Director of Strategy and Development Bruce Sherman, Director of Public Affairs Letitia King, Senior Policy Advisor April Cabral, Director for the Office of Technology,

## **Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting**

Services and Innovation Andre Mendes, Director of the Office of Performance Review Kelu Chao, and Associate Director for Program Support Gary Thatcher; David Ensor, Director of the Voice of America (VOA); Carlos Garcia-Perez, Director of the Office of Cuba Broadcasting via video conference; Kevin Klose, Acting President of Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty; Libby Liu, President of Radio Free Asia (RFA); Brian Conniff, President of the Middle East Broadcasting Networks (MBN); Barbara Brady, VOA Chief of Staff; Rebecca McMenamin, VOA Acting Associate Director for Language Programming; Jay Tolson, VOA Chief of French to Africa Service; Kyle King, VOA Director of the Office of Public Relations; Norman Thompson, RFA Vice President of Administration and Finance; Kelley Sullivan, MBN Vice President of Administration; Dan Sreebny, Senior Advisor for BBG, Office of the Under Secretary for Public Diplomacy & Public Affairs; and Elizabeth A. Whitaker, Inspector, Office of Inspector General.

Witnessed:

---

Paul Kollmer-Dorsey  
Secretary

Attachment:

1. Agenda for April 11, 2013 Meeting

## Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting

ATTACHMENT 10

From: Broadcasting Board of Governors  
Date: February 22, 2013  
Subject: **Minutes of the Governors' Briefing (Open to Public Attendance and Webcast) of February 22, 2013**

The Broadcasting Board of Governors (BBG) met in Governors' Briefing and made a portion of the briefing available by webcast and open to public attendance (as seating capacity allows).

The Governors' Briefing was held at BBG Headquarters in Washington, D.C., and was attended by members of the public and was also open for public observation via streaming on the BBG website.

The Governors' Briefing was attended by the following Board members:

Alternate Presiding Governor Dennis Mulhaupt  
Governor Victor Ashe  
Governor Susan McCue (via video conference)  
Governor Michael Meehan (via telephone)  
Under Secretary for Public Diplomacy & Public Affairs Tara Sonenshine

Governor Michael Lynton was not in attendance at the meeting.

Other persons in attendance are listed at the end of these minutes.

The agenda of the Governors' Briefing is set forth in Attachment 1.

Alternate Presiding Governor Mulhaupt called the meeting to order and noted that, in March 2012, the Board designated him to serve as "Alternate Presiding Governor" to preside at meetings of the Board in the event that the Presiding Governor cannot be physically present at the meeting. He noted the absence of Presiding Governor Lynton.

The Alternate Presiding Governor announced that this meeting was not an official governing board meeting as defined by the Government in the Sunshine Act, and, therefore, the Board's decision making today will be constrained by the requirements of the Government in the Sunshine Act.

Alternate Presiding Governor Mulhaupt noted that Governor McCue was participating via video link from the Voice of America's (VOA) office in Los Angeles, California. Governor Meehan was also participating by phone from Florida.

## Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting

On behalf of the Board, the Alternate Presiding Governor expressed a concern for Alhurra's correspondent Bashar Fahmi, who remains missing and incommunicado since his disappearance in August. He called on anybody with information on Mr. Fahmi's whereabouts to step forward, and called for immediate release of Mr. Fahmi.

The Alternate Presiding Governor highlighted other threats to BBG journalists and to the mission of the Agency: (1) In Tajikistan, Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty's (RFE/RL) Radio Ozodi was targeted by an Internet blackout that included its website and Facebook, and Abduqayum Qayumov, a parliamentary correspondent since 2001, was banned from reporting for RFE/RL, the result of a refusal by the country's Ministry of Foreign Affairs to honor a routine request to accredit him; (2) In Iran, as many as 15 Radio Farda journalists were targeted with sophisticated online attacks, and at least three Radio Farda journalists were the subject of fake Facebook profiles and blogs that post false and even scandalous information with the aim of discrediting them; and (3) In China, a state television report accused Voice of America broadcasts of encouraging self-immolations in Tibet, and of using secret code to send messages to people inside Tibet. On behalf of the Board, Alternate Presiding Governor Mulhaupt condemned these actions, which violate international standards by targeting journalists who are doing their jobs and suppressing independent media.

Alternate Presiding Governor Mulhaupt recognized Paul Foldi as a guest to the meeting and acknowledged Mr. Foldi's closely engagement with U.S. international broadcasting for the past decade. He noted that, as a member of the staff for the Senate Foreign Relations Committee, Mr. Foldi's portfolio includes America's public diplomacy efforts, including the BBG. He also noted that Mr. Foldi will be leaving the Committee and, thus, expressed his gratitude to Mr. Foldi for his service.

As Chair of the Governance Committee, Governor Mulhaupt reported on its recent Committee meeting. Governor Mulhaupt said that, due to an extended briefing on the budget, the Governance Committee met in the morning in an unfortunately truncated session in order to discuss a number of topics relating to the restructuring of U.S. international broadcasting. He added that, while the Committee members believe that the Board should continue to pursue the creation of a Chief Executive Officer (CEO) of U.S. international broadcasting, there was a consensus among the Committee members that creation of a CEO position would be best pursued through legislation. He noted that the Committee also received a briefing from Agency staff on the progress made to date by the International Broadcasting Bureau (IBB) Director's working group on the International Broadcasting Innovation Act (IBIA), including developing a draft IBIA legislation, and commended the IBIA working group for its work to date. In conclusion, Governor Mulhaupt mentioned the Committee's brief discussion of a recommendation in the inspection report by the Office of the Inspector General (OIG) dealing with the BBG practice of maintaining "mirror" boards of directors of Radio Free Asia (RFA) and the Middle East Broadcasting Networks (MBN), where the individuals who are BBG Governors are also Directors of the Boards of each of the Agency's grantee corporations. Governor Mulhaupt noted that Robert Torres, OIG Senior Inspector and Coordinator for International Broadcasting, was in attendance and explained to the Committee about the OIG's intention for

## Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting

that particular recommendation. He further noted that the Committee had indicated to Mr. Torres that it plans to take up this and other recommendations at its next Committee meeting.

Governor Ashe commented that the Board would have achieved a quorum at today's meeting once Governor McCue appears on video via a link from VOA's bureau in Los Angeles. He suggested that for future meetings, an announcement of the Board meeting should be placed in the Federal Register in order to comply with the Government in the Sunshine Act even though a quorum of the Board might not be determined until the day of the meeting. He added that, in absence of a quorum, the Board would simply not be able to conduct a formal meeting or take formal votes.

Joining by phone, Governor Meehan gave a brief report of the Strategy and Budget Committee. He stated that the Committee had a meeting on February 6, 2013, as part of its monthly sessions, to receive a briefing on the advancement of all strategic initiatives and as recent as this morning to discuss sequestration matters. He said the Committee had instructed IBB senior management and entity heads to propose a plan that would minimize the amount of furloughs to the extent possible while coming up with the reductions as required by the Office of Management and Budget pursuant to sequestration measures. Governor Meehan announced that the Committee will meet on March 14 to take up issues as they relate to the implementation of the BBG strategy such as Iran, Russia, China and Cuba. The Committee will also assemble a panel of subject matter experts to discuss Africa strategy (mobile and radio), including a discussion of modern technology efforts that can help expand audiences in Africa. Governor Meehan commended the staff on the addition of Songhai- and Bambara-language programming, which recently received Congressional concurrence, to enhance VOA's existing French to Africa/Mali broadcasting efforts.

Governor McCue joined the meeting via a video link from VOA's bureau in Los Angeles.

At the Alternate Presiding Governor's invitation, Office of Cuba Broadcasting (OCB) Director Carlos Garcia-Perez gave his report. Mr. Garcia-Perez said that OCB's initiative to have journalists on the ground continues to be successful and read a statement mourning the loss of Mr. Al Sledge, who served as AeroMarti Station Manager until he passed away unexpectedly on January 30, 2013. He then played a short video highlighting OCB's recent programs. Governor Ashe asked for a procedural status of the litigation case involving the 2009 OCB reductions-in-force, and if needed, a private update with the Board.

VOA Director David Ensor began his report by highlighting a fiber optic capability to the Capitol Hill for various and instantaneous photo shots, the allegations by Chinese state television (CCTV) that VOA broadcasts encourage self-immolations in Tibet, VOA Russian Service's affiliation with the Russian Business Channel to file reports from the New York Stock Exchange, and VOA's programming to Mali. Mr. Ensor briefly mentioned recent public outreach efforts, including Governor Meehan's appearance on the Bill Press show, VOA's exclusive interview with Japan's Defense Minister after new North Korean nuclear test, and a speaking event at the Florida World Affairs Council in Naples, FL.

## Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting

The Alternate Presiding Governor welcomed Kevin Klose as acting President and CEO of Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty and thanked the Board, especially Governor McCue, RFE/RL's Vice-Chair, who spearheaded the effort to recruit Mr. Klose. Mr. Klose reported on the recent language service review (LSR) sessions in Prague, which included a visit by IBB Deputy Director Jeff Trimble, IBB Director of Strategy and Development Bruce Sherman, and IBB Program Analyst Karen Larson. He then played a short video produced by RFE/RL's Afghanistan Service titled, "At Afghan Brickworks, A Family Trapped in a Cycle of Debt."

RFA President Libby Liu highlighted RFA's collaboration with IBB Office of Digital and Design Innovation on a timeline.js project for both the Vietnamese and the English websites detailing the ongoing and increasingly active crackdown on dissidents in Vietnam. Ms. Liu thanked the IBB Director of the Office of Technology, Services, and Innovation (TSI) for the establishment of an MPLS (Multi-Protocol Label Switching) line for RFA Burmese TV broadcast and for distribution of its radio broadcast channels. She played a short video of a Han Chinese artist advocating Tibetan cause.

Governor Ashe reported on his trip to Cambodia in January 2013, during which he met with broadcasters from RFA and VOA at their offices there. He paid a visit to jailed Cambodian radio station chief Mam Sonando in a prison outside Phnom Penh. He noted that the cost to the Agency for his trip was less than \$600.

MBN President Brian Conniff shared the Board's concern for Alhurra's correspondent Bashar Fahmi and noted that MBN is still pursuing all leads to Mr. Fahmi's whereabouts and had nominated Mr. Fahmi for numerous awards. Mr. Conniff announced the launch of a rebranding of Alhurra on-air look to improve its appeal and attractiveness. He also announced the debut of Alhurra Television's popular series, *Rayheen ala Feen*, on Al Hayat as the first of its kind television program that tells the story of post-revolution Egypt through the lives of five young Egyptians. U/S Sonenshine asked about placement of MBN's content on local indigenous outlets. Mr. Conniff replied that *Rayheen ala Feen* is a marketing experiment in hope to raise more awareness of Alhurra.

U/S Sonenshine asked about the activities of VOA and RFA in Cambodia and whether their content and/or mission are distinct enough to warrant their presence in the same country. Ms. Liu and Mr. Ensor described the different mission and content of RFA and VOA. Governor Ashe offered his views on overlap in broadcasting by RFA and VOA. He noted that, in his meeting with U.S. Ambassador William Todd in Cambodia, the Ambassador was appreciative that RFA and VOA are active in Cambodia given the media environment there.

IBB Director Dick Lobo announced the selection of Ms. Mary Catherine Pleffner for the Chief Financial Officer (CFO) position, described Ms. Pleffner's professional credentials, and said her appointment would be effective March 11. As the beginning of a multi-year effort to change the culture at BBG, Mr. Lobo updated the Board on the Agency's contract with the Partnership for Public Service, including development of an action plan to improve working environment and training of agency staff to become agency "Action Leaders." Mr. Lobo announced that the Agency recently held an open house for its newly renovated fitness center on January 23, and

## Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting

that the enhancements were an initiative of the Union- Management forum. In closing, he briefly mentioned a number of events at the Agency to commemorate Black History month.

IBB Director of TSI Andre Mendes gave a report on current projects undertaken by TSI. He reported on the status of FM transmission projects in Africa and Afghanistan. He presented two new devices that have been produced under the Internet Anti-Censorship programs, including a mini PC stick drive containing a list of websites that can be plugged into any computer in any location to monitor whether the listed websites are blocked or not, and an electronic memory card containing content information of any U.S. international broadcaster that can be downloaded to a computer from any country with limited or no Internet connectivity such as Cuba. He then demonstrated the audio/video reception quality for the VOA Mandarin program, *VOA Weishi* (Satellite TV in China). He also demonstrated a monitoring tool that enables the Agency to assess the number of users in countries with heavy Internet censorship executing UltraSurf software to access the worldwide web safely and freely.

IBB Deputy Director Jeffrey Trimble gave a fiscal report. For FY 2013, Mr. Trimble stated that the Agency is operating under a Continuing Resolution until end of March. He said the budget for FY 2014 was still pending. He reported that the Agency was in the process of planning for possible sequestration and would minimize impact on the workforce to the extent possible. Governor Ashe thanked Mr. Trimble for temporarily filling in the CFO position. Mr. Trimble noted that IBB Chief of Staff Marie Lennon also shared the CFO responsibilities.

Lynne Weil, Director of Communications and External Affairs, briefly summarized the following activities and events: coordination with several IBB offices in order to ensure smooth implementation of the Smith-Mundt Modernization Act that goes into effect on July 2; design and layout for the 2012 BBG annual report; planning and marketing for the open house of the newly renovated Health and Wellness Center; launch of *Notebook* blog, featuring stories and photos from the field and the newsroom, profiles of individuals working at the agency, and information on international broadcasting history; and creation of more attractive exterior banners advertising the VOA studio tours to be displayed outside the Cohen Building.

Governors Ashe noted that a few Governors were scheduled to meet with key Congressional staff in the wake of the release of reports by the OIG and the GAO.

The Board accepted a request from Ann Noonan, Executive Director of Committee for U.S. International Broadcasting (CUSIB) to speak for three minutes. Ms. Noonan welcomed the appointment of Kevin Klose, recognized the attendance of President of Women's Rights in China Ms. Jing Zhang, stressed the importance of the news flow to China and Tibet, expressed CUSIB's support for VOA and surrogate broadcasters in light of the recent GAO report on overlap in broadcasting, and noted CUSIB's disapproval of the OIG inspection report attacking the authority of BBG members and the efforts of Governor Ashe.

Other Attendees:

## Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting

The following persons were also present during all or part of the meeting: International Broadcasting Bureau (IBB) Director Richard Lobo, IBB Deputy Director Jeffrey Trimble, IBB Chief of Staff Marie Lennon, Deputy General Counsel and Board Secretary Paul Kollmer-Dorsey, Director of Communications & External Affairs Lynne Weil, Director of Board Operations Oanh Tran, Congressional Coordinator Suzie Carroll, Director of Public Affairs Letitia King, and IBB Director for the Office of Technology, Services and Innovation Andre Mendes; David Ensor, Director of the Voice of America (VOA); Carlos Garcia-Perez, Director of the Office of Cuba Broadcasting (OCB); Kevin Klose, Acting President of Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty (RFE/RL); Libby Liu, President of Radio Free Asia (RFA); Brian Conniff, President of the Middle East Broadcasting Networks (MBN); Barbara Brady, VOA Chief of Staff; Steve Redisch, VOA Executive Editor; Rebecca McMenamin, VOA Acting Associate Director for Language Programming; John Giambalvo, RFE/RL Vice President and Chief Financial Officer; Benjamin Herman, RFE/RL Assistant Secretary; Bernadette Burns, RFA General Counsel; Anne Noble, MBN General Counsel; and Aviva Rosenthal, Chief of Staff to the Under Secretary for Public Diplomacy & Public Affairs.

Witnessed:

---

Paul Kollmer-Dorsey  
Secretary

Attachment:

1. Agenda for February 22, 2013 Governors' Briefing

## Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting

ATTACHMENT 11

From: Broadcasting Board of Governors  
Date: December 14, 2012  
Subject: **Minutes of the BBG Meeting of December 14, 2012**

The Broadcasting Board of Governors (BBG) met today at BBG Headquarters in Washington, D.C. The meeting was attended by members of the public and was also open for public observation via streaming on the BBG website.

The meeting was attended by the following Board members:

Presiding Governor Michael Lynton  
Alternate Presiding Governor Dennis Mulhaupt  
Governor Victor Ashe  
Governor Susan McCue  
Governor Michael Meehan  
Under Secretary for Public Diplomacy & Public Affairs Tara Sonenshine

Governor Dana Perino was not in attendance at the meeting.

Other persons in attendance are listed at the end of these minutes.

The agenda of the meeting is set forth in Attachment 1.

Presiding Governor Lynton called the meeting to order and noted that, in February 2012, the Board designated him to serve as “Presiding Governor” on an interim basis.

The Presiding Governor announced that the meeting was being held in compliance with the Government in the Sunshine Act and streamed live over the Internet at the BBG website. He noted the absence of Governor Perino.

Presiding Governor Lynton said there was nothing more important than the protection of BBG journalists and responding to threats to them. On behalf of the Board, Presiding Governor Lynton expressed concern over the lack of information about Alhurra correspondent Bashar Fahmi and called on anyone with information about Mr. Fahmi’s whereabouts to come forward and asked for his immediate release to the safety of his family. The Presiding Governor welcomed the support of the South East Europe media organization in Istanbul, which awarded Bashar Fahmi and Cüneyt Ünal its 10<sup>th</sup> annual human rights award on December 6. (Mr. Ünal also went missing on August 20, 2012 and was held captive for almost three months, but since had been reunited safely with his family.) Presiding Governor Lynton stated the BBG will continue to investigate every possible avenue to secure Mr. Fahmi’s release.

## Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting

The Presiding Governor highlighted recent attacks against the free flow of information, including the harassment and detention of BBG journalists around the world: (1) In Cuba, Antonio Rodiles, the Cuba-based independent producer of the Emmy-nominated TV Martí program *Estado de SATS*, was jailed in Havana after seeking information on the arrest of two Cuban dissidents and later released, and charges of “resisting authority” were dropped; (2) In Azerbaijan, Yafez Hasanov, a Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty (RFE/RL) correspondent, had received repeated telephone calls and text messages from unidentified persons threatening reprisals against him and his family if he did not stop investigating the death last year of a man in the custody of Azerbaijan’s Ministry of National Security; (3) In Tajikistan, earlier this month the government blocked access to the website of RFE/RL’s Tajik Service, Radio Ozodi, only days after authorities blocked Facebook inside the country; (4) In Egypt, an Alhurra reporter covering the constitutional crisis in Egypt received threats on his cellphone from an unidentified person; (5) In Angola, Voice of America (VOA) is concerned about its local reporter, Antonio Capalandanda, who was robbed of his equipment while walking on the street, and is looking into the circumstances surrounding the robbery; and (6) In Zimbabwe, VOA reporters face renewed threats from the ruling party Zanf, which wants to discourage independent reporting, and the head of the party’s media, Science and Technology Committee referred to VOA’s Studio 7 as hostile foreign media, and called on the government to do more to jam its signal. On behalf of the Board, Presiding Governor Lynton called on governments to cease the intimidation and incarceration of journalists, and to hold accountable those who try to obstruct their reporting or harm them for simply doing their jobs.

On a positive note, the Presiding Governor announced that the Board was pleased to learn that Khadija Ismailova, an investigative journalist for RFE/RL’s Azerbaijan Service, had received the “Courage in Journalism” award from the International Women’s Media Foundation. Ms. Ismayilova was honored for her unflinching reporting in the face of continued harassment, slander campaigns, and blackmail for her investigations into corruption within the Azerbaijan’s ruling family. Presiding Governor Lynton said that the Board will hear later from Ms. Ismayilova during the RFE/RL President’s report.

There followed a Board vote to adopt the draft minutes of October 11, 2012 meeting.

As Chair of the Governance Committee, Governor Mulhaupt reported on its meetings on November 8 and December 13, 2012. Governor Mulhaupt noted that the IBB Director had provided to the Committee for its consideration a plan to create a Chief Executive Officer (CEO) under the Board’s existing legislation, as required by the Board’s September 2012 decision. He commended the IBB Director and his staff for their efforts in developing the plan and in working with the BBG-sponsored broadcasting entities to obtain their input on the feasibility of the plan. Governor Mulhaupt said the Committee had considered the IBB Director’s plan but needs more time to study the plan in detail and to work out a few of the more difficult details of the plan as there are important limitations due to the features of the existing International Broadcasting Act. He added that the sense of the majority of the Committee members is that proceeding with the creation of a CEO under existing legislation, notwithstanding these limitations, is a meaningful first step toward the achievement of the Board’s objective of providing a day-to-day executive

## Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting

with authority over both the federal and non-federal elements of U.S. international broadcasting. Governor Mulhaupt then proposed the Committee's recommendations relating to the creation of a CEO under existing legislation and invited comments from Board members.

In Governor Ashe's opinion, he felt that a plan for a CEO overseeing the International Broadcasting Bureau (IBB), the Voice of America (VOA), and the Office of Cuba Broadcasting (OCB) is worth pursuing and should move forward. He also felt that there may be major legal and Congressional issues with the CEO's authority vis-a-vis the BBG-sponsored grantees, which are private non-profit corporations. He urged the Board to seek an independent legal opinion in order to determine legally appropriate governance relationships between the CEO and the BBG-sponsored grantees. He suggested that a Congressional notification and participation on the issue would be helpful. He stated that the success of the plan would be determined in the details, such as what authorities the CEO would have, how the CEO would be selected, what are the duties the CEO would have with respect to the Board and its members, and what is the process. Governor Ashe said that, conceptually, he is supportive of the plan, but reserving final judgment until more details are presented.

Governor Mulhaupt reported that the Governance Committee also discussed guidelines for international travel that would apply to both Governors and members of Agency senior staff. He said the crux of these guidelines is that the Board should be informed, where practicable, about international travel undertaken by the Governors and members of Agency senior staff, including the objective and costs of the travel. Agency senior staff should report about their international travel to the IBB Director who will prepare a report for the Board. Governor Mulhaupt noted that the guidelines were developed by Governor McCue in consultation with other Governors. He then invited Governor McCue to discuss the guidelines that she had proposed. Governor McCue noted that the guidelines were developed for the purposes of notification, awareness, and transparency, and that they can be updated, modified and expanded further at future Board meetings. Governor Ashe expressed appreciation for Governor McCue's work in proposing the travel guidelines and noted that the Office of Inspector General had pointed out in its recent inspection that the BBG does not have a written travel policy. He noted that the actual cost of international travel by Board members is quite small compared to senior staff members who travel often because of their line of work. He said that Board members need to travel to places, both domestic and international, in order to better understand the issues. As an example, Governor Ashe mentioned his recent travel to Burma with Governors McCue and Meehan, Radio Free Asia (RFA) President Libby Liu, and VOA Director David Ensor.

Governor Mulhaupt stated that, at its meeting the previous day, the Governance Committee also discussed the Board's entire meeting dates in 2013. Governor Mulhaupt said that the sense of the Committee is that the number of plenary Board meetings should be reduced to a total of six (6) meetings. He noted that the Committee recommends holding a meeting every other month beginning in February 2013 and announced the dates for meetings as proposed by the Committee. Governor Ashe commented that the proposed dates represent a substantial change from prior practices of the Board, and that it made sense to meet every other month so that the Board could better manage and have more productive meetings while the Committees would meet during the months when the plenary Board does not meet to discuss specific issues.

## Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting

In conclusion, Governor Mulhaupt asked the Board to consider the reports of the Committee's meetings of March 7, March 9 and September 13, 2012.

At about 1:35 p.m., Governor Meehan joined the meeting.

The following Governors introduced resolutions honoring employees for their service: Governor McCue introduced a resolution honoring Mr. John Lennon, VOA Senior Advisor for Strategy; Governor Ashe introduced a resolution honoring Ms. Maryjean Buhler, former Chief Financial Officer; and Governors McCue and Meehan introduced a resolution honoring Ms. Dana Perino for her service on the Board.

At the Presiding Governor's invitation, Governor Meehan spoke about the two recent separate panels with internal and external experts that were assembled by the Strategy and Budget Committee to discuss U.S. international broadcasting in Russia and Iran. He thanked the expert panelists, RFE/RL staff, and all participants for the robust discussions which will be helpful in developing BBG strategy in those markets. He mentioned that a discussion of Africa mobile strategy had been tentatively planned for January. Governor Meehan reported that, through the course of Committee meetings in November, the Strategy and Budget Committee had discussions of broadcasting efforts in Mali-Nigeria and China as well as a discussion of Internet Anti-Censorship (IAC) projects. With respect to IAC, Governor Meehan noted a recent trip to Burma and India by a team of technical experts in order to collect on the ground data and information to help understand the challenges and technology efforts there.

There followed a trip report by Governors Meehan, McCue and Ashe on their visit to Burma. The Governors described their meetings with government officials and private media companies, including a signing ceremony, also attended by VOA Director Ensor, for VOA to enter an agreement with Skynet to broadcast via direct-to-home satellite in Burma. Both Governors McCue and Ashe expressed their cautious optimism as Burma makes efforts to transition to a democratic government. Governor Meehan echoed Governor McCue's point on the importance of maintaining VOA and RFA presence in the country.

Presiding Governor Lynton stated that, as a result of the strategy session, the Board has initiated a review of recent developments in Moscow regarding RFE/RL. The review, lasting approximately six months, will be led by IBB Deputy Director Jeffrey Trimble and will provide a perspective on the current and future media landscape in Russia. The Board thanked Mr. Trimble for accepting this assignment and for the recommendations he will make.

RFE/RL President Steven Korn announced Radio Farda's collaboration with VOA for the launch of its first TV program, *Breakfast with News*, which is simulcast on VOA's Persian News Network satellite channel. He played a short video clip of the show. Mr. Korn also announced a resolution passed recently by the RFE/RL Board of Directors honoring RFE/RL Azerbaijani Service Correspondent Khadija Ismayilova, an investigative reporter and host for the Service, Radio Azadliq. Joining by a video link via Skype, Ms. Ismayilova gave brief remarks, including

## Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting

commending the Board for its support for the journalists and emphasizing the important role RFE/RL plays in Azerbaijan.

Joining the meeting by video conference, OCB Director Carlos Garcia-Perez gave his report. Mr. Garcia-Perez noted that a number of arrests of journalists and dissidents by the Cuban authorities. He played a short video highlighting recent reports filed by Radio and TV Marti.

VOA Director Ensor described two new VOA television programs featured in *VOA Music Alley* that showcase American music and build on VOA's music legacy that helped popularize jazz around the world. *VOA Music Alley* offers jazz, blues, and swing music through a program called *Beyond Category with Eric Felten*, and brings intimate performances with musicians from every genre, including rock n' roll, rhythm-and-blues, gospel and bluegrass through a program called *Hamilton Live*. The Board then viewed a brief promotional video of *VOA Music Alley*.

At about 2:30 p.m., Presiding Governor Lynton departed and Alternate Presiding Governor Mulhaupt chaired the rest of the meeting.

RFA President Liu stated that RFA's substantive issues and activities in the past month are highlighted in her written monthly report to the Board. Ms. Liu mentioned a video of 2012 end-of-year summary of major events had been produced by RFA and narrated by Burmese opposition leader Aung San Suu Kyi. She noted that RFA had issued a statement supporting Mam Sanando, Director of Beehive Radio in Cambodia who recently was denied second bail request by Cambodia's Court of Appeals, and asking for his immediate release. Ms. Liu played the video of RFA's 2012 end-of-year summary of major events.

Middle East Broadcasting Networks (MBN) President Brian Conniff echoed the Presiding Governor's open remarks regarding the continuing lack of information about Alhurra correspondent Bashar Fahmi, and that MBN continues to follow all leads and has made its priority for Mr. Fahmi's safe return. Mr. Conniff highlighted MBN's efforts to break news in the Middle East, including the Israeli clashes, the continuing demonstrations in Egypt, and the deteriorating situation in Syria. On cooperative efforts with other U.S. international broadcasters, Mr. Conniff noted that colocation opportunities with VOA in London and New York were in near completion, establishment of a work space at MBN's production center in Dubai was completed for a VOA correspondent, and preparation with VOA was underway for the Presidential inauguration. In addition, MBN's Dubai Production Center has regularly offered support to the U.S. Department of State on a few types of productions including *Ask Alan*, a 10-minute Farsi-language Q & A video segment with Alan Eyre, and provided training and production services for the U.S. Department of State to train Arabic and Farsi language Public Affairs Officers on how to communicate and interview with Arab and Farsi media. In conclusion, Mr. Conniff highlighted progress and activities in digital operations, including a single traffic record on alhurra.com.

IBB Director Dick Lobo announced, among other personnel matters, the first-ever "Spotlight on Excellence" Awards ceremony on November 28, where six language services from VOA or OCB were recognized for their great work based on the criteria used in the annual program

## Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting

review process by the Office of Performance Review.

Phillip T. Balazs, IBB Deputy Director for Engineering and Transmission Services of the Office of Technology, Services and Innovation (TSI), provided brief highlights including the completion of installation of another transmitter in Afghanistan, continuing efforts to convert fiber and other communications circuits throughout the BBG global delivery network to more economical and versatile MPLS (Multi-Protocol Label Switching) connections, and the production of reports by TSI of its 2012 annual performance and FY 2012 accomplishments by each of its Directorate, Division and Branch.

Jeffrey Trimble, IBB Deputy Director, presented a brief report on FY 2013, FY 2014, and sequestration. For FY 2013, the Agency continues to operate on a Continuing Resolution that should go through the end of March. For FY 2014, OMB passback to the Agency was expected on or about January 2, 2013. Working with the broadcast entities, the Office of Chief Financial Officer continues to plan for budget reductions as they relate to sequestration.

Lynne Weil, Director of Communications and External Affairs, briefly summarized the following activities and events: Regular updates and briefings to the Congress on the arrest and eventual release of Antonio Rodiles, the Cuba-based independent producer of TV Martí's "Estado de SATS;" continuing efforts to publicize two Alhurra journalists who went missing in Syria and the eventual release of one journalist; coordination with IBB offices and all broadcast entities on the annual release of the Performance Accountability Report; production of sets, backdrops and Election 2012 on-air logos; and production of VOA 2013 Calendar.

Bruce Sherman, Director of Strategy and Development, distributed packets of trip reports produced by the Office of Strategy and Development. He highlighted some of the Office's accomplishments, including an agreement with Skynet for VOA to broadcast via direct-to-home satellite in Burma, new affiliations to grow the audience, and new development agreements with U.S. Agency for International Development and U.S. Department of State on health and other programming. Governors McCue and Ashe expressed their interests in receiving trip reports on a regular basis. At the request of Mr. Lobo, Mr. Sherman summarized a recent meeting in Berlin with the DG-5, comprising of western international broadcasters, to discuss cooperation and advancing common interests. He briefly explained about a recent gathering in Dubai for countries to discuss Internet policy and international communications policy.

Governor Ashe noted his prior visit with Mr. Ensor to the VOA Korean Service to recognize its 70th anniversary.

The Board accepted a request from Ann Noonan, Executive Director of Committee for U.S. International Broadcasting to speak for three minutes. The Board acknowledged that it was a one-time event but would discuss a policy on public speaking at Board meetings at a future Governance Committee meeting. Ms. Noonan spoke about the termination of employees from RFE/RL Russian and Kazakhtan Services. To that end, the Board suggested that Ms. Weil make a recommendation to the Governance Committee regarding a policy on public speaking at Board meetings.

## Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting

There being no other business, the Alternate Presiding Governor adjourned the meeting.

The Broadcasting Board of Governors agreed to the following decision elements (all decisions were adopted by a unanimous vote unless otherwise indicated):

1. Adoption of Minutes of October 11, 2012 Meeting. Governor Mulhaupt made a motion for the adoption of the minutes. Governor McCue seconded. The Board adopted the minutes of the October 11, 2012 meeting of the plenary Board as set forth in Attachment 2.
2. Adoption of Governance Committee Recommendations. The Board heard a briefing from Governor Mulhaupt on the recent meetings of the Governance Committee. The Board adopted the following recommendations by the Governance Committee:
  - a. BBG Travel Guidelines  
Governor McCue made a motion for the adoption of the preliminary statement of guidelines for Governors and IBB/BBG senior management and staff as set forth in Attachment 3. Governor Ashe seconded. The motion passed unanimously.
  - b. Committee Reports  
Governor Mulhaupt made a motion for the adoption of the reports of the Governance Committee meetings on March 7, March 9, and September 13, 2012 as set forth in Attachments 4, 5 and 6, respectively. Governor Ashe seconded. The motion passed unanimously.
  - c. Discussion of Creation, Role and Method of Appointment of CEO
    - i. That the Board note that the BBG Strategic Plan (adopted by the Board in October 2011) calls for the creation of the position of Chief Executive Officer (CEO) of United States international broadcasting (USIB). In its January 2012 decision, the Board decided to pursue legislation to restructure USIB called the International Broadcasting Innovation Act (IBIA), a central feature of which is the creation of a CEO of USIB.
    - ii. That the Board note its September 2012 decision to create a CEO under existing legislation on an interim basis pending passage of the IBIA.
    - iii. That the Board note that the IBB Director presented to the Committee a plan to create a CEO as required by the Board's September 2012 decision. The proposed plan addresses the following issues:
      - a. The authorities that should be delegated from the Board to the CEO;
      - b. The agency officers who should report directly to the CEO;
      - c. The relationship of the CEO and the IBB Director;

## Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting

- d. The relationship between the CEO and the Grantees, including how the relationship should be formalized and expressed in the grant agreements;
  - e. The limits that should be placed on the CEO's authority to protect the integrity and independence of journalism conducted by the BBG-sponsored broadcasters;
  - f. A proposed budget and timeline for implementation of a CEO.
- iv. That the IBB Director direct the BBG Office of General Counsel to work with the General Counsels of the BBG-sponsored grantees to develop appropriate amendments to the grant agreements to effect the intent of the Board's September 2012 decision to empower the CEO to act as the day-to-day executive of BBG-sponsored U.S. international broadcasting, including both its federal and non-federal components, to the fullest extent permitted under existing law. Governor Mulhaupt made a motion for the adoption of this particular recommendation by the Committee. Governor McCue seconded. The motion passed unanimously.
  - v. That the Board reaffirm its commitment to create a CEO under existing legislation. To this end, the Board authorizes and directs the Governance Committee to conduct a review of the IBB Director's plan and to make further recommendations regarding the details of the plan to the plenary Board. Governor Mulhaupt made a motion for the adoption of this particular recommendation by the Committee. Governor McCue seconded. The motion passed unanimously.
- d. Proposed BBG Meeting Dates in 2013  
Governor Mulhaupt made a motion to rescind the Board's previously adopted 2013 calendar and substitute the proposed BBG meeting dates in 2013 as set forth in Attachment 7. Governor McCue seconded. The motion passed unanimously.
3. Resolution Honoring Dana Perino. Governor Meehan moved to adopt the resolution thanking and honoring Dana Perino as set forth in Attachment 8. Governor McCue seconded. The resolution was adopted unanimously by the Board.
  4. Resolution Honoring Maryjean Buhler. Governor Ashe moved to adopt the resolution thanking and honoring Maryjean Buhler, former Chief Financial Officer, as set forth in Attachment 9. Governor McCue seconded. The resolution was adopted unanimously by the Board.
  5. Resolution Honoring John Lennon. Governor McCue moved to adopt the resolution thanking and honoring John Lennon, VOA Associate Director of Strategy and Planning, as set forth in Attachment 10. Governor Ashe seconded. The resolution was adopted unanimously by the Board.

## Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting

### Other Attendees:

The following persons were also present during all or part of the meeting: International Broadcasting Bureau (IBB) Director Richard Lobo, IBB Deputy Director Jeffrey Trimble, IBB Chief of Staff Marie Lennon, Deputy General Counsel and Board Secretary Paul Kollmer-Dorsey, Director of Communications & External Affairs Lynne Weil, Director of Board Operations Oanh Tran, Congressional Coordinator Suzie Carroll, Director of Public Affairs Letitia King, IBB Director of Strategy and Development Bruce Sherman, IBB Research Manager Leah Ermarth, IBB Director of Performance Review Kelu Chao, and Ashley Lancaster on detail; Phillip T. Balazs, IBB Deputy Director for Engineering and Transmission Services of the Office of Technology, Services and Innovation; David Ensor, Director of the Voice of America (VOA); Carlos Garcia-Perez, Director of the Office of Cuba Broadcasting (OCB) via video conference; Steven Korn, President of Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty (RFE/RL); Libby Liu, President of Radio Free Asia (RFA); Brian Conniff, President of the Middle East Broadcasting Networks (MBN); Barbara Brady, VOA Chief of Staff; John Lennon, VOA Senior Advisor for Strategy; Steve Redisch, VOA Executive Editor; Rebecca McMEnamin, VOA Acting Associate Director for Language Programming; William Marsh, VOA Senior Project Officer; John Giambalvo, RFE/RL Vice President and Chief Financial Officer; Benjamin Herman, RFE/RL Assistant Secretary; Julia Ragona, RFE/RL Vice President and Director of Content, Distribution and Marketing; Dale Cohen, RFE/RL Vice President of Administration; Brian Cullin, Senior Advisor on Intergovernmental Affairs to the Under Secretary for Public Diplomacy & Public Affairs; and Robert Torres, the Office of Inspector General's (OIG) Deputy Team Leader for the inspection of BBG.

### Witnessed:

---

Paul Kollmer-Dorsey  
Secretary

### Attachments:

1. Agenda for December 14, 2012 Meeting
2. Minutes of October 11, 2012 Meeting
3. BBG Travel Guidelines
4. Governance Committee Report from March 7, 2012 Meeting
5. Governance Committee Report from March 9, 2012 Meeting
6. Governance Committee Report from September 13, 2012 Meeting
7. Proposed BBG Meeting Dates in 2013
8. Resolution Honoring Dana Perino
9. Resolution Honoring Maryjean Buhler
10. Resolution Honoring John Lennon

## Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting

ATTACHMENT 12

1

Comments from:

Paul Westpheling  
General Vice-President  
AFGE Local812  
August 21, 2013

A note of congratulations to the newly confirmed members of the Broadcasting Board of Governors and, as the Irish proverb has said, "May the wind be at your back" as you seek to bring order to chaos in what was, last year, described as a very dysfunctional Board of Governors.

Having said that we all know that gaining control of VOA and the surrogate broadcasters is going to be a Herculean task. Restoring the confidence and trust of the American taxpayer and Congress, which controls the purse, will be an ever bigger challenge.

And that's where the American Federation of Government Employees Local1812 comes in.

We represent nearly 900 employees at VOA headquarters and various domestic news bureaus, the Greenville, North Carolina transmission facility and the Office of Cuba Broadcasting in Miami. Bargaining unit employees range from the people on-air, to the engineers who make sure the broadcasts are heard and seen, writers, producers, web editors, tape handlers and clerks. Quite a mix!

In other words, we represent the boots on the ground ... the content producers.

## Minutes of August 21, 2013 Meeting

2

As you preside over the future of this storied Agency and make the difficult decisions about how to proceed, AFGE Local1812 extends its hand and asks to have our views seriously considered. We are open to meet with this Board to discuss how we can help.

Just as you are the decision makers for policy and for management, we are the representatives of the workers in the trenches on whose shoulders the future of VOA rests.

These are tough times and you will have to make some tough decisions.

We will work with you and we want to work with you to keep VOA in the forefront of International Broadcasting. What we ask in return is that you treat the people we represent with fairness, dignity and respect.

Labor/Management relationships are problematic in the private sector and in the public sector VOA is no exception.

What we do is enshrined in what's called the Code of Federal Regulation and Labor Management Statute so, like it or not, we are in this together.

I will close by again congratulating you on your confirmations to a position like no other in the entire government ...and with another slightly edited proverb: We hope dealing with our Union is not about avoiding the storm ... it is about learning to dance in the rain.